“I have to want to do it”

Linda Brennan Wayne Binney
The complexities of compliance

- The study
  - The encouragement of ‘voluntarily’ compliant behaviour
  - Tax, social welfare cheating, fare evasion
  - Fear, Guilt and Shame
Compliance

- Regulation
- Motivation
- A concern for others
- Most people are assumed to be unwilling
- Concepts of ‘voluntary’
- Socially desirable behaviour must be linked to something of value to the individual
  - Negative and positive value
Emotional appeals in social marketing

- Framing
- Affect and emotions
- Emotions and emotional feelings
- Affective responses
- Affect > attitudes > behaviours
Fear, guilt and shame

- Fear is widely used
  - Social and physical
  - Intensity
  - Reactions
    - Escape, avoidance, discomfort, settling dissonance, coping
Guilt is widely used

- Differences in outcome

- Self persuasive vs other persuasive (fear is a response to threat from an external source)
Shame

- More likely to elicit a negative response than guilt
- Shame is other focussed and self persuasive (as long as I care about the other?)

http://www.emotionalcompetency.com/images/shame.jpg
The approach

- Income support recipients
- 120 Qualitative interviews
  - See paper for profile
- 6 researchers interviewing and analysing (dialectical and argumentative), 1 more interviewing and adding value but not formally analysing)
Our perspective on results

- Fear appeals are overused
- Fear is not used to describe their own response
- Fear is evoked when
  - Personal relevance
  - Realistic ‘imagery’
  - Children and family
Results...

- Guilt
  - I should do something to fix this problem
  - Personal, local, socially unacceptable
  - But...
    - Social is relative
  - Guilt is a personal choice
Results...

- Shame
  - Shame is personal and interpersonal
    - Moral and social consequences
    - Shame is publicly displayed guilt
    - Shame is a choice but is more ‘other’ directed
  - Shaming is shameful and easily overdone
Conclusions

- There are differences in results between the various types of negative appeals.
- Saturation of negativity may lead to coping behaviours, not compliance.
- Emotional responses are not as framed by the advertiser.
- Compliance is not ‘voluntary’.
Questions are guaranteed in life; Answers aren't.