The changing trajectory of tobacco smoking prevalence in Australia

Dr Julian de Meyrick, Macquarie University NSW Australia

Contact: julian.demeyrick@mq.edu.au
Tel: 61 2 9850 7464

Abstract

Tobacco smoking has been identified as the largest single cause of avoidable morbidity and mortality in most countries. Lopez et al. showed that smoking prevalence and the damage that it causes to the community followed a consistent trajectory in the past, increasing steadily from a low base, leveling off and then declining to the point where smoking prevalence and the damage are eradicated.

This paper examines data from four Australian National Health Surveys and shows that decline in tobacco smoking prevalence experienced in Australia since the Second World War may not have continued as might have been inferred from the Lopez et al. Smoking prevalence may have stabilised at approximately 20 per cent of the adult population despite active anti-smoking campaigns. The data also suggest that changes in smoking status have not been consistent across all segments of the population despite all segments being exposed to the same fear-based campaign strategy. The data also suggests that while this health-scare approach may have coincided with improvements in the proportions of some groups of smokers who successfully quit the habit, there has been an increase in the proportion of young females who have, at some stage, commenced to smoke. If smoking prevalence is to be eradicated in Australia or other similar markets, campaigns must address cessation and prevention.

Introduction

The damage caused by tobacco smoking worldwide has been widely discussed in the literature for more than 50 years. Doll and Hill established the link between tobacco smoking and cancer in 1950 (Doll and Hill, 1950). The United States Surgeon General declared tobacco smoking the single most important cause of preventable morbidity and mortality in his country, first in 1957 and regularly since then. (USDHHS, 1957, 1989; 2000) Both the Doll and the U.S. Surgeon General's findings have been regularly updated and confirmed in other countries ever since. Calculations of the cost of smoking to the community are approached from a number of different perspectives. Epidemiologists concluded that cigarettes bring on early death in as many as 50 per cent of their lifelong users (Lopez, et al. 1994; Peto, Lopez, et al. 1994). Peto, Darby et al. (2000) calculated that a global toll of 10 million deaths in the decades 1950 to 2000 could be directly attributable to tobacco smoking. In Australia, it has been estimated that nearly 20,000 people die each year from smoking-related diseases (English et al., 1995).

Economists have attempted to estimate the losses in productive capacity and other social costs to the community resulting from tobacco smoking. These losses are of the order of millions of quality-adjusted-life-years and many millions of dollars (Chaloupka and Warner, 1999; Collins and Lapsley, 1996, 1999a, 1999b, 2001; Single, et al., 1998). An analysis of smokers' self-reports of expenditure on tobacco products in 1998-1999 indicates that approximately AU$4 million of household expenditure on goods and services has been diverted into these harmful products. It has been suggested that this might be an underestimate by as much as 40 percent (de Meyrick and Yusuf 2006). Regardless of the approach taken, there seems to be general agreement that the cost is enormous.

Lopez, et al. (1994) showed that tobacco smoking prevalence is a reliable predictor of tobacco-related illness and mortality. They used data from a large number of countries to show that smoking prevalence follows a four stage trajectory, with a corresponding, parallel trajectory for tobacco-related deaths, lagged by approximately 30 years. The trajectory resembles a typical product life cycle with an introductory, growth, maturity and decline stage (Levitt 1965). Australia, along with the United Kingdom, United States, Western Europe and Canada, is shown to be well advanced in the fourth or decline stage. Corrao, et al.(2000) suggest that any country can use this model to identify their position on the trajectory and then implement the...
strategies used by the stage four countries to reduce the time-scale and the amplitude of their trajectory. The end-point of the trajectory is the complete cessation of smoking in the population and hence elimination of the damage caused by smoking.

This steady decline in smoking prevalence might be taken to indicate the sustained effectiveness of current anti-smoking initiatives in the Australian market. These initiatives are largely fear-inducing appeals, highlighting the damage that tobacco smoking does to a person’s health. The strategy aims to communicate the cost to the community mentioned above, in a way that is relevant and persuasive to the population at large but which does not target any particular segment. An example of a magazine advertisement is attached (Appendix 1). It features a still and a selection of copy from a current television commercial and is reproduced in graphic colour on billboards, posters and both the front and the back of cigarette packets. Note the graphic nature of the visual and the strong fear appeal in the copy.

The National Health Survey

The principal data source used in this analysis is the Australian National Health Survey (NHS) (ABS Catalogue number 4363.0). Data from the last four surveys (1989/90, 1995, 2000/01 and 2004/5) were used in this analysis. Throughout the analysis, they are identified as the 1990, 1995, 2000 and 2005 surveys. The National Health Survey, as the name suggests, is a survey conducted by the Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) approximately every five years and covers an increasing range of health-related issues across the Australian resident population. The number of topics covered has increased with each survey but always includes the current state of the respondent’s health, their use of medical services and products, and aspects of their lifestyle which may have a bearing on their health – including exercise, consumption of alcohol and since the 1990 survey, consumption of tobacco products.

For each survey, a large sample of domestic residences is chosen using a stratified multi-stage random sampling methodology. Commercial and institutional residences are not included, so residents living in accommodation such as hotels, hospitals and prisons are excluded. All Australian states and territories are included but coverage of sparsely populated, remote regions is not comprehensive. Given the concentration of the Australian population in and around metropolitan areas, this is not a great limitation on the data. In the 1990 and 1995 surveys, the ABS interviewers personally interviewed all the usual residents of the selected households who were aged 18 years or more. In later surveys, a representative person was chosen and personally interviewed by a trained ABS interviewer. Australian residents are included in the survey but not temporary residents such as diplomatic or military staff posted to Australia whose normal residence is outside Australia.

While the sample size has changed between surveys, it is always large. As Table 1 shows, the smallest sample size is nearly 26,000 people and the largest is over 54,000.

The size of these samples ensures that sample sizes within cells when the data is segregated into various different groups are always more than adequate for the analysis being conducted.

Table 1. Nation Health Survey sample sizes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey year</th>
<th>Number of households</th>
<th>Number of records</th>
<th>Records 18 y.o. and over</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>54,241</td>
<td>38,974</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>23,800</td>
<td>53,828</td>
<td>39,110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>17,918</td>
<td>26,862</td>
<td>17,918</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>19,501</td>
<td>25,906</td>
<td>19,501</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Smoking prevalence

The most common measure of smoking prevalence is the percentage of the population that reports that they are currently smoking cigarettes. Table 2 shows the number and percentage of respondents aged 18 or older in the four most recent NHS who reported that they are current or regular smokers in each of the four surveys. This data is shown graphically in figure 1.

Table 2 Overall smoking prevalence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey year</th>
<th>Number of current smokers</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>11,025</td>
<td>28.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>9,381</td>
<td>23.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>4,463</td>
<td>24.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2005        | 4,585                     | 23.5    | continued...
Figure 1: Trends in smoking prevalence

Since the 1995 survey the prevalence has remained at approximately 24 per cent. This represents a marked slowing in the rate of decline in smoking prevalence in Australia. Smoking prevalence in Australia has been in steady decline since soon after the end of the Second World War. The steady decline predates the current antismoking campaigns as it began well before these campaigns were developed. The Lopez et al. model shows Australia in the last or Stage IV of the smoking prevalence trajectory, with levels steadily declining towards zero.

The graph in Figure 1 shows that this steady decline may not be continuing. Smoking prevalence’s trajectory might have reached the sort of plateau suggested by the latter stages in one of the ‘hypothetical’ product life cycles suggested by Levitt, rather than that suggested by Lopez et al.

An overall measure of smoking prevalence in the population is important indicator of the success or otherwise of antismoking campaigns. The objective is to reduce the amount of damage done to the community by tobacco smoking. The relationship between smoking prevalence and the damage suffered by the community was identified by Doll and other researchers and modelled by Lopez and others. They showed that the level of smoking prevalence and its trajectory are reliable predictors of smoking-related mortality and morbidity 20 to 30 years into the future. However, simple extrapolation of past prevalence levels will not provide as reliable a forecast of smoking prevalence’s trajectory and therefore, of the damage to the community, as one based on an understanding of the factors determining smoking prevalence at any time.

Smoking prevalence in a period is determined by prevalence in the previous period plus smoking initiation in that period minus smoking cessation in the period. The next step in this analysis focuses on three smoking status categories, current smokers, ex-smokers and never smoked. Table 3 shows the percentages of respondents in each of these categories for each of the four surveys.

Table 3 Percent of respondents in each smoking status category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey year</th>
<th>Current smoker per cent</th>
<th>Ex-smoker per cent</th>
<th>Never smoked per cent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>48.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>48.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>24.9</td>
<td>27.2</td>
<td>47.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>44.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2 shows the data from Table 3 expressed as the odds of belonging to one of the three smoking status groups. Although the sample sizes are large and the resultant 95 per cent confidence intervals associated with these odds are small, the intervals are shown so that the significance of any differences or changes is readily apparent. It can be seen from in Figure 2 that the graph representing the change in the odds of being a current smoker (shown by the black line) reflects the graph shown in Figure 1. Additional information in Figure 2 consists of the graphs showing the change in the odds of being an ex-smoker (shown by the pink line) and the odds of being a never-smoker (the blue line).

It can be seen that the odds of being an ex-smoker and the odds of being a current smoker moved in opposite directions and to a certain extent, counteract each other in the earlier surveys.

Figure 2 continued...
When changes in the odds of being either a current smoker or an ex-smoker balance each other, the third component, the odds of being a never smoker, remain unchanged. Figure 2 indicates that this is the pattern for the first three surveys. However, in the period between the 2000 and the 2005 surveys, the odds of being a current smoker did not change significantly. There was a significant increase in the odds of being an ex-smoker in this period. In other words, there was a greater likelihood that a respondent was an ex-smoker, that is, they had successfully quit smoking. If the level of smoking prevalence was only determined by the rate at which smokers were giving up, then the changes in the two odds would be expected to be of similar size and in opposite directions, as shown in the earlier surveys. When the changes are out of balance, the difference is expressed in the changes in the odds of never having smoked. As mentioned above, the odds of never having smoked remained unchanged in the first three surveys, the changes in current and ex-smokers matched each other, but in the last survey, the odds of being a never-smoker lengthened significantly. It is now less likely that a respondent has never smoked. Taking these two findings together, it is more likely in the 2005 survey that a person has taken up smoking and then has successfully given it up.

The effect of gender

These changes in the odds of having a particular smoking status have not been uniform across different groups in the community. For example, figures 3 and 4 show the trends in the odds of belonging to one of the smoking status groups separately for males and females.

Changes in the odds of belonging to one of the three smoking status groups in Figures 3 and 4 are approximately parallel with those observed in the overall sample (Figure 2) but are more pronounced. The odds of a male being a current smoker tend to be larger than those of the sample as a whole throughout the period covered by these surveys but change in the same directions as the whole sample. The lack of significant change in the odds of being a current smoker in the last three surveys is more pronounced among males as there is no significant change in this period at all.

Figure 3: Trends in smoking status among males

The odds of being an ex-smoker increased significantly between the 1990 and 1995 surveys and then very markedly between the 2000 and 2005 surveys. Again, as with the sample as a whole there was no significant...
change in odds between the 1995 and 2000 surveys. By the 2005 survey, the odds of a male being an ex-smoker were significantly higher than they had been in any of the previous surveys and were significantly higher than those of a male being a current smoker. The change in the odds of a male being an ex-smoker was more marked than the change in the sample as a whole. As in the sample as a whole, there was no significant change in the odds of being an ex-smoker among males between the 1995 and 2000 surveys. The big discrepancy between changes in the odds of being a current or an ex-smoker is reflected in the very large change in the odds of a male being a never smoker in the 2005 survey. The odds of being a never-smoker among male respondents had been steadily, but not significantly, increasing in the three earlier surveys, then they dramatically lengthened to the point where they are virtually the same as those of a male being an ex-smoker. By the 2005 survey, a male is just as likely to be an ex-smoker or a never-smoker and least likely to be a current smoker. The likelihood that they have never smoked has decreased significantly over the period covered by these surveys. The balance between the increased likelihood of successfully quitting smoking and the decreased likelihood of not taking it up has left the likelihood of being a current smoker virtually unchanged.

**Figure 4: Trends in smoking status among females**

In each survey, the odds of a female being a current smoker are smaller than the odds of a male being a smoker. Once again, the directions of the changes in odds among females are similar to those among males and similar to the patterns in the sample as a whole. In both groups, there is an initial improvement in that the odds of being a current smoker decreased, followed by no significant overall changes. In females, the initial decrease in the likelihood of being a current smoker was followed by a noticeable, but not significant, increase and a noticeable decrease in the likelihood that left the odds of a female being a current smoker in the 2005 survey almost exactly where they were in the 1995 survey.

Among females, the odds of being an ex-smoker improved significantly between the first and last surveys with no significant change between the 1995 and 2000 surveys. Throughout the period covered by these surveys, there has been a steady decrease in the likelihood that a female respondent has never been a smoker. Although the change between any two consecutive surveys has not been significant, all the changes have been in the same direction and there is a significant difference between the likelihood that a female will have never smoked in the 1990 survey and the 2005 survey. Unlike the changes in the likelihood of males or the sample overall which reverse their direction between the last two surveys, the likelihood of never smoking among females steadily decreases throughout the period. In other words, it was becoming less and less likely that a female is a never-smoker. By the 2005 survey, a female is less likely to be a current smoker or to have never smoked and much more likely to have taken it up and then successfully quit.

**Discussion**

The data indicates that rather than continuing a steady decline to the point of eradication, smoking prevalence may have levelled off in Australia at a little over 20 per cent of the adult population. This may indicate that the projections implied by the Lopez et al model and the other projections mentioned above may not eventuate and that the avoidable damage that tobacco smoking causes the community would not be eradicated. This might be due to a wearing out in the effectiveness of the current fear appeal strategy. Analysis of changes in the component parts of prevalence – initiation, current smoking and cessation – suggests that the strategy is achieving a different level of effectiveness in different segments in the population, as suggested by literature on market segmentation and Andreasen’s explanation of the need to carefully segment the market and tailor campaigns to reflect the different needs of the different segments (Andreasen 2006). The data suggests that, in general, the current fear appeal strategy coincides with the proportion of current smokers who successfully quit but has not been associated a reduction in the proportion of people who are taking it up. The data also suggests that the campaigns are having a different effect on
males compared with females. As long as smokers who quit the habit are replaced by new smokers taking up the habit, smoking prevalence will never be eradicated. If young people take up the habit in greater numbers than smokers who quit, smoking prevalence will not just remain stable, it could increase, with the consequent increase in the cost to the community in terms of reduced quality of life and unnecessary morbidity and mortality. Rather than following the simple, four-stage product life cycle, smoking prevalence could develop a cyclical pattern of growth, maturity and decline followed by a repeat of the cycle with renewed growth, maturity and decline.

Conclusion
The data indicate that there is an urgent need to review the market segmentation and targeting strategies underpinning anti-smoking campaigns in Australia to identify the different needs and behaviours of different segments in the Australian population. Properly tailored campaigns can then be directed at these segments.

The data also suggest that there is an urgent need to examine the appropriateness of relying only on fear appeals when developing these new, more precisely targeted campaigns.

Appendix 1. A typical anti-smoking magazine advertisement.

References
Social Marketing in the Fight against Increasing Smoking Rates: Perspectives in Developing Countries

Anahit Armenakyan, Carleton University, Canada
Judith Madill, University of Ottawa, Canada
Louise A. Heslop, Carleton University, Canada

The authors review current research on smoking in developing countries, identify the motives driving smoking behaviour, and examine the potential for social marketing in the fight against smoking in the developing world. This exploratory research warns against generalised and standardised application of the principles of social marketing in the developing world. The research suggests that a research-based customised approach is necessary to address the issues of increasing rates of smoking behaviour in developing countries.

In January 2000, World Health Organisation (WHO) called for the intensification of efforts against tobacco use (Kumar 2000, p. 210) as tobacco smoking increasingly becomes a major concern in countries worldwide. According to the WHO Report on the Tobacco Epidemic (2008), nearly 5.4 million people die annually from tobacco-related illnesses (e.g., lung cancer, heart disease, emphysema, coronary-artery, etc.), and this number is predicted to increase by almost 3 million by 2030 with 80 per cent of deaths occurring in developing countries.

Aside from the heavy psychological burden from lost lives, tobacco smoking is also associated with a multi-billion disease treatment burden on society. The acknowledgement of dangerous effects of smoking has invited the attention of authorities in the public health sector and resulted in development of anti-smoking strategies accompanied by legal regulations in many countries. While anti-smoking efforts have lead to a decline in the percentage of the smoking population, the absolute number of smokers continues to grow. One explanation behind this growth could be the strategic moves undertaken by large tobacco companies. In an attempt to overcome the increasing number of restrictions employed in developing countries, tobacco companies are developing strategies to enter the developing world more rapidly (Acevedo-Garcia, Barbeau, Bishop, Pan, and Emmons 2004; Evans, Ulasevich, and Renaud 2006). To stop the spread of smoking behaviour, WHO together with other international health organisations have undertaken a number of programmes in its member countries in the development of anti-smoking campaigns. Public education, technological solutions, and economic incentives are amongst the tactics implemented in the fight against smoking. While all these strategies are important and successful to some extent, according to many researchers, the anti-smoking movement may also benefit from the implementation of the concepts and strategies of social marketing. Proper implementation of the concepts of the social marketing, which inherently is focused on changes in behaviour, is believed to add to the effectiveness and efficiency of anti-smoking programmes and campaigns.

This paper examines the current research on smoking in developing countries and assesses the potential of social marketing in the fight against smoking in the developing world. To address the above questions, the paper is organised in the following way. The first section will discuss the issues of smoking overall and in developing countries in particular. It then examines the underlying smoking theories and the WHO Tobacco Epidemic Model describing the spread of smoking consumption to the developing world. The second part of the paper presents the social marketing approach as well as an assessment of its potential and limitations. The third section of the paper discusses issues concerning the implementations of social marketing strategies in developing countries. The paper concludes with a summary and a consideration of future research in this area.

Smoking: The Oppressive Truth

Of all the environmental factors, the use of tobacco is considered to be the greatest cause of cancer prevalence and mortality in the world and in developing countries, in particular. A number of studies have noted recent increases in smoking rates in developing countries (Astrom and Ogwell 2004; Islam and Johnson 2005). This increase in smoking rates is attributed to marketing strategies undertaken by tobacco companies in reaction to the legal restrictions and public resistance facing them in developed countries. In reacting to challenging market conditions in developed countries, tobacco companies target low-income communities (MacAskill, Stead, Mackintosh, and Hastings 2002), immigrant populations (Acevedo-Garcia et al., 2004), and young age segments, particularly, young females (Mandel, Bialous, and Glantz 2006) in developed countries. At the same time, they develop aggressive strategies to enter developing countries, where the legal restrictions as well as public resistance for smoking are either low or non-existent.

The strategy of moving into developing countries can be analysed utilising the Tobacco Epidemic Model (TEM) (Lopez, Collishaw, and Piha 1994). According to this model, expansion into new markets follows four stages whereby each stage is characterised by differing degrees of smoking behaviour overall as well as vastly differing amounts of anti-tobacco legal and regulatory infrastructure. Each stage of the expansion is viewed as lasting approximately 20-30 years. The first stage is characterised by low smoking prevalence among men (i.e., less than 20 per cent of the male population) and even lower smoking rates among women (i.e., less than 10 per cent of the female population). The model assumes that at this stage socio-cultural...
factors discourage smoking behaviour, especially among females, as well the awareness of the risks of tobacco consumptions are low as deaths and diseases stemming from smoking are not evident, and, hence, tobacco control activities undeveloped or, at best, are very rudimentary. A good example of the country at this stage could be Saudi Arabia, characterised by 19 per cent of smoking rates among its male population and about 8 per cent among the female population (WDI 2005). However, according to Felimban and Jarallah (1994), who studied the attitudes towards smoking among 1312 Saudi Arabian students, more than half of the smokers were aware of and concerned about hazardous effect of smoking and yet continued to smoke on regular basis.

Countries in the second stage of the TEM are characterised by about 50 per cent smoking rate among the male population and a rapidly increasing interest in smoking among females. According to Lopez et al. (1994), this phase is mainly characterised by under-developed tobacco control activities, unsystematic and sporadic education and information about the hazards of tobacco smoking, and lack of political and public support. This situation leads to increasing rates in tobacco-related diseases. The list of countries comprises Japan with 47 per cent of male-smokers vs. 12 per cent of female-smokers, and countries of Latin America (e.g., Argentina - 42 per cent vs. 23 per cent) and Asia (e.g., Viet Nam - 51 per cent vs. 4 per cent), etc. (WDI 2005).

The third stage is characterised by high levels of tobacco consumption and only a narrow gap in cigarette consumption between men and women. Due to high rates of smoking, health issues, particularly high rates of mortality from lung cancer, emphysema, and heart disease become more salient in stage III countries. Examples of the countries at this stage would be Kenya with its 67 per cent male-smokers vs. 32 per cent female-smokers, Yemen (77 per cent vs. 29 per cent), Uruguay (62 per cent vs. 39 per cent) (WDI 2005). Higher incidences of health consequences lead to increased awareness of the harmful effects of smoking. As countries in this stage become aware of the higher mortality rates associated with smoking, they move to develop and implement tobacco control activities (i.e., tax imposition, health warnings, etc.).

Finally, the fourth stage in the TEM is described by decreasing rates of smoking in both genders. This stage is often characterised by some decrease in tobacco-related diseases among men. However, the numbers of tobacco-related deaths among women continue to increase. Knowledge of the specific health consequences of smoking is known to be very high at this stage. Countries, making up this group (e.g., Canada (24 per cent male-smokers vs. 20 per cent female-smokers, the UK – 28 per cent vs. 26 per cent, etc.), are vigorously implementing anti-smoking campaigns and programmes, exercising tobacco bans and introducing restrictive rules for smoking in public places (WDI 2005, WHO 2008).

This four-stage model provides a framework for examining both the motives and interests of tobacco industry companies in marketing tobacco products in developing countries. The study of students from 23 countries (both, developed and developing) shows that awareness of risks related to smoking varies widely from country to country, and is particularly low in Asian and South American countries. Moreover, the study shows that the risk awareness and behaviour are not related to each other (Steptoe, Wardle, Cui, Baban, Glass, Petrie, and Vinck 2002). This conclusion is also supported by a recent study of community-based smoking by Nisar, Qadri, Kiran, and Perveen (2007). The researchers found that while 47 per cent of the Pakistani respondents were aware of the hazards of the smoking and 22 per cent were aware of the high risk related to passive smoking, only 26.3 per cent tried to quit (and did not succeed) and 13.6 per cent took counseling.

In addition to the above described favorable conditions and higher market potential in developing countries, tobacco companies, faced with strict regulations and tobacco-control and counter-marketing activities in countries in stage IV of the TEM, are attracted by lower levels of anti-tobacco regulation in countries in stages I, II, and even III. Due to poor infrastructure and stressful socioeconomic environments, tobacco companies enjoy auspicious conditions to introduce their products and induce smoking behaviour. Moreover, exposure to western culture through magazines, films, etc. accompanied with favorable attitudes towards products from developed world, including western-brand cigarettes, contributes to the increasing rates of smoking behaviour in the developing world (McCool, Cameron, and Petrie 2005).

A review of the WHO Report on the Tobacco Epidemic (2008) suggests that signs of high levels of cigarette consumption are currently present in the developed world and are rapidly showing up in the developing world. The extant academic research also provides strong indications of a substantial increase in the risk of mortality and disease amongst smokers in developing countries and countries in transition.

To stop the spread of smoking behaviour, WHO, a major agent of anti-smoking campaigns, and related governmental and health organisations, responsible to the development and implementation of anti-smoking policies and programmes, need to take into account the motives behind smoking behaviour characteristic to countries in different stages of TEM.

**Smoking and Motivations behind It**

Evidence from a rich body of research suggests that due to social, economic, and cultural differences, factors contributing to smoking habits vary from country to country (Haddad and Malak 2002; Steptoe et. al 2002; Laxminarayan and Deolalikar 2004; Pan 2004). A wide range of factors contributing to the smoking behaviour in developing countries (e.g., stressful living conditions, economic uncertainty, boredom, etc.) presents challenges to the development and implementation of anti-smoking campaigns.

continued...
In their comprehensive review of more than fifty studies of smoking behaviour and motivations, Lujis, Reuter, and Netter (2005) identified seven distinct types of smoking behaviour. According to their review, the same smoking individual may have different motives during different stages of the smoking career. The comprehensive review indicates that at the beginning of the smoking career psychosocial (e.g., peer pressure, need for conformity, cigarette advertising), sensorimotor (e.g., taste, smell, etc.), and indulgent (e.g., relaxation, interruption at work, etc.) motives are most frequently cited by light- and medium smokers. Meanwhile, stimulation (e.g., means to cope with tiredness or to concentrate), sedation and dependent (e.g., means to overcome shame, fear, etc.), and automatic motives are prevalent among heavy smokers. (For more details refer to Lujis et al. (2005)).

Several theoretical frameworks (e.g., social psychology, personality development, and theories of learning) are employed in an attempt to understand and describe the nature of the smoking behaviour. Social psychology approaches review the effects of parental smoking, peer pressure, desire to be mature and accepted, etc. It is found that usually, the smoking behaviour caused by social approaches is correlated with low socioeconomic status and absence of protective and/or alternative factors (e.g., interest in sports, computer, academic career, etc.). Personality related approaches consider the difference between the personality structure of smokers and non-smokers (e.g., neurotism, anxiety, sociability, sensation seeking, aggression, etc.) It is assumed, that depending on personality traits, a smoker develops a biased perception of personal vulnerability or ability to quit. Finally, learning theory approaches explain smoking behaviour from the perspectives of classical and operant conditioning. Social- and self-reinforcement, presence of cigarettes, positive feeling and rewards, and many other unconditioned stimuli may turn into conditioned ones making smoking an automated activity that occurs unconsciously.

Thus, understanding of the above mentioned factors and theories behind them is crucial in gaining an insight into smoking motivations in both, developed and developing countries. The ‘similia similibus curentur’ (lat., ‘like cures like’) principle can be applied in the fight against tobacco-consumption. Knowing the drivers of the smoking behaviour, will help to identify and counter-play tactics employed by tobacco companies in their advertising and promotional campaigns in the developing world. In other words, the knowledge of motives of smoking will help in finding answer (hence, developing corresponding anti-smoking programmes) to questions like: What are the motivations to try the first cigarette? What are the alternatives that would keep non-smokers from the first trial? What motivations will help to current smokers to quit? etc.

It is strongly believed, it is at this beginning stage of the smoking career social marketing may play a substantial role in development of intervening programmes to help with secession.

**Social Marketing**

First efforts developed in developed countries to counter tobacco consumption can be traced to the early 1970s, when public health studies showed the links between smoking and cancer. Since that time, efforts have been made to inform the public about the dangerous effect of tobacco consumption and to reduce cigarette smoking. Technological solutions (i.e., the introduction of filters), economic incentives and disincentives (i.e., financing of participation in secession programmes), legislation (i.e., smoking bans in public places), and public education (i.e., antismoking awareness campaigns) were heavily and widely employed by public health organisations to encourage a reduction in cigarette consumption (Fox and Kotler 1980). While these approaches and tactics showed some encouraging results in the short-run, their effects in the long-run were offset by heavy advertising and creative strategic moves developed by tobacco companies to circumvent increasing resistance. To reach long-term consistent results there was a need for new tactics and strategies, which resulted in the adaptation of marketing principles for the public health and social behaviour management.

The new approach was labeled ‘social marketing’ and was designed to ‘make explicit use of marketing skills to help translate present social action efforts into … programmes that elicit desired audience response’ (Kotler and Zaltman 1971, p. 5). A later definition of social marketing describes it as the ‘adaptation of commercial marketing technologies to programmes designed to influence the voluntary behaviour of target audiences to improve their personal welfare and that of the society of which they are a part’ (Andreasen 1994, p. 110). These definitions suggest social marketing to possess means and techniques to promote improvements in social well-being. Closely related to the notion of commercial marketing, social marketing adapts the technologies of marketing to develop a strategic planning framework to address the issues of consumer research: objective definition, segmentation, targeting, and development of the marketing mix to reach the bottom line, i.e. behaviour change. However, it differs from commercial marketing in its goal to cause voluntary changes in behaviour. Requesting the desired behavioural change in many cases may generate resistance and may require considerable efforts on the side of the target audience. Overall, for a programme to be considered a social marketing programme, it has to have the following six features (Andreasen 2002):

1. Behaviour change is the benchmark to design and evaluate intervention.
2. Audience research has to be done to assess the needs of the target group, to pre-test the materials, and to monitor the implementation.
3. Principles of segmentation have to be applied.
4. The intervention strategies need to create attractive and motivational exchanges with the target audience.
5. There should be an attempt to use traditional four Ps, and finally
6. Careful monitoring of competition needs to be in place.

continued...
Being a part of the marketing strategies family social marketing is quite often confused with educational programmes that inform and/or persuade the public on such issues as smoking, illicit drug use, alcohol-impaired driving danger, importance of immunisation, etc. (Rothschild 1999). While the educational aspect is important and evident, social marketing, however, should not be limited to it. It needs to provide means that assist target markets make decisions to change their behaviour. According to Rothschild (1999), social marketing may serve as an integrated piece in counter-smoking efforts comprised of educational and coercive legal actions. As such, marketing has the potential to help in creating alternative intervening programmes or in assisting in the reduction of externalities as well as in competing against alternative choices proposed by competitors (Rothschild 1999). However, social marketing may not always an appropriate tool for intervention (Rothschild 1999; Andreasen 2002). According to Andreasen (2002), social marketing should be adopted only in specific situations where it is likely to be effective and appropriate. While the appropriateness of intervention is related to the ethical issues of inducing personal, structural, or community behavioural changes, effectiveness is linked to the relative assessment of the social marketing campaign in relation to educational and regulatory activities. Consequently, a relevant question for this paper becomes, "What is the applicability and appropriateness of social marketing implementation in developing countries?"

### Benchmarking against Developed Countries

To answer this question, one needs to examine the evolution of anti-smoking programmes in the developed world. Affected by the Surgeon General’s Reports in the early 1970’s, many smokers in the U.S. reconsidered their smoking behaviour. These early tobacco cessation decisions were affected by technological innovations (e.g., introduction of filter), economic tactics (e.g., ‘Quit and Win’ contests), political and legal actions (e.g., mandatory warning signs on packages), as well by heavy public educational campaigns. While demonstrating some effectiveness in the short-run, these approaches showed some limitations and gaps: millions of occasional and light smokers quit, while ‘hard-core’ smokers continued to exercise their hazardous habit (Fox and Kotler 1980). To overcome these limitations, social marketing procedures were undertaken (Rothschild 1999). Accused to inform the general public about the risk factors of smoking behaviour and to persuade them to behave voluntarily in a particular manner; coercive actions and regulations were used to force the change through punishment for inappropriate behaviour or limitation of choices; and social marketing campaigns were developed to offer incentives and to introduce new opportunities through voluntary exchange (Rothschild, Mastin, and Miller 2006).

Analysis of this situation in developed countries allows one to argue that the intervening bodies (e.g., public health action groups, public opinion leaders, governmental agencies, etc.) of these countries, positioned in the fourth stage of the TEM, were able to take advantage of all three classes of social control (i.e., education, law, and social marketing) due to progressive legal, political, and social infrastructure, the increasing power of non-governmental organisations, increased tendencies for living healthy life-styles, and rise of public- and self-consciousness. Assessment of conditions prevalent in developing countries (e.g., poor infrastructure, social, economic, and political instability, dependence on income from tobacco industry, etc.) suggests that such a coordinated interventions approach may not be possible in many of them (Macaskill et al. 2002; McDermott et al. 2005; Donovan et al. 2006).

A majority of studies from developing countries confirm the findings reported in the research from developed countries:

1) There is some awareness about the danger of smoking and its relation to such diseases as lung cancer, emphysema, and hearth problems (Steptoe et al. 2002);

2) There are positive attitudes towards anti-smoking regulations and programmes among light-, ex- and non-smokers in developing countries (Astrom and Ogwell 2004; Haddad and Malak 2002; WHO 2008), and finally

3) A majority of the heavy smokers are aware of the dangers of smoking, while their attitude, risk-perception and willingness to quit vary widely (Steptoe et al. 2002; Nisar et al. 2007).

In many countries that could be situated in the first two stages of the WHO’s Epidemic Model, awareness of smoking risk factors and beliefs about its hazardous impacts is low, especially among young people and females. Countries here include Jordan, Kenya, Portugal, Egypt, etc. (Azevedo et al. 1999; Haddad and Malak 2002; Astrom and Ogwell 2004; Steptoe et al. 2002; Islam and Johnson 2005).

Astrom and Ogwell (2004) show that, similar to developed counties, smoking drivers, habits, and attitudes in developing countries can be described in terms of psychosocial, indulgent, stimulation, and dependent smoking, reflecting the desire of social acceptance, the necessity to cope with tough reality, etc. For example, a study of Portuguese students revealed the strong influence of family and peers’ smoking behaviour; as well, they have also demonstrated the importance of academic performance and coffee/alcohol/drug consumption (Azevedo et al. 1999). The positive association of family smoking was also found in a study of Egyptian adolescents’ smoking behaviour, which revealed that smoking is positively associated with positive self-concept and self-perception (Islam and Johnson 2005). Meanwhile, a study of Jordanian students indicated that while smoking started as a source of pleasure, it later on became associated with stress release among male smokers and with the manifestation of independence among female smokers (Haddad and Malak 2002). Interesting results were also revealed from the study of urban Chinese. According to Pan (2004), cigarette
smoking is considered a social connection builder in China. All these drivers and motivations are widely recognised by tobacco companies and are used to develop advertising and promotional campaigns to reinforce positive attitudes and to suppress health-related issues (Griffin and O’Cass, 2004; Donovan et al, 2006; Evans et. al 2006).

The favorable psychosocial conditions present in developing countries are accompanied by weak and low governmental and public resistance. However, while tobacco companies are still exercising opportunities in these new markets, increasing concerns about the economic and social impacts of smoking are moving governments and businesses as well as growing numbers of the population of these countries towards the development and support of tobacco cessation initiatives and regulations. As such, workplace smoking regulations are beginning to be introduced in Taiwan, China, Egypt, etc. (Pan 2004; Hu, Huang, Li, Wen, and Tsai 2005; Islam and Johnson 2005).

**Social Marketing: Applications**

While globalisation may be responsible for present expansion of tobacco consumption to developing countries, the same notion may serve to transfer the knowledge and experience of anti-smoking actions and social marketing skills from developed countries to developing ones. However, it the analysis provided in this paper has demonstrated that developing countries do not comprise a homogenous group. They differ from each other in geo-political, economic, social, and legal structures. They differ from each other on the level of development of communication and technological infrastructures. They differ on the extent of tobacco expansion that has occurred and the profile of an average smoker and on many other factors. Thus, standardised ‘cookie-cut’ application of anti-smoking campaigns effective in developed countries may not work in developing countries. It is important that public health agents interested in the management of and change of smoking behaviour need to develop anti-smoking campaigns tailored to each region or country.

An appropriate framework for the management of public health and social issue behaviour is introduced by Rothschild (1999). The framework is based on three main dimensions: motivation, opportunity, and ability, which are borrowed from the models related to consumer’s information processing. Here, motivation is considered to be a goal-directed arousal; self-interest is considered to be a strong component of motivation. Opportunity is viewed as a situation in which the individual wants and has an ability to act in a desired manner due to presence of available environmental mechanisms. Finally, ability is referred to as the individual’s own skills to solve problems and/or to change his/her current behaviours (see Figure 1).

**Figure 1. Applications of Education, Marketing, and Law**

(from Rothschild 1999)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motivation</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>prone to behave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>unable to behave</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education, Marketing</th>
<th>Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education, Marketing</td>
<td>Law</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This framework as well as a careful analysis of smoking behaviour (e.g., psychosocial, sensorimotor, etc.) can be used to analyse the applicability of educational, marketing, and legal programmes in countries in different stages of TEM. Then, through benchmarking against successful implementations of anti-smoking social marketing campaigns in developed countries, the corresponding intervening bodies in these countries may develop appropriate and effective counter-smoking campaigns.

In addition to the process of benchmarking against anti-smoking campaigns in developed countries, the agents of the anti-smoking movement in developing countries may gain helpful insight from the analysis of other social marketing campaigns employed in their own or other developing countries. Examples of successful implementation of social marketing programmes in developing countries are found in the fight against HIV/AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases (Meekers 2000; Hopkins, Tanner, and Raymond 2004), against teen pregnancies (Marsiglio 1985), etc.

Figure 1 suggests that at the beginning of an anti-smoking movement a heavy emphasis needs to be placed on public education to increase awareness of risk and hazardous effect of tobacco consumption, especially in countries where people are not fully aware of the dangerous impact of tobacco on their health and thus, are not motivated to quit. Following Andreasen’s advice (2002), before the implementation of social marketing tactics it would be more appropriate to initiate heavy informational campaigns aimed to educate the citizens about dangerous effects of smoking and its relation to increasing mortality rates. Repetitive informational and persuasive advertising campaigns need to be applied to educate young and mature segments of the population and to offset the advertising and promotional efforts of tobacco companies (Niederdeppe, Hersey, Farely, Haviland, and Healtin 2005; Mandel et al., 2006).
At the same time, application of social marketing techniques would be appropriate in countries where the population is already aware of the danger of tobacco consumption, yet has either no opportunities to change the behaviour due to the lack of alternative programmes (e.g., sport activities for youth or cessation programmes for adults) or no ability to quit smoking (e.g., inability to resist strong peer pressure or addiction). In other words, in these situations it would be appropriate to exercise the potential of social marketing, i.e. to induce voluntary change in behaviour through the offerings of reinforcing incentives, introduction of new opportunities to help in exercising proper behaviour, support to overcome the social pressure, etc. Importantly, to develop attractive and motivational exchange intervention strategies, social marketers should not build their strategies solely on the findings and experiences from developed countries, as the means of counter tobacco consumption (e.g., restrictions, advertising bans, social and economic infrastructure, political stability, etc.) are different in many countries of the developing world. Thus, a carefully customised and tailored social marketing approach is necessary for each country and even for each target segment within the country.

At the same time, isolated implementation of social marketing alone cannot be helpful in solving the problems of smoking (Fox and Kotler 1980; Rothschild 1999; MacAskill et al. 2002). In a sense, business and governmental organisations of developing countries could be considered separate targets that need to be educated about the tobacco epidemic and offered alternative programmes to stop tobacco consumption. And here again, social marketing may serve as a tool that delivers the message to the appropriate organisations (i.e., government and private health organisation, non-profit health organisations, etc.). Close collaboration with business and governmental organisations needs to be developed to induce counter-smoking regulatory and economic sanctions (e.g., restricting smoking in public areas, imposing bans on tobacco advertising in media, restricting the range of advertising opportunities at points-of-sale, banning of sports events sponsorship, introducing excise taxes, coercing placement of warning labels, etc.). However, it is important to keep in mind that tobacco leaf is grown in more than 100 countries and employs about 33 million of people, mainly in developing countries. According to the International Labour Organisation report, tobacco industry is a key industry and one of the main source of employment and government revenue in such countries as China (35 million tobacco farmers), India (850, 000 farmers), Turkey (3.5 million farmers and other employees), Brazil (2.2 million employees), etc. (ILO 2003). Thus, anti-smoking tactics and strategies may face resistance even within the governments of developing countries, as many of them face difficult economic and political dilemmas in imposing restrictions on tobacco companies due to the fact that these companies are contributing to developing economies through shifting their operations to these countries, paying taxes, providing jobs, etc.

Conclusion
According to WHO, tobacco is the second major cause of death in the world, and is one of the preventable causes of increasing cancer diseases worldwide. Rapid expansion of the tobacco industry and alarming rates of tobacco consumption attract the attention of many international, governmental, and public organisations. Public resistance and legal regulations imposed by developed countries force tobacco industries to be creative in reconsidering their marketing strategies. They target the most vulnerable segments of the population in developed countries (i.e. youth, minorities, immigrants, and low-income communities). In addition, these companies are taking advantage of the globalisation process and less regulated and favourable conditions in developing countries to expand their activities.

Alarming rates of mortality and the economic burden caused by tobacco-related diseases are rapidly inviting the attention of governmental and non-governmental organisations and bodies in the developing world inducing the development of counter-smoking activities. In this anti-smoking movement, the role of social marketing cannot be overstated. However, its applications and tactics need to be carefully considered as the attitudes towards smoking and beliefs about its effect on health-related problems differ widely among current and potential smokers in developing countries. Therefore, to develop appropriate marketing strategies a careful analysis of motivations underlying smoking behaviour is required. Moreover, cultural and socio-economic differences between developing countries require specialised approaches in building attractive and motivational campaigns to induce anti-smoking behaviour. Careful monitoring of tobacco companies’ marketing and promotional activities, or in other words, close monitoring of the competition, is also necessary to counter the motivational appeals exercised to create favorable conditions for tobacco consumption. At the same time, the power of regulatory restrictions should not be ignored. As a result, social marketing campaigns may be exercised to induce anti-smoking movements among the health-conscious population of developing countries, which in long-run may result in more comprehensive attitudinal changes towards smoking.

References

continued...


Luvis, Claudia; Martin Reuter, and Netter, Petra (2005), ‘Psychological Theories of Smoking and Smoking Motivation,’ European Psychologist, 10 (1), 1-24.

MacKillop, Susan; Martine Stead; Anne M. MacKintosh, and Gerard Hastings (2002), ‘You Cannae Just Take Cigarettes Away From Somebody And No’ Gie Them Something Back’: Can Social Marketing Help Solve The Problem Of Low-Income Smoking?’ Social Marketing Quarterly, 8 (1), 19-34.


Stephens, Andrew; Jane Wardle; Weiwei Gui; Adriana Baban; Kelli Glass; Karl Pelzer; Akira Ruuda, and Jan Vink (2002), ‘An International Comparison of Tobacco Smoking, Beliefs and Risk Awareness In the University Students In 23 Countries,’ Addiction, 97 (12), 1561-1571.


I HAVE TO WANT TO DO IT: GAINING ‘VOLUNTARY’ COMPLIANCE WITH FEAR, GUILT, AND SHAME APPEALS IN SOCIAL MARKETING CAMPAIGNS

ABSTRACT
This paper presents results from a qualitative study of income support recipients with regard to how they feel about advertising which overtly appeals to their sense of fear, guilt and shame. The motivation of the study was to provide formative research for a social marketing campaign designed to increase compliance with income reporting requirements. This study shows that negative appeals with this group of people are more likely to invoke self-protection and inaction rather than an active response such as volunteering to comply. Social marketers need to consider the use fear, guilt and shame to gain voluntary compliance as the study suggests that there has been an overuse of these negative appeals. While more formative research is required, the future research direction aim would be to develop an instrument to measure the impact of shame on pro-social decision-making; particularly in the context of social networks rather than the wider society.

AUTHORS Linda Brennan, Faculty of Business and Enterprise, Swinburne University of Technology, John Street, Hawthorn Vic, Australia
Tel + 61 3 9214 4861   Email: lbrennan@swin.edu.au
Wayne Binney, Faculty of Business & Law, Victoria University of Technology, Melbourne, Australia
Phone + 61 3 9919 5207    Email Wayne.Binney@vu.edu.au

BACKGROUND
Social marketing is used by many not for profit and government organisations to encourage behaviours which, while socially important, might not be germane to the personal motivations of the individual. This study was undertaken to assess the potential value of three common social marketing appeals – fear, guilt, and shame – in terms of their capacity to induce compliant behaviours. The context of the study was income support recipients who often need to comply with reporting of extra income. The research took place prior to the development of campaign material relating to compliance and was used to formulate the campaign strategy.

The purpose of this study was to ascertain which of the appeals might have the greater propensity to motivate such people to behave in a particular way; in this case, to adopt compliant behaviour. Whilst accepting that emotional situations are often imperfectly recalled, the research was designed to elicit people’s recollections of campaigns that they believed were influential in motivating their personal behaviour(s) over time. The purpose was to ascertain if some emotional responses were more memorable or enduring than others and if people could associate self-reported memories of emotional response with subsequent ‘compliant’ outcomes (behavioural or otherwise). As a consequence, a qualitative study was conducted; primarily because the experimental designs usually associated with fear research do not allow for a retrospective consideration of people’s responses.

The link between emotional arousal, attitude formation and behavioural compliance is still theoretically problematic with only tentative links drawn between attitudes and intent, and some still ambiguous findings relating to intent and eventual behaviour. Notwithstanding these difficulties, social marketing campaigns often use emotional appeals in an attempt to encourage compliant behaviour from the public.

Huhmann and Brotherton (1997) found that guilt appeals are as pervasive as fear appeals in the field of advertising. Others have found that guilt appeals are very effective under certain (but different) circumstances (Cotte, Coulter, and Moore 2004). There are many studies about guilt and its self-persuasive effects (Abe 2006; Huhmann and Brotherton 1997). However, it would seem that the relationship between guilt and fear may be studied at the expense of other negative emotions such as shame. Abe’s (2004) research does connect guilt and shame although not in relation to advertising appeals. Abe’s findings also showed that shame was more likely to elicit negative behaviours than guilt. In a further study of guilt, Bennett (1998) found that certain communications that are intended to invoke guilt might produce shameful responses among its target audience, and this ultimately results in negative consequences. Bennett found that guilt appeals are generally more likely to result in positive responses to advertisements and empathy. Conversely, shame appeals are unlikely to result in empathy and instead, they are more likely to result in negative attitudes. In order for a guilt appeal to be effective, Bennett advocates that potential shame-inducing properties need to be eliminated. Bennett’s study did not find a correlation between guilt-intensive communications and psychological resistance, but other studies find that the degree of guilt evoked by an
advertisement campaign could lead to anger and negative attitudes towards the corporate sponsor (Coulter and Pinto 1995; Cotte et al 2004).

How income support recipients react to the use of negative emotions such as fear, guilt, and shame in socially focussed communications is presented below.

METHODOLOGY

Data for this study were collected from 120 participants through a series of semi-structured in-depth interviews regarding their attitudes towards appeals in advertising and their self-reported emotional responses to these appeals. In 2006, there were almost three million Australians who receive welfare assistance, and 1.2 million of these people agreed to be researched when they signed for their benefits. From this pool of potential research participants, 270 people were initially contacted about the study by telephone, and 120 people agreed to be interviewed. The profile of those who agreed to participate is representative of the population of income support recipients.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Participants were asked how they felt about negative appeals in advertising, whether or not they recognised such appeals and if they felt they had responded behaviourally to any appeals which had been made. Participants were not prompted to discuss particular campaigns and independently nominated what they wanted to discuss.

Of the negative emotions discussed, the participants were more likely to accurately recall advertisements that used fear as a major appeal, especially a fear of personal consequences, fear for others and fear of loss. As the participants described it, fear appeals in social marketing campaigns encouraged people to comply with rules and acceptable behaviour by scaring them about the potential legal, health and social risks associated with illegal, unhealthy or antisocial behaviour. Fear was seen as an unhealthy reaction to advertising and something to be avoided.

The participants defined shame as an emotion that individuals experience when other people who are significant to them become aware of their socially unacceptable behaviour. As they saw it, individuals do not feel ashamed unless they care what others think about them. The closer you are to the people who see your shame, the more likely you are to feel shame if you do something against the reference groups’ principles. Shame appeals were generally thought of in a negative light and as an ineffective method for motivating people to do the right thing. They did not believe that shame appeals evoke the same ‘escape’ reaction as marketing messages that use fear appeals, but the consequences of public shaming were seen to be unacceptable.

The participants described feeling saturated by negative emotional appeals. Many felt that even when they take notice of marketing campaigns, they would ‘switch off’ from the message because of the negativity depicted within the message and any subsequent call to action. Advertising that was designed to generate voluntary compliance, therefore, had great obstacles in reaching their target audience, especially in regards to overcoming apathy. This study found that positive emotion appeals in social marketing campaigns had a greater potential to not only ‘get people talking’ about an advertisement (as was the case with the fear appeals), but also in motivating people to act upon the call for voluntary ‘compliance’.

CONCLUSION

This research explored the use of fear, guilt and shame in a qualitative sense. While there is a significant amount of research supporting theory development in the fear and guilt domain, these results show that a theory of shame in advertising is under developed. Future research could investigate concepts of shame and how it might be usefully deployed within ‘normal’ populations. Any future affective typologies could include the concept of shame. While more formative research is required, the future research direction aim would be to develop an instrument to measure the impact of shame on pro-social decision-making; particularly in the context of social networks rather than the wider society.

The use of fear appeals has been demonstrably successful in other studies. However, the sheer number of emotive messages being sent limits the emotional energy able to be invested by an individual. In this sample, the emotional energy required to feel fearful or guilty is already attenuated. While there is a focus on television advertising in these responses, the most enduring campaigns in this study are those that have been integrated across a variety of media. Negative campaigns aimed at generating enduring behavioural change need to consider that people develop very sophisticated (but maladaptive) coping strategies to ensure that their core emotional and psychological well being is not influenced. As a consequence, advertisers could embed suggested coping strategies within the advertising that linked the desired behavioural outcome to socially positive consequences.

Guilt can be motivating but only when accompanied by some hope that individual action is both needed and capable of making the requisite social change. The participants in this study were overwhelmed by guilt, and messages invoking guilt were likely to invoke self-protection rather than encourage action. This study shows that for social marketing to be successful, the size and scope of the problem people are being called upon to resolve with their actions must also be within the capacity of individual achievement. Much advertising, in continued...
The Use of Fear Appeals in Social Marketing: Analysing the Influence of Racial Characteristics on Attitude Formation in HIV/AIDS Communication

M. Terblanche-Smit, Stellenbosch University, South Africa

1. Introduction

Social marketing programmes address various pandemics, and anti-social behaviour, where citizens are not acting in-line with accepted social conduct. The use of fear as a motivation in advertising places emphasis on the severity of the threat. In South Africa, specific research to guide marketing managers in social-issue related communication remains under explored. South Africa’s population is characterised by different racial groups, and advertising is often targeted at fairly heterogeneous groups.

This study investigates whether the use of fear increases the likelihood of adopting appropriate behaviour and if different racial groups perceive fear appeals pertaining to HIV/AIDS communication differently. The role of fear, attitude, threat and efficacy are examined to ascertain the influence of different levels of fear appeals. The findings of this paper indicate differences among racial groups pertaining to levels of fear and attitude towards advertisements, as well as differences in threat and efficacy experienced after exposure to high fear appeals compared to other appeals.

Keywords: Social Marketing, Marketing Communication, Advertising, Fear Appeals

2. Literature Review

Fear is a negative emotion and is associated with a high level of arousal. It is caused by a threat that is perceived to be substantial and personally relevant to individuals (Easterling & Leventhal, 1989; Ortony & Turner, 1990). Fear appeal literature indicate that fear can be described by mood adjectives, including feeling frightened, anxious, or nauseous, and also via ratings of concern or worry (LaTour & Tanner, 2003; LaTour & Rotfeld, 1997; Henthorpe, LaTour & Natarajaan, 1993; Rogers, 1983).

Different models to improve the effectiveness of fear appeals in advertising have been proposed. Tay, Ozanne and Santiono (2000: 1248) recommend the utilisation of fear appeals should be segment specific as fear appeals have been found to influence different population segments differently (Quinn et al., 1992; Burnett and Oliver, 1979 cited in Tay et al, 2000, p. 1248).

Growing evidence suggests that well-designed, well-targeted, theory-based behaviour change interventions can be effective in reducing the spread of HIV/AIDS (Fishbein, 2000). Culturally sensitive interventions have also been found to influence behaviour changes in high-risk populations (Levinson, Sadgursky & Erchak, 2004).

Based on Leventhal’s danger control/fear control framework, the Extended Parallel Process Model (EPPM) is an expansion of previous fear appeal theoretical approaches (Janis, 1967; Leventhal, 1970; Rogers, 1975, 1983). According to the EPPM threat motivates action, and perceived efficacy determines whether the action taken controls the danger (protective behaviour) or controls the fear (inhibits protective behaviour). Individuals typically weigh their risk of actually experiencing the threat against actions they can take that would minimise or prevent the threat (Witte, 1992, Witte, 1994, Witte, 1998).
3. Rationale of the Study

The main objective of this research study was to measure the influence of fear-based advertising appeals pertaining to HIV/AIDS in terms of the impact on behaviour and whether the use of fear increases the likelihood of adopting appropriate behaviour among different racial groups.

The specific research objectives included:

- Assess potential impact of low, medium & high fear appeal based advertising on fear, attitude towards the advertisements, threat and efficacy levels.
- Determine influence of racial group on the persuasive power of fear appeal advertising.
- To determine the above through use of selected number of print & television commercials.
- Use Extended Parallel Process Model (EPPM) in the SA context to test interventions and evaluate outcomes.

The EPPM was used to test interventions and evaluate outcomes. Fear arousal and attitude change were measured via self-rating of mood adjectives that have been used in other fear appeal studies (LaTour & Tanner, 2003; LaTour & Rotfeld, 1997; Henthorne, LaTour & Natarajan, 1993).

4. Research Methodology

A qualitative study explored in-depth responses via focus groups. Nine print advertisements and ten television commercials were used as experimental stimuli to be pre-tested. Each advertisement was rated according to the level of fear appeal perceived.

Three advertisements including low, medium and high fear appeals for print and television were selected based on the qualitative research. A pre-test post-test, 3 X 2 between subjects, experimental design was used to collect data from 360 respondents. The presentation of various fear appeal advertisements was the experimental intervention while the likelihood of changing behaviour based on fear, attitude, susceptibility and efficacy was measured as the outcome.

5. Data Analysis and Major Findings

ANOVA comparisons and univariate tests of significance for fear indicated significant mean differences for advertisement type (p<0.0001), type of advertising appeal (p<0.0001), as well as an interaction for fear appeal with race (p<0.01). All respondents experienced similarly low levels of fear from low fear interventions, whilst different reactions to medium and high fear appeals were experienced. White respondents’ fear increased gradually from low to high fear appeals, whilst coloured respondents’ fear increased substantially after exposure to high fear appeals. Black respondents’ fear increased gradually to medium fear appeals and their fear level stayed constant after this.

The same analysis for attitude indicated significant mean differences for fear appeal (p<0.01) and interactions for advertisement type with fear appeal (p<0.01), and fear appeal with race (p<0.03). Respondents’ attitude toward the advertisements was more positive after exposure to medium fear appeals than low fear appeals, as well as for high fear appeals than low fear appeals. This indicated that respondents’ perception of the HIV/AIDS message conveyed was more positive at a medium and high fear appeal level than at a low fear appeal level, and could imply increased cognitive change at the higher fear levels.

Susceptibility measures included respondents’ perceptions about their susceptibility to HIV/AIDS and whether they believed that they were at risk of contracting HIV/AIDS. ANOVA comparisons and Tukey HSD post hoc tests denoted that pre-and post-tests for all groups pertaining to susceptibility resulted in significant mean differences for race (p<0.002), as well as a significant interaction for time (from pre- to post-test) with advertisement (p<0.01), and an interaction for time (from pre- to post-test) with race (p<0.08). Differences in responses from racial groups pertaining to the threat of HIV/AIDS (susceptibility) were evident. White respondents’ susceptibility and thus perceptions about the likelihood that the threat of HIV/AIDS will happen to them, their degree of vulnerability and personal relevance expected from HIV/AIDS, were significantly lower than coloured respondents, and also lower than black respondents. Black respondents’ susceptibility measures were slightly lower than coloured respondents and they thus perceived the disease as less relevant to them.

Data analysis indicated that efficacy for condom usage resulted in a significant interaction for time with fear (p<0.007) and efficacy in terms of safe sexual behaviour resulted in a significant interaction for advertisement, with fear and with race (p<0.006). It was apparent from the findings that respondents efficacy levels for condom usage was high even after exposure to medium and high fear appeal messages, which caused a slight decline in efficacy. This suggests that respondents believe they can use condoms to prevent HIV/AIDS infection even after exposure to medium and high fear appeal advertising.

6. Conclusions and Implications

From this study it is evident that racial characteristics play an important role in attitude formation in fear appeal advertising. Different reactions in terms of fear, attitude, threat and efficacy in HIV/AIDS communication are also apparent. A key issue of this research study concerns the overall implications of the outcomes for future advertising. It would seem that susceptibility and likelihood of contracting HIV/AIDS, continued...
namely vulnerability, is a key concern for all groups, particularly whites and blacks. This would suggest that future advertising strategy should target this issue.

The exploration of targeted advertising campaigns for racial groups will increase the effectiveness of the said campaigns. Black and white respondents require even higher fear appeal messages to obtain higher fear levels, and increase perceived vulnerability to HIV/AIDS if they are to adapt to safe sexual behaviour. High fear appeals, specifically television, had the greatest impact on fear and attitude towards advertisements, and should be investigated for its visual and audio impact for HIV/AIDS advertising targeted to adolescents.

Positive attitudes are more likely to drive safe sexual behaviour change, in this instance it seems that medium and high fear appeals are more likely to drive behaviour change in HIV/AIDS communication than low fear appeals.

Targeted advertising campaigns conveying the personal and relevant risk of contracting HIV/AIDS for racial groups seems critical. Based on the strong effect on susceptibility received from television advertisement interventions it seems obvious that this medium will convey the strongest message and have the highest likelihood of being successful in convincing adolescents that they are likely to contract HIV/AIDS and are vulnerable to this disease.

Respondents from all race groups had similarly high efficacy levels pertaining to safe sexual behaviour in all groups. This supports the notion that respondents would weigh their risk of actually experiencing the threat (high fear appeal) against actions they can take that would minimise or prevent the threat of HIV/AIDS infection, and in this instance revert to safe sexual behaviour.

Selected References


Dead cert or long shot: The utility of social marketing in tackling problem gambling in the UK?

Corresponding Author: Ross Gordon, Research Officer, Institute for Social Marketing, University of Stirling and the Open University, Stirling, FK9 4LA, Scotland. telephone: +44 (0)1786 466457 fax: +44 (0)1786 466449 e-mail: ross.gordon@stir.ac.uk website: www.ism.stir.ac.uk

Dr. Crawford Moodie, Researcher, Institute for Social Marketing, University of Stirling and the Open University, Stirling, FK9 4LA, Scotland.

Keywords: gambling, social marketing, regulation, policy, intervention

Abstract

Social marketing has grown from a fledgling discipline to one recognised as an established means of eliciting behaviour change. Social marketing was defined at its inception as the use of marketing techniques to promote the adoption of healthy or pro-social behaviours (Kotler & Zaltman, 1971). Lazer and Kelley (1973, p. 9) expanded this original definition to include a critical marketing dimension, advocating that social marketing is also concerned with the analysis of the social consequences of marketing policies, decisions and activities.

The development of social marketing in recent years has resulted in a considerable increase in capacity for research, funding and a practitioner skills base, alongside academic discourse that has stimulated growth in theory, concepts and discipline building. The UK government has also recognised, and embraced, the potential value of social marketing in the ‘Choosing Health’ white paper and the formation of the National Social Marketing Centre (NSMC) in 2006. These developments have been complimented by the establishment of social marketing benchmark criteria which include consumer research and orientation, generating insight; behaviour change; use of theory; exchange analysis; competitive analysis; segmentation and targeting; and methods mix, therefore providing a clear framework for what constitutes social marketing.

Furthermore the extant literature provides evidence of the utility of social marketing in eliciting behaviour change whether directly, through interventions targeted at the individual, family or community, or indirectly, via critical marketing and upstream social marketing, which can create the necessary conditions for enabling behaviour change by informing policy and regulatory decisions. Systematic reviews have demonstrated that the effectiveness of social marketing interventions applied to food and nutrition, substance misuse and physical activity (Gordon et al., 2006; Stead et al., 2007). Additionally critical studies of tobacco marketing (MacFadyen et al., 2001), food marketing (Hastings et al., 2003), and alcohol marketing (Snyder et al., 2006) have been used to inform policy and regulation around commercial marketing.

Concomitant with the maturation of social marketing has been an increasing focus on expansion into new and untapped areas for behaviour change. Traditionally social marketing has been the reserve of public health, however efforts to expand application have been made in areas such as citizen engagement (McKenzie-Mohr, 1999), recycling (Herrick, 1995) and public transport use (Cooper, 2006). Resultantly, in recent years social marketers have increasingly examined how social marketing can be used in other areas to engender social change.

This paper posits that social marketing has the potential for use to tackle one such area: problem gambling. Social marketing has already been identified as being suitable for use to develop initiatives tackling problem gambling (Messerlain & Derevensky, 2007). This review found evidence that mass media campaigns can have a degree of success at changing gambling behaviours. It follows therefore that social marketing could potentially be used in addressing problem gambling.

Gambling is an activity that is historically and globally prevalent and is widely engaged in by both adults and adolescents. Moreover it is generally socially acceptable, is heavily marketed and tightly regulated, and displays similarities to a range of health-risk behaviours such as tobacco and alcohol use which have been targeted using social marketing. As such, social marketing, with its focus on consumer orientation and gaining insight has the potential to generate understanding and a response to problem gambling, which appears to be entrenched within British culture. Furthermore, relational thinking in social marketing efforts would enable a more sustained, multi-faceted and long-term intervention approach to combat problem gambling.

Social marketing is already being used to tackle gambling issues with the campaign recently introduced by the HSC (Health Sponsorship Council) in New Zealand called ‘Kiwi Lives’. The campaign, commissioned by the New Zealand Ministry of Health, involved the development of a national social marketing programme to increase understanding and awareness of problem gambling, with the ultimate aim of preventing and minimising gambling related harm. The programme launched in 2007 by a mass media marketing campaign featuring TV and radio advertising, a website and web media, print resources, a helpline and access to support...
and information services. The campaign drew on findings from formative research to develop the mass media campaign and the wider social marketing programme.

In the UK gambling is a common recreational activity for both adults and adolescents alike, with approximately two-thirds of the adult population engaging in some form of gambling activity within the last year. Amongst this number a minority of individuals experience problems directly related to their gambling behaviour, with 0.6 per cent of the adult population being classified as problem gamblers according to the 2006 prevalence survey (Wardle et al., 2007). Although a relatively small proportion of the general population, the deleterious consequences associated with problem gambling typically extend beyond the individual gambler and affect others such as family members. Young people are also at risk to the detrimental effects of gambling considering that rates of youth problem gambling in England, Wales and Scotland range from 3.5 per cent to 9 per cent.

A major change in the regulatory environment around gambling in the UK has recently occurred with the 2005 Gambling Act. The act signalled a move from the relatively restrictive regulatory regime in place previously to one that is more liberalising. Although it is too early to gauge the impact of this legislative change the lifting of restrictions on gambling marketing allied to the expected growth in gambling opportunities, is likely to further foster the normalisation and acceptance of gambling.

In response the Gambling Commission have implemented social responsibility codes of practice which all gambling operators, and gambling advertisements, must adhere to. The effectiveness of these codes of practice will only become apparent in the future and will require evaluation research. However recent observational research has found most operators have not embraced the concept of responsible gambling and many have failed to even adhere to the codes of practice (Moodie & Reith, 2008). Given these concerns an examination of the utility of social marketing for tackling gambling-related harm is warranted.

We propose four ways in which social marketing could be used to address problem gambling in the UK, and indeed elsewhere. First, there is a need for research into the effect that gambling marketing has on behaviour. Given the recent lifting of restrictions on gambling advertising, and other forms of marketing, in the UK, critical marketing studies similar to those carried out on food, tobacco and alcohol marketing are required. An audit of gambling marketing communications measuring; the extent and nature of marketing, marketing channels employed and details on marketing budgets and strategy, would be of significant value. Findings could then be used in the development of a longitudinal survey on the impact of gambling marketing on behaviour. Such research would inform our understanding of gambling marketing and provide an evidence base that could be used to inform regulation and legislation.

Second, conducting critical marketing research ties in with upstream social marketing as research findings can be used to inform and drive activities such as media advocacy, influencing regulation and policy change, and influencing communities, regulators and decision makers. With regards to gambling this might involve a reconsideration of gambling policy, legislation and regulation, especially around the marketing of gambling.

Third a social marketing programme incorporating a mass media campaign can be effective in raising awareness of, and indeed changing attitudes towards, problem gambling among the general population. Therefore a similar mass media campaign designed using social marketing principles would be useful in the UK to increase awareness and understanding of problem gambling.

Fourth, targeted social marketing behaviour change interventions could be used as an approach to tackling problem gambling in the UK. Using a social marketing approach could enable interventions to be consumer oriented, reach difficult to reach target audiences such as low income or ethnic groups and design programmes around their environment and needs.

We have explicated the growth and expansion of social marketing and the benefits and challenges associated with its application to problem gambling in the UK. Gambling has clear parallels with other potentially addictive behaviours, such as tobacco and alcohol, which have benefited from social marketing and, as such, this approach remains a viable option. Indeed, social marketing is already being applied to tackle the issue in New Zealand and initial evaluation suggests that it can be effective. All that remains is a call for social marketers, academics, practitioners, decision makers and research funders to accept the challenge and demonstrate how the case for using social marketing made here can become reality.

References
Homewood: Richard D. Irwin.

Monday 29 September – 16.10

Communication – Lancaster Room

Developing pandemic communication strategies: how do different audience segments respond to preparedness and prevention messages?

Sandra C. Jones, Louise Waters, Omnia Holland, Ian Bevins, Don Iverson
Centre for Health Initiatives, University of Wollongong

Contact Details:
Professor Sandra Jones
BA MBA (Marketing) PostGradDipHlthProm MPH MAssessEval PhD
Director, Centre for Health Initiatives
University of Wollongong
(Building 41. G04)
PH. +61 2 4221 5106
Fax. +61 2 4221 3370
Email. sandraj@uow.edu.au

Ms Louise Waters
BSc MPH
Research Associate, Centre for Health Initiatives
University of Wollongong
(Building 41. G04)
PH. +61 2 4221 5106
Fax. +61 2 4221 3370

Ms Omnia Holland
OmniCom Research Pty Ltd
38 Boundary Street,
South Melbourne Vic 3205
Ph: 9699 4500
Fax: 9699 3200

Mr John Bevins
John Bevins Pty Limited
37 Nicholson Street

continued...
INTRODUCTION
The influenza A (H5N1) virus is currently the focus of the world’s attention (www.inspection.gc.ca). The virus can be spread by migratory birds and mechanical means (e.g., from one farm to another via the soil captured by tyres), from birds to mammals, and from birds to humans (Alexander 2000; Hien et al. 2004). While avian flu viruses are not known to infect humans there is disputed evidence that the virus can spread from human to human (Ungchusak et al. 2005). Yet, with the 2006 outbreak of the virus within a family living in a village in north Sumatra (Wulandari and Lyn 2006), and more recent cases of bird flu among families or neighbourhoods, the pandemic potential of bird flu has been truly realised.

If the bird flu virus can be readily spread from human to human the potential for a repeat of the 1918 Spanish Influenza which killed an estimated 20-50 million people is real. A recent assessment of the likely numbers and age distributions of cases and deaths, using clinical case rates from three previous influenza pandemics, estimated case rates of between 24.7 per cent and 34.2 per cent, and death rates between 4.4 and 6.7 per 1000 people (Brundage 2006).

Communication in the media regarding a potential avian influenza epidemic can serve to accurately and effectively inform the public OR misinform and contribute to unnecessary public panic and subsequent undesirable responses. Governments have time to develop communication strategies and specific messages that can effectively convey desired information at different stages of the anticipated pandemic. Communication strategies (including specific messages, media vehicles, spokespeople and images targeted at different audiences) can be developed and pre-tested for use by government, medical authorities, NGOs and other relevant organisations in an attempt to increase the public’s understanding of the risk. Such strategies will minimise fear, refute misinformation that the public may encounter (eg, from co-workers or media sources) and enhance the likelihood of the public taking the recommended preventive and remedial actions should these become necessary.

Effective social marketing incorporates the concepts of formative research, audience segmentation, and consumer focus. We have previously conducted extensive formative research – including a series of focus groups, two Australia-wide CATI surveys, and two airport intercept surveys – to gather in-depth information on the public’s knowledge of, and concerns about, bird flu. In summary, these studies consistently found that people were generally unconcerned about bird flu and did not see it as an issue for Australia (Jones and Iverson, in press; Waters and Jones 2007; Jones et al. 2007).

Using the results from the focus groups and the CATI survey a leading Australian advertising agency prepared campaign concepts for testing. The agency undertook the campaign development as two independent teams, each developing an alternative approach. This resulted in two very different campaigns for testing: a presenter approach, and a non-presenter approach. Each campaign consisted of two phases: Phase 1 for pre-pandemic communications, and Phase 2 for communications in the event of bird flu cases in Australia.

• Approach 1 – ‘Spokes People’ utilised a team of trusted medical/scientific professionals, each eminently qualified to speak to a specific phase of any pandemic – impending, happening or ending.

• Approach two – ‘Paper People’ utilised a visual theme of cut-out paper people (which most people would remember making as children) to provide a very flexible, and immediately recognisable vehicle for the campaign.

The advertising concepts (story boards and print ads) were tested using focus groups by two independent market research companies (one in New South Wales and one in Victoria) in July 2006. Generally speaking, across both campaigns (but particularly for the Spokes People campaign), people weren’t left feeling prepared or secure after seeing the Phase One communication. In Phase Two, in response to the now grave situation, the recommended actions seemed inadequate and overly simplistic leaving participants feeling angry and belittled.

METHODOLOGY
The overriding objective of the current research was to evaluate the revised communication pieces. Specifically, we aimed to examine:

• The effectiveness of the campaign at Phase I and Phase II

• The comprehension of the campaign at Phase I and Phase II

continued...
• The credibility of the campaign at Phase I and Phase II
• The emotional elicitation of the campaign at Phase I and Phase II
• The behavioural elicitation of the campaign at Phase I and Phase II.

Focus groups were conducted in October 2006 in two Australian states (Victoria and New South Wales) by two experienced commercial research companies, with four distinct consumer segments:

• Young Adults/Travellers
• Mothers
• Older Adults
• Regional Community

RESULTS

Prior to exposure to the Campaign, members of the public were gauged on their associations with Bird Flu. The findings were consistent with those from the two previous phases of focus group research (conducted in April 2006 and July 2006). Throughout all three phases, Bird Flu remained an issue quarantined in the public’s mind with 3rd world Asian countries. Immediately after exposure to Phase 1 of the Campaign, members of the public were again gauged on their associations of Bird Flu. Overall, Phase 1 of the Campaign served to remind participants that Bird Flu is not off the radar and, as such, they should not be complacent.

Prior to exposure to Phase Two of the Campaign, participants were shown a series of mock newspaper headlines to demonstrate a hypothetical scenario in which a bird flu pandemic had occurred internationally and cases, and deaths, had occurred in Australia. Phase II of the Campaign was effective in providing clear actionable information and, by using a professional tonality, reinforcing what had previously been communicated. Participants’ responses also suggested that Phase I and Phase II successfully linked together.

DISCUSSION

The Phase One ‘Paper People’ are an effective communication device as they symbolise the ‘everyman’ (no-one is offended or left out), emphasis connection & co-operation, and are a simple visual device that everyone can understand. Similarly, the use of the colour red to indicate germs is an immediately noticed and easily understood device. The ‘Wash, Wipe, Wear’ message is simple, easily remembered, and was often played back by focus group participants. The revised Phase One is now much more effective. The campaign still results in people taking the issue a lot more seriously and becoming considerably more anxious about the threat. However, the big difference from the testing of the original concept is that people now ask fewer questions, and are left feeling personally less scared and more prepared and more confident about the Government’s response.

The transition from paper people in Phase One to the use of the real people and a more serious tone in Phase Two worked well and was perceived as consistent by participants – that is, a different messenger but the same message. Participants reported that having a real person at this stage is very reassuring, and made them feel that someone is taking charge. Both the Chief Medical Officer (CMO) role and the man himself had credibility and gravitas and his measured, calm tone was perceived as reassuring; and the inclusion of Fiona Stanley was endorsed as demonstrating to the public that there is a team working on the problem. The accompanying print ads were seen to be very clear, informative, and easy to read.

CONCLUSION

The current research suggests that in the early stages of a pandemic (i.e., prior to the identification of cases within a given country) communications should focus on increasing awareness of the disease and communicating important, but simple, protective behaviours to reduce the risk of transmission. In later stages of a pandemic (i.e., where cases have been confirmed within a country or a region), Communication campaigns need to effectively communicate the key messages for each stage of pandemic and motivate the public to engage in the correct preventive actions without engendering unnecessary panic in the community.

REFERENCES

Jones, Sandra C. and Don C. Iverson (in press), ‘What Australians know and believe about bird flu: results of a population telephone survey,’ Health Promotion Practice.


Using social marketing to maximise the impact of hotel reuse programmes

Jingzhi Shang, Simon Fraser University, Canada
Debra Z. Basil and Walter Wymer, University of Lethbridge, Canada

Abstract
Hotels are increasingly sponsoring social marketing programmes to encourage voluntary reduction of towel and linen use. These programmes reduce water usage thus benefiting the environment. They also reduce hotels’ laundering costs. Two controlled experiments were conducted to assess behavioural intentions and attributions as a result of such programmes. Results demonstrate that response is most positive when savings from the programme are donated to charity. When evidence is provided suggesting that a majority of hotel guests participate (social proof), the impact of how savings are used is reduced. This is especially pronounced for those traveling on business. Fit between the charity and the reuse programme is inconsequential. Implications are discussed.

Introduction
Environmental issues present a tremendous challenge for today’s society. Consumers have become increasingly concerned with the environment. Water resources are emerging as a key environmental concern for consumers (Barlow, 2008; Polling Report, 2008). Industrial uses account for nearly one-quarter of the earth’s fresh water consumption, often creating wastewater as a result (BSR Staff, 2003). The hotel industry, in its laundering of linens and towels, uses large quantities of fresh water, producing wastewater. Hotels are increasingly requesting that guests reuse their towels and linens in an effort to reduce water consumption. Are these requests successful? How do they impact consumer attitudes toward the hotel? These questions are addressed in the present research.

Reuse programmes encouraging hotel guests to voluntarily reduce the frequency of linen and towel changes represent a type of social marketing. Different definitions of social marketing (SM) have been offered, but the central concept among them is that social marketing involves using marketing principles to encourage voluntary behaviour change for the benefit of individuals and/or society (Wymer, Knowles, and Gomes 2006). Social marketing campaigns are generally developed and implemented by government agencies, community organisations, or voluntary advocacy groups (Hastings 2007). Business sector social marketing campaigns are less common and, consequently, little prior research has been done in this area. The present research will address this knowledge gap by investigating business-initiated social marketing within the context of towel and linen reuse programmes.

The purpose of this study is to add to our knowledge of this type of social marketing by examining how consumers respond to different elements of hotel linen and towel reuse promotions. We examine different ways in which these programmes can be promoted to guests to investigate their relative effectiveness. Specifically, we consider attributions, fit, social proof, and type of hotel stay.

Study 1
The experimental design was a 2 (source: Marriot hotel source, Project Planet source) X 2 (charitable donation, no charitable donation) X 2 (fit: fit charity, non-fit charity) factor design. Because fit was a variable under the charitable donation condition, the experiment was a nested design so the study had six experimental conditions and one control condition. In the control condition subjects were merely asked their attitudes and behaviour intentions toward reuse without receiving a message encouraging reuse. Participants were 53 per cent male and 47 per cent female (N = 401). Participants’ ages ranged from 17 to 79 years (mean = 52). Participants’ median education level was a college diploma. The average annual income range was $75,000 to $99,999.

In summarising Study one’s results, making a charitable donation (whether or not the charity was a good fit with the social marketing campaign) had positive results. The charitable donation element enhanced

continued...
perceptions of value-driven motives of the hotel (i.e., hotels appeared more altruistic) and made subjects less likely to attribute egoistic motives to hotels. The hotel source (Marriott) made participants think less about the egoistic motives of the hotel than the Project Planet source. Making a charitable donation encouraged more positive attitudes and more value-driven attributions. However, the fit of the charity did not significantly affect participants’ responses.

Participants scoring higher on environmentalism were more likely to comply with the reuse programme and to have more positive attributions, as expected. Participants’ environmental involvement positively influenced their behavioural intentions and negatively influenced egoistic attributions, also as expected. Participants scoring higher on the NFC were more likely to think about the value-driven motives of the hotel. Younger participants responded more positively to the reuse programme, consistent with previous research on CSR.

**Study 2**

The results of Study 1 suggest that patrons are more likely to reuse their towels and linens if the savings resulting from patron compliance are donated to charity. Participants assigned fewer egoistic attributions to the hotel’s motives when a charitable donation was made. It is unclear, however, whether the reuse motivation stemmed from a desire to benefit the charity, or merely from a desire that the hotel not directly benefit financially from their reuse efforts. The hotel could choose to use any cost savings to reduce room rates rather than donating savings to a charity. This would reduce attributions of egoistic motivations without evoking altruistic motivations. This suggests two plausible explanations for patron compliance; that is, whether compliance will be related specifically to making a charitable donation, or whether it will simply be related to any reduction in egoistic attributions, such as when the hotel directs the reuse savings toward lower room rates. Therefore, a second study was conducted to better understand this issue.

This study design was a 2 (social proof: 75 per cent reuse rate, no mention of reuse rate) X 3 (savings use: no mention, reduced room rates, donation to charity) X 2 (type of hotel stay: business, pleasure) fully-crossed between-subjects design. A total of 884 individuals participated. Participants followed a procedure identical to that used in Study 1. Respondents’ average age was 50. The sample was 43 percent female. The modal education level was some college. The modal income level was $50,000 to $74,999.

Social proof and savings use interacted. When social proof was present, how the savings were used was less influential than when social proof was not present. No differences were found for the other dependent variables. A significant three-way interaction between social proof, use of savings, and trip funding occurred (F = 2.99, p = .05) for the DV attitude toward the hotel.

In summarising the results for Study Two, the hotel was perceived to be more altruistically motivated when it donated the savings from reuse compliance to a charity. When the message stated that a large percentage of people participate in linen and towel reuse, how savings were used had less impact than it otherwise would, but this was only true for business travelers. However this effect was only significant with value driven attributions, not with behavioural intentions or attitudes toward the hotel. Involvement and environmentalism increased reuse intention, value driven attributions, and attitudes toward the hotel, whereas a high NFC reduced value driven attributions and attitudes toward the hotel. Social proof increased egoistic attributions, and this was especially apparent in conditions where no mention of savings use was provided.

**Conclusion**

These results suggest that if hotels wish to maximise benefits to the hotel from their towel and linen reuse programme, they should consider including their own logo on the request card and donating the savings to charity. If they do not wish to donate savings to charity, then they should indicate the rate of social compliance on the notice card, and social proof will enhance responses. However, this may come at the expense of increasing egoistic attributions toward the hotel, making the hotel appear to be more self-interested and less socially concerned.

The findings indicate that compliance with a social marketing programme and consumer attitudes towards sponsoring organisations can be influenced by the composition of the message components. Linen and towel reuse programmes represent a special type of social marketing programme in which both society and business benefit. Careful attention to the structure of the message can maximise this societal benefit while benefiting the hotel.

Traditional social marketers, like government agencies and nonprofit organisations, may wish to use this information to encourage hotels to embark upon social marketing reuse campaigns. This research may stimulate future inquiry into other areas in which social marketing campaigns can benefit both society and business.

**References**


Linking Celebrity Endorser Characteristics to Non-Profit Donation

Tanya Drollinger
Assistant Professor of Marketing
Faculty of Management
University of Lethbridge
4401 University Drive West Lethbridge
Alberta, Canada T1K 3M4
Phone:  403-329-2648

Walter Wymer
Associate Professor of Marketing
Faculty of Management
University of Lethbridge
4401 University Drive West Lethbridge
Alberta, Canada T1K 3M4
Phone:  403-329-2174

Non-profits are an important support system behind many social causes (UNICEF, Oxfam). In order to keep them functioning they depend largely on individual donations. Soliciting donations is becoming more competitive with the growing number of non-profits and the overlap between their missions. In order to stand out in their communication campaigns and advance their cause many are turning to celebrity spokespersons who receive a great deal of media attention as well as admiration from the public. Although the use of celebrities may be successful in gaining public attention little empirical research has been conducted on their effectiveness as spokespersons for non-profits.

As a first step in better understanding the effectiveness of celebrity spokespersons for non-profits the source credibility and source attractiveness models will be considered. Both models have received a great deal of empirical support in examining celebrity endorser effectiveness for brands and products. Lastly, in order to better understand the unique nature of giving to a non-profit this study will examine admiration for the celebrity and its effect on donation behaviour.

Relevant Literature

The source credibility model which concerns itself primarily with the congruency or fit between the endorser and the brand has received a great deal of empirical support with regards to effectiveness. More specifically when celebrity endorsers are perceived to be more expert, or trustworthy viewers have more positive attitudes toward the ad, greater purchase intention and higher levels of believability (Kamins, 1990; Ohanian, 1991). Two components of credibility are the perceived trustworthiness and expertise of the endorser. Trustworthiness is defined as the degree of confidence in the communicator's intent to communicate the assertions he considers most valid and expertise is the extent to which a communicator is perceived to be a source of valid assertions. Trustworthiness of a spokesperson addresses the recipients' confidence in the message whereas, expertise the competence or expertness of the spokesperson's message (Ohanian, 1991). It is expected that viewers that consider celebrity spokespersons with higher levels of trustworthiness and expertise will be more likely to donate to a charitable organisation.

H1: Higher levels of perceived trustworthiness of the celebrity endorser will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation.

H2: Higher levels of perceived expertise of the celebrity endorser will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation.

The source attractiveness model maintains that the effectiveness of a message is dependent upon the sources' attractiveness, likeability and familiarity to the viewer. Likeability is the degree to which the respondent is fond of the spokesperson whereas familiarity addresses the respondents' recognition of the celebrity. Attractiveness of the spokesperson has been empirically related to purchase intention and attitude toward the product and the ad (Kamins, 1990). In general, attractive spokespersons are better endorsers for attractiveness related products than unattractive spokespersons however attractiveness does not seem to have a negative impact on endorsement of any type of product or brand. Although attractiveness of the celebrity endorser may seem peripheral in the case of a non-profits communication campaign it may be effective in capturing the interest of viewers.

H3: Higher levels of perceived attractiveness of the celebrity endorser will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation.

H4: Higher levels of likeability of the celebrity endorser will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation.

H5: Higher levels of familiarity of the celebrity endorser will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation.

When examining perceptions of celebrity endorsers little attention in the marketing and advertising literature has been paid to the viewer's admiration of the celebrity. Admiration is proposed to be a unique celebrity characteristic as it refers to the respect and esteem that one has for a celebrity. Celebrities often represent extraordinary talents and abilities that set themselves apart and can inspire others (Flora, 2004). Celebrities are often seen as exemplars not only for their unique abilities but also their widely publicised character (Flora, 2004). Further, admiration for a celebrity may be a more meaningful celebrity characteristic when investigating their effectiveness in promoting a cause rather than a product.

H6: Higher levels of admiration of the celebrity endorser will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation.

continued...
Method and Procedures

A total of 227 subjects completed online questionnaires. Participants were a part of an online panel and received rewards for filling out questionnaires. Approximately 47 per cent of the sample was female. The average age of the respondents was 44 years with a range of 18-74 years. Most of the respondents had completed some college.

Subjects were randomly assigned to one of three celebrity conditions (Julia Roberts n = 63, Angelina Jolie n = 81, Rosie O’Donnell n = 83). The questionnaires were preceded by a fictitious advertisement for the Darfur Orphan Rescue Society (DORS) with one of the before mentioned celebrities as the spokesperson. The celebrity spokespersons were chosen due to various levels of attractiveness, likeability, trustworthiness, admiration and expertise was manipulated. The respondents answered questions regarding their perceptions of the celebrities’ characteristics and their likelihood of donating to DORS. Due to Angelina Jolie’s charitable activity in Africa and her adoption of children she was chosen as an expert. In order to manipulate expertise, the large copy in Angelina’s advertisement claimed that she was an adoptive parent of a Darfuri orphan.

In order to measure source credibility dimensions and attractiveness Ohanian’s (1991) scale was adopted. In tests of the internal consistency of the scales each scale meet established levels of internal validity (trustworthiness .985, expertise .970 and attractiveness .968). Likeability and familiarity was measured using previously published scales. Tests of the internal consistency of the two scales meet reasonable levels of internal validity (likeability .972, familiarity .75). Admiration of celebrity endorsers was measured using a four item semantic differential scale (.964). The dependent measure of likelihood of donating was measured using two items measured on semantic differential scales.

Results

An ANOVA was run in order to ascertain if the manipulation of expertise (Angelina Jolie should be the expert) was successful. In a between subjects design an ANOVA revealed that there was a significant difference with regards to expertise among the three celebrities (F = 19.410, p < .000). Examining mean values of perceived expertise for Angelina (x = 14.04), Julia (x = 12.36), and Rosie (x = 9.26) indicated that the manipulation worked in the manner it was intended to.

The first two hypotheses were developed under assumptions of the source credibility model. More specifically H1 stated that higher levels of trustworthiness will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation. Utilising an ANOVA the relationship between perceived trustworthiness of the celebrity and the likelihood of donating was supported (F = 3.080, p < .000). Hypothesis two stated higher levels of expertise will be positively related to the likelihood of donating to a non-profit organisation. A positive and significant relationship (F = 5.608, p < .000) was also found.

A series of one way ANOVAs were used to test the hypotheses regarding the source attractiveness model. It was hypothesised (H3) that attractiveness of spokespersons would be positively related to donation. This hypothesis was supported via a significant relationship between attractiveness and donation (F = 4.486, p < .000). Hypothesis four stated that the likeableness of a celebrity endorser would have a positive effect on donation. Support for this hypothesis was confirmed (F = 2.658, p < .000). Lastly, familiarity of the spokesperson was hypothesised (H5) to be positively related to donation. Results supported a positive and significant relationship between familiarity and donation (F = 2.980, p < .000).

In order to test the relationship between celebrity admiration and the likelihood of donating to charity a one way ANOVA was employed. A positive and significant relationship (F = 3.375, p < .000) between celebrity admiration and donation was found.

Discussion

In the present study the source models received support with regards to the likelihood of donating to a cause (DORS). However each dimension of the source credibility and source attractiveness models were examined singly rather than collectively. In order to gain a more insightful view of the most important source characteristics a next step would be to examine all characteristics simultaneously. Admiration of celebrity endorsers has not received a great deal of attention in scholarly literature but is worthy of further investigation. It represents a unique viewer perception of the celebrity that encompasses feelings of esteem and respect. Future research may also consider the benefits a celebrity receives when pairing themselves with a non-profit. Are they perceived as being more generous, trustworthy or admirable by the public?

References

'The role of avoidance and protective behavioural strategies in the university drinking environment – a double challenged approach.'

Sandra Jones, University of Wollongong

ABSTRACT

Several studies have reported high rates of dangerous drinking among female university students. Previous university-based interventions that aim to increase awareness of the dangers associated with excessive drinking may not be suitable if, as consumption rates suggest, students are drinking with the intention to get drunk. The use of protective behavioural strategies (PBS) has been suggested as a promising response to university drinking (Martens et al. 2005), yet there is limited knowledge regarding their use from students’ perspectives, particularly in Australia. In any social marketing campaign, formative research with the aim of understanding the target behaviour from the perspective of the target audience is important for the development of appropriate and effective programmes (Hastings 2007). Therefore, this study aimed to identify and investigate, via the use of focus groups, the use of PBS among female university students from a large regional Australian university.

Results showed that the drinking intentions of a student are likely to influence their intentions to adopt avoidance and/or protective behavioural strategies. Furthermore, participants described the difficulties associated with the use of PBS to abstain, or limit consumption due to social pressure and the potential for social exclusion – particularly if the student otherwise usually partakes in heavy drinking. Therefore the student perspectives towards the use of PBS show they are used to overcome the difficulties associated with peer pressure, rather than a tool for reducing the risk of alcohol related harm.

As suggested in the quantitative literature (Martens et al. 2005) this study also confirmed that those who are at the highest risk of experiencing alcohol related harm are less likely to respond to campaigns which aim to promote and increase the use of protective behavioural strategies among drinkers. Students who intend on drinking excessively have accepted the high chance of experiencing minor negative effects associated with alcohol, and therefore believe they are not in need of PBS. These different perspectives and motivations need to be taken into consideration in the development of effective harm-reduction social marketing programmes.

INTRODUCTION

Since 2001, results from the Australian National Drug Strategy Household Surveys have shown an increase in the frequency of dangerous drinking by young people aged between 20 and 29 years (AIHW 2005); with weekly dangerous drinking among young people rising from 14.6 per cent to 17.4 per cent between 2001 and 2004. Young people are also more likely than any other age group to drink dangerously on both a weekly and monthly basis (AIHW 2005; 2002). In regards to gender differences in alcohol consumption, Chikritzhs and colleagues (2003) have found that a higher percentage of young females are consuming alcohol dangerously compared to their male peers.

There have been several studies in Australia which have surveyed the patterns of alcohol consumption among university students, all of which suggest that a high percentage of this population are drinking dangerously. Johnston and White (2004) surveyed female students (only) and found that 48 per cent (n=52) of their sample drank dangerously. Davey, Davey and Obst (2002) reported 59 per cent (n=126) of their sample population to drink dangerously and found no difference between male and female drinking rates, which indicates that female university students are drinking at dangerous levels in relation to their body weight. Roche and Watt’s study (1999) found that 43 per cent (n= 40) of female respondents aged between 17 and 19 years and 53 per cent of those aged between 20 and 22 years, usually consumed more than five drinks when they drank alcohol. On average 44 per cent of female students in their sample were at risk of alcohol related harm. Finally, the New South Wales University Drug and Alcohol Survey (NSW Health 2001) which had the highest number of respondents from several universities (including 977 females) reported 49
per cent of all participants had consumed more than five drinks within the previous two weeks of completing the survey. These studies have all indicated that female respondents were placing themselves, at least, at a medium risk of short term alcohol-related harm.

While the small number of Australian studies conducted to date makes it difficult to conclusively assess national student drinking patterns, extensive research has been conducted in America, demonstrating similar findings. Higher rates of binge drinking (the term used in these studies to define dangerous drinking) among undergraduate college students have been reported in several nation-wide surveys (O'Malley and Johnston 2002; Wechsler et al. 1998). Their results support the evidence produced within the Australian context that alcohol plays a major role in university lifestyle and many students are drinking dangerously. However, Davey et al. (2002, 26) highlight the need for more Australian based research to contribute to more culturally-specific data: ‘It is important to have accurate Australian based data because extrapolation across cultural settings requires an understanding of cultural differences such as the legal drinking age.’

Alcohol Related Harm

Consequences of dangerous drinking include violence, unprotected sex, alcohol poisoning, vehicle and pedestrian related accidents, injury (due to alcohol induced violence), disease and trauma, and even death (Australian Government Department of Health and Ageing 2006; Hingson et al. 2005). While the alcohol-related harm experienced by university students seems to be gaining media attention (e.g. Roginski 2006), only one study has identified and measured the prevalence of such harm experienced by a sample of this population. The New South Wales University Drug and Alcohol Survey (NSW Health 2001) reported that out of 1560 students (977 of who were female) nearly 20 per cent had been hurt or injured, nearly 9 per cent had been taken advantage of sexually, and 53 per cent had experienced nausea or vomiting as a result of alcohol consumption. Other severe risk factors reported by students included driving while under the influence of alcohol (nearly 17 per cent), involved in arguments or fights (23 per cent) and experiencing a hangover (64 per cent).

Despite a limited amount of data available in Australia to assess the prevalence of alcohol related harm experienced by university students, results from the NSW Health University Drug and Alcohol survey mirrors the evidence provided by American Studies (Wechsler et al. 1998, 1997; Hingson et al. 2002; Abbey 2002). The drinking culture which is obviously embedded into the university lifestyle and the number of harms experienced by students as a consequence warrants the need for more Australian based research. Such research should include investigation into student skills in reducing the risk of short term harm, whether by minimising the risk or reducing the amount of alcohol consumed.

Reducing alcohol-related harm among university students

Most interventions which specifically address alcohol consumption among Australian university students are awareness or education based initiatives. The main objectives of these interventions were to increase awareness of the risks associated with dangerous drinking and consequently reduce the overall consumption of alcohol among students. They include a variety of methods such as training workshops for university bar staff, free screening interventions for risky drinkers and promotional materials such as newsletters, small publications and poster promotions. Such programmes have highlighted the potential of campaigns to reach a large number of students; however evaluation of their impact is limited. Interventions only appear to be effective in raising awareness in combination with other activities such as those educational workshops included within the Tertiary Alcohol Project (Wylde and Crawford 2004). These activities included free health checks and practical drug education tools such as ‘beer goggles.’

Qualitative evaluations by Ricciardellie and McCabe (2007) of one such promotional campaign (highlighting that student peers are ‘over’ drinking) has shown that despite many students (53 per cent, n=355) feeling the campaign was relevant, a quarter of their sample (n=173) believed the campaign would have a limited impact on drinking behaviours. While the students seemed to correctly interpret the messages of the campaign (e.g. ‘Go out, get blind. Your friends are over it, aren’t you’), there is minimal indication that they believed those messages as a result of seeing the promotions. In addition, while a quarter of the sample felt the campaign was an important way of pointing out the harms of drinking; it is difficult to determine whether students participated in behaviours to avoid those harms, and whether or not those behaviours involved reducing consumption.

Consequently, awareness programmes may not be appropriate, particularly if the evidence shows students are drinking at excessive levels, which suggests that students are expecting and accepting certain consequences to occur. For instance, The South Australian University project: It can ruin your whole Sunday, aimed to increase awareness among female students of the consequences of excessive drinking (Young Women Christian Association 2007). However, as Martens and authors (2004) argue, because dangerous drinking is a ‘contextual product’ of university the lifestyle it will occur regardless of awareness and educational interventions. Therefore, efforts to teach college students ways to protect themselves from negative consequences when they consume alcohol are warranted, (Martens et al 2004, 390).

What strategies are recommended to reduce the risk of alcohol-related harm?

There are several recommendations made by the Australian Department of Health and Ageing (2006) to minimise the risk of harm associated with drinking alcohol. For young people (18 to 25 years), the
recommendations are:
- Not to drink beyond the levels in Guideline one (described section one);
- Not to drink at all for at least several hours before you undertake potentially risky activities (for example driving, swimming)
- Not to mix alcohol with mood altering drugs
- Alternate alcoholic and non-alcoholic drinks
- Choose low alcohol drinks
- Eat while drinking
- Stay with friends rather than driving

Other sources which recommend alcohol-related protective behaviour which are likely to be accepted by young women include advice in women’s magazines. One article in a popular young women’s magazine (Rew 2005, 260) included the following suggestions for readers who intend on drinking a lot:

Drink two litres of water before going out; take Vitamin B the next morning; put a glass of diluted juice next to your bed for a dry mouth; if you’ve got a big night coming up, stay alcohol free the day before.

The nature of such behaviours does not seem to emphasise those suggested by the NHMRC guidelines. While abstaining from alcohol is recommended in the article, it is done so as a precautionary behaviour when the intention is to drink dangerously at a later date. Nor, does the NHMRC suggest coping mechanisms such as natural supplements to reduce the effects of a hangover after drinking alcohol in excessive amounts. The nature of these recommendations in a popular women’s magazine seems more in response to reducing the expected effects (such as a hangover), rather than protecting the drinker from (for example) drink-driving or sexual harassment. The differences in how protection against alcohol related harm is recommended within these two very different sources warrant further investigation into how young female drinkers are personally addressing the issue of alcohol related harm.

What harm minimising strategies are students using?

There is little research which examines the personal harm minimising strategies employed by Australian university students within the drinking environment. However one study which examined alcohol-related knowledge among tertiary (TAFE) and university students found that a significant proportion of students believed that vomiting and eating could lower the body’s blood alcohol limit (BAC) (Dowling, Clark and Corney 2006). The lower the BAC, the less chance of alcohol induced consequences experienced by the drinker. While eating is an important part of safe drinking (as noted in the guidelines) vomiting is not a recommended strategy of lowering the blood alcohol limit and reducing the risk of alcohol-related consequence. Therefore, it is possible that students are utilising strategies they perceive to be effective in reducing the consequences of alcohol, but are not recommended by health professionals. Similar beliefs were found by Jorgensen and authors (2006, 557) via participant observation among a group of Danish teenagers while they were drinking alcohol. Their results reported one teenager suggesting they ride a bike in order to ‘get the booze out of their bodies’. Such efforts to reduce the effects of alcohol can further increase the risk of alcohol related harm (e.g. injury). The same study revealed through that while teenage drinkers intend on reducing consumption once they feel intoxicated, efforts to do so often fail.

To further substantiate argument by Martens and authors (2004) - that promoting individual harm reduction is the best approach to university drinking - it should firstly be identified what strategies students engage in currently, and which ones they feel are the most effective in reducing alcohol related consequence or effects. This understanding is expected to provide an opportunity for future social marketing campaigns to identify behaviours that students would feel most useful – and most achievable – in protecting themselves against alcohol related harm or reducing their alcohol consumption.

Protective Behavioural Strategies – a new approach?

There is a substantial amount of evidence that young people are engaging in personal harm minimising strategies, even when they understand that there are health risks associated with the behaviour they chose to engage in (Jorgensen et al. 2006; Haines, Barker and Rice 2006; Martens et al. 2005; Benton et al. 2004). At the university level these strategies have been defined as Protective Behavioural Strategies (PBS) and are described as those harm minimising activities which students engage in within the drinking environment. These strategies (which include using a designated driver, taking a limited amount of money out, drinking a set number of drinks etc) are expected to either eliminate or reduce the risk of alcohol-related consequences and may or may not reduce the amount of alcohol consumed (Haines et al. 2006; Martens et al. 2005; Delva et al. 2004).

To date, research on PBS has been within American universities and has been quantitatively based. A number of researchers have used surveys to understand the extent to which students use PBS, and how they relate to the level of harm experienced while drinking (Haines et al. 2006; Martens et al. 2004; Benton et al. 2004; Devla et al. 2004). Most of these studies ask students to indicate the degree to which they use certain protective behaviours when ‘using alcohol or partying.’ This question is followed by a scale, ranging from three to five points of use (e.g. sometimes; usually; always or, rarely; occasionally; sometimes; usually; continued...
always). However, Benton and authors (2004) asked participants to indicate the strategies used the 'last time they partied' which may not be indicative of their usual behaviour.

There is a general consensus among these studies that the use of protective behavioural strategies is positively related to a reduction in the number of alcohol-related harms the student drinker experiences. Of particular significance is a study by Haines et al (2006) which analysed data from nearly twenty thousand students via the American College Health Association's National College Health Assessment Survey. Their analyses concluded that 78 per cent of student drinkers regularly engage in at least one protective strategy whilst drinking and that combining several of those strategies has an additive effect on reducing harm. Other studies by Benton et al (2004), Delva et al (2004) and Martens et al (2004) found similar results. Benton et al (2004) also concluded that women were more likely to engage in protective behaviours. These findings give light to a promising area of research in regards to addressing dangerous drinking and alcohol-related harm among female university students.

Despite these encouraging findings, however, there is little qualitative research into the use of protective behavioural strategies. The absence of such research is limiting in two ways. Firstly, the use of PBS within the student population is a relatively new area of research and thus, identifying their use should include asking students themselves as well as searching the literature. However, some studies on PBS so far have not indicated that a formal process of this kind was used to identify strategies used by students. For instance, six graduate students were asked to assess a pool of items, identified from the literature, for the development of the Protective Behavioural Strategies Survey (Martens et al. 2005). While the literature is expected to provide a substantial number of strategies that could potentially reduce the level of harm caused by university drinking, current students were not formally asked if there were any other strategies which are used for the same purpose. Therefore, without qualitative data that has been formally collected and analysed for the purpose of survey design, certain strategies used by students may be overlooked and thus, not tested with regard to protection against alcohol-related harm.

Secondly, qualitative analysis is expected provide the opportunity for understanding some of the student attitudes regarding the use of PBS such as why they are employed in the beginning and why some a deemed more effective than others. In addition qualitative research would provide further information regarding the reasons why a student may not implement protective behavioural strategies.

The aim of this study was to investigate the use of protective behavioural strategies and strategies to avoid drinking among female undergraduate university students, specifically to investigate:

- Strategies used by the target population to prevent them from drinking alcohol when planning to be within a drinking environment;
- Strategies used to prevent feeling the effects (e.g., feeling tipsy) and consequences (e.g., being unable to drive legally) of alcohol when there is intention to drink;
- Strategies used to prevent the short term effects and consequences of alcohol, when there is intention to become drunk;
- Student perspectives regarding the use and effectiveness of protective behavioural strategies. This means understanding why students adopt these behaviours (motivations), what makes these behaviours effective (internal and external influences), and what are the perceived costs which may impact on their use or effectiveness.

**METHOD**

Qualitative research via the use of focus groups is a familiar tool within health research. They are often used to understand and identify the range of options to be included within a survey or questionnaire (Kruger and Casey 2000) which is why they were used to collect qualitative data within the current study. Furthermore, focus groups have been previously used to investigate alcohol-related behaviour by young people, including university students. Williams and colleagues (2004) used this method to investigate drinking attitudes which may predict dangerous drinking among American college students. In addition, Abrahamson (2003) used the same method to understand drinking attitudes of young men and women. Given the effectiveness of focus groups used within these studies, it was determined that this qualitative tool would be the most appropriate for the current study. While Hansen (2006) argues that single interviews within health research allow the researcher to capture more detail, the inherent social context in which drinking at university occurs warrants the use of focus groups for collecting qualitative data in this study. As stated by Liamputtong and Ezzy (2006) familiarity between focus groups participants reflects the context in which health-related decisions are made. These group settings provide an environment that is similar to the university drinking culture and also allowed participants the comfort of speaking within their usual peer circle. This allows for more interaction between participants which ultimately provides a deeper level of understanding (Liamputtong and Ezzy 2006). In addition, due to the limited knowledge about the use of avoidance and protective behavioural strategies in Australia, focus groups provided a suitable context for exploring this new area of research.

**Ethics and Participant Recruitment**

Ethical clearance was given by the University's Human Research Ethics Committee to recruit participants and run focus groups on the university grounds. Participants of the focus groups were given an information sheet...
and a consent form to formally give their permission to be involved in the audio recorded discussions. Data from the focus groups were de-identified during transcription and analysis to ensure participant anonymity.

Participants were recruited via convenience sampling methods. Groups of female students congregating in the university’s popular meeting areas were personally approached and invited to participate in the study. If they confirmed they were undergraduate students, they were invited to attend the discussions and given a participant information sheet. Despite several interested participants, few were able to meet at similar times. To overcome this problem, a ‘snowballing effect’ (Streeton, Cooke and Campbell 2004) was implemented to recruit groups of students from a variety of faculties. This method has been used in a variety of drug and alcohol research projects (Abrahamson 2003; Coleman and Cater 2007) and it involves interviewing participants within their natural friendship groups. In this case, it also allowed for groups of participants from a variety of faculties to be recruited within an already established network of friends. As all participants were unknown to the facilitator, there was no potential for facilitator-participant relationship bias.

Discussion Guide

The discussion guide was developed according to the research objectives; and was pre-tested among a group of fellow students and research assistants for grammatical errors and use of appropriate syntax. In the beginning of each focus group, participants were asked to list and describe the advantages and disadvantages of drinking alcohol. The use of non-invasive and open ended questions in the beginning of the focus groups allowed the participants to ‘start thinking and talking about the topic’ (Kruger and Casey 2000, 12) and thus, become prepared to discuss more complex ideas later on in the discussions. These warm up questions were followed by a series of discussions regarding three fictional student profiles. Each profile was previously recorded in audio form and consisted of female undergraduate students describing their drinking intentions. These were recording using three different female voices provided by current students at the university. Table 1 on the following page, provides a transcript of each profile in accordance with the project objectives.

The use of fictional student recordings allowed participants greater opportunity to relate to each situation (as opposed to verbal or written descriptions stated by the facilitator). Participants are more likely to feel ‘relaxed’ when speaking about others (Rice and Ezzy 1999, 74) and thus fictional students gave participants the opportunity to speak about incidences in the third person context. Once participants listened to each recording, they were asked a series of questions regarding the use of protective behavioural strategies.

### Table 1: Student Profiles used in the Focus Group Discussions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Student Profile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To identify strategies used to avoid drinking alcohol within the drinking environment</td>
<td>‘Hey, my name’s Taren. I’m living on campus at the moment and I’m so loving first year uni. My favourite times are Wednesday nights at the Glass House, it’s awesome. Yeah, definitely going out this week, but I’m not drinking’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To identify PBS used when drinking alcohol but not enough to feel the effects (e.g. tipsy)</td>
<td>‘Hi, my name’s Madison and it’s my second year at uni and I live at home with my mum and my dad. My favourite place in the world at the moment is DEFINITELY North Gong Pub, I’ll be there Friday for sure – and I’m going to go and have a few drinks, but I’m going to avoid getting tipsy’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To identify PBS used to avoid consequences of drinking alcohol, when the intention is to get drunk</td>
<td>‘Yep, my name’s Kate, and I’m having a MASSIVE night this Thursday – end of exams, it should be an awesome night. I’m going to get SO drunk’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Analysis

Once the discussions were transcribed each document was analysed to identify:

- Strategies used by students who decide not to drink when planning to be within a drinking environment;
- Strategies used by students who decide to drink alcohol but not enough to feel the effects (e.g. not enough to feel ‘tipsy’);
- Strategies used by students who decide to drink alcohol with the intention of getting drunk, but also with the intention of avoiding the consequences of drinking that much alcohol.

Once these strategies were identified, transcripts were then analysed with the objective of investigating the student perspective of those strategies. The purpose of this analysis was to prepare preliminary investigations that could identify priority areas, which may then be used in further qualitative research which aims to develop a deeper level of understanding. As Kruger and Casey (2000) state, analysis of focus group data must be systematic; therefore, the following questions were used to develop a basic framework through which the focus group transcripts could be examined with consistency:

1. What are the reasons students may wish to use protective behavioural strategies, or, why do students choose to: a) not drink within a drinking environment; limit the effects of alcohol when deciding to drink; or decide to drink in order to feel the effects yet adopt strategies to avoid the consequences?

continued...
2. What strategies are considered the most or least effective by the participants and why?

3. What factors influence the effectiveness of a protective behavioural strategy?

Once the protective behavioural strategy was identified, the participants’ perspective was investigated by examining their reasons for using the strategy and the factors that may influence whether or not the strategy is effective.

RESULTS

The average age of participants (n=12) was 20 years and all had been at university for at least two years. Group One (n=5) consisted of students enrolled in a population health classes, Group Two (n=3) consisted of students enrolled in engineering, and Group Three (n=4) consisted of students enrolled in creative arts. Eight of the twelve participants reported consuming alcohol at least weekly. Half of these students (n=6) drank once a week. The maximum number of days per week any participant consumed alcohol was six days (n=1). The most common number of drinks consumed was seven to eight (n=4). The second most common was three to four drinks (n=3) and the remaining five participants were spread evenly across none, one, two, five to six and nine to twelve drinks. No participant indicated they consumed more than 13 drinks on a typical Friday or Saturday night. The maximum number of drinks consumed by any participant on one occasion in the past year was thirteen or more. This was the most common response, indicated by half of the participants (n=6). The rest of responses were distributed almost evenly over the remaining consumption quantities.

During the warm up discussion, participants were asked to list reasons why university students drink alcohol. The most commonly mentioned reasons were: to be sociable; to be socially accepted; to relax; to celebrate; and to escape or drown sorrows. Participants were then asked to list the things about alcohol that students may wish to avoid or prevent. The most common responses were: losing control; getting hurt/falling over; hangovers; feeling guilty; and the risk of drink spiking.

Protective Behavioural Strategies

Strategies to avoid alcohol within the drinking environment

Participants then listened to the first audio recorded student interview (Taren – who had decided not to drink alcohol within the drinking environment); and were asked to list the possible reasons as to why Taren had decided not to drink. Across all groups, the most likely reason that Taren had decided not to drink was because she had driven to the event. When participants were prompted as to why Taren had driven to the event, further analysis revealed that she has most likely driven in order reduce the pressure or ‘hassle’ she is expected to face (for not drinking) and prevent herself being forced into drinking.

Other suggestions included lack of money, serious health problems or religious reasons and due to exams or class on the following day. Several participants in group one also stated that she was not drinking on this occasion because she is drunk all the time and thinks ‘oh I’m not going to do this again (participant 2) or that she was planning a big weekend and might be planning a quiet week (participant 3).

When asked if Taren would find it easy or difficult to refrain from drinking during her night out, it was quickly established across all groups that she would find this extremely difficult. This was largely due to number of people who were likely to be drinking at the event.

‘It depends on the people she’s with if they’re not drinking, you’ll be fine but if everyone else around her is drunk then probably not.’ (participant 5, group 1)

‘Not if everyone else around her is drinking’ (participant 3, group 3)

Participants were then asked how Taren could avoid drinking and overcome the difficulty she was expected to face. Consequently those strategies suggested by the participants were not necessarily to avoid alcohol per se, but instead, used to avoid the pressure from others who were drinking. Driving was considered the most effective strategy, yet participants struggled to list others. When asked why driving was the primary strategy for avoiding alcohol, there was a strong indication (all participants agreed) this would significantly reduce the amount of pressure placed onto Taren by her peers. Participants indicated that driving was a ‘way out’ or ‘the number one’ strategy if a student had to work or had an assignment due the next day. It appeared that driving to the event was a stronger excuse for not drinking, as opposed to (for example) having an assignment due the next day. One participant also suggested why pressure to drink would be reduced on the driver by explaining that the risk of losing one’s licence due to a raised blood alcohol limit is not worth taking. Most participants had indicated they regularly use this strategy.

‘I just use the strategy that I’m driving, so I can’t drink’ (participant 2, Group 2)

‘Yeah, saying I’m driving tonight’ (participant 3, Group 1)

Despite driving being overwhelmingly accepted by participants as the most effective strategy for Taren, they were further probed for more strategies which she could use. Strategies mentioned by the participants included drink energy drinks, take other drugs and always have a glass in your hand. These suggestions were indicative of the importance, given to remaining within the drinking circle, as described by several participants in regards to holding a non-alcoholic drink in your hand:

continued...
‘Yeah exactly, I’ve had great nights out just drinking water with ice with just a piece of lemon or lime in it and people always think its vodka or something’ (participant 4, group 3)

‘If you have a glass in your hand, people are less likely to ask questions’ (participant 3, group 3)

Participants also indicated that the level of difficulty Taren would expect to face when refraining from drinking would be partly influenced by the ‘type’ of friends she was with or by her previous drinking behaviours. Friends who are pushy were more likely to put pressure on Taren than those who are careless of the fact she has chosen not to drink:

‘Some friends are pushy and other friends are like ‘whatever” (participant 3, group 2)

If Taren usually consumed alcohol with her friends, this was also seen to increase how much pressure she is likely to experience and consequently reduce the effectiveness of any strategy she used to avoid drinking.

‘If she normally does drink, on occasion as well then just decides not to one night then it might be like you know ‘why aren’t you drinking?, I’m going to go buy you one’ (participant 2, group 3)

The majority of participants agreed that, despite intentions not to drink and agreeing that there are strategies to overcome peer pressure, the non-drinker may still reach a point where she must decide to drink alcohol, or go home once her peers become drunk and annoying. Non-drinkers are expected to reach this decision point because of several factors including:

• Feeling excluded from the drinking peers:

‘It’ll make it hard because in a way maybe because you’re out drinking, you get tired if you’re not drinking, like you’re feeling excluded sometimes cause you’re just sitting there, you’re not up on the dance floor acting like an idiot. (participant 4, group 1)

• Attitudes towards peers who are drunk:

‘It’s really frustrating like some drunks annoy me and I can’t handle them when I’m sober. Like when I’m drunk I just fob them off but when I’m not I’m like you’re really annoying me’ (participant 2, group 2) and,

• Giving into the pressure to drink:

‘So then you’ve got a couple of your mates saying ‘oh I’ll buy you one, I’ll buy you one,’ and then you kind of just fall into the pressure to have one, you know ‘I’ll have one’” (participant 2, group 3)

Strategies to avoid feeling the effects of alcohol, when the decision has been made to drink

Participants were then asked to listen to the second student recording (Madison) who had decided to drink, but not enough to feel ‘tipsy.’ When asked if Madison would find this difficult, there was all participants suggested that it would be very difficult to limit one’s drinking when in a drinking environment. In addition, several participants recalled their own, failed attempts to do so. Two participants also stated it would more difficult for a student to limit the amount of alcohol consumed than to avoid drinking entirely.

‘No. I think if you start drinking you don’t really have a chance (participant 3, group 3).

There was a strong indication from all groups that the most likely reason that Madison had chosen to limit her consumption was to fit in with her peers or be social. One student (participant 2, group 2) suggested that this was due to feeling ‘awkward’ without a drink in your hand. Another referred to the feeling of exclusion because everyone else is drinking (participant 4, group 1). Peers were (again) considered a major influence of whether or not a student can refrain from drinking a limited amount of alcohol.

‘Well this isn’t necessarily to avoid drinking, but to avoid drinking to excess, people will go oh I’ll just have one glass of wine and it turns into like eight. When you’re out with a certain group people that doesn’t work’ (participant 1, group 3)

When asked what strategies may be used to help Madison limit her drinking, the majority of participants indicated that alternating between alcoholic and non-alcoholic drinks or slowing down her drinking were the most effective ways of avoiding drinking to excess. Some participants also suggested avoiding drinks with more than a standard shot of alcohol (such as ‘Pulses’ or ‘Smirnoff Blacks’) would help. When queried what type of drinks only included one standard drink, one student (participant 1, group 1) replied like a wine or spirit, and another (participant 2, group1) elaborated, mixed with orange juice. Other suggestions included avoiding shots, eating before the event and avoiding drinking alcohol that you normally would not.

There were several factors described by participants which would make it difficult for Madison to limit her consumption to only a few drinks. These factors included her physical make up, the type of residence in which she lived, her year at university and the type of drinking environment she was in.

One participant indicated that even one drink can cause her to feel tipsy. Thus, it is difficult for females to avoid feeling tipsy even if they only consume one drink. Another participant stated that either Madison had the ‘natural trigger’ to stop or she doesn’t:

‘Na, some people don’t have that trigger. Like my mum was telling me she never had that trigger to say stop drinking. Like, I do. I can stop myself very easy but some people can’t, they just don’t know when to stop. So it’s hard for them’ (participant 2, group 2). continued...
Whilst one group indicated that a student’s first year at university was likely to impact on her capacity to limit drinking, most of the participants agreed that if a student was in her first year of university, this would make it difficult to limit consumption as students are likely to drink more in their first year of study. However, this perception seemed contradictory of their own drinking behaviours as all participants were second and third year students and usually consumed at dangerous levels (more than four drinks). Despite one participant (participant 4, group 1) indicating that as students progress throughout university and they realise how ‘wrong’ and ‘dodgy’ the drinking behaviours are, the drinking patterns of these same participants seemed contradictory. None of the participants clarified that now they consumed less alcohol now, than during their first year at university.

The characteristics of the environment and the venue in which the drinking was held was also considered an influencing factor on Madison’s ability to avoid getting tipsy. One participant described the differences between a Friday and Sunday event and how each may reduce or increase Madison’s chances of achieving her objective:

‘It depends like she said she was going to have them at North Gong on a Friday, which is like there’s music and dancing and the Friday night going out to party crowd. Like if it was a Sunday afternoon and going to lunch that turns into the evening you could easily have maybe three over a few hours and not necessarily feel tipsy, and leave it at that. But if you’re drinking fast because you’re dancing and you get thirsty and you’re hot and you’ve got people buying you drinks than I think it’s much more difficult’ (participant 4, group 3).

**Strategies used to avoid the consequences of being drunk**

Participants then listened to the final student recording (Kate – a university student who has decided to get drunk). When asked to list strategies to avoid the consequences of being drunk, most referred back to the list created earlier on in the discussions. The strategies listed by participants were specifically dependent on the type of consequence or harm a student may wish to avoid. In addition, those harms, listed by the participants in the warm up discussions, reflected their concern for what the perceived were the most dangerous consequences of drinking. Of these, drink spiking and sexual advances from ‘predators’ were the consequences participants seemed most likely to wish to avoid. Participants in group three were particularly aware that drink spiking was common in the area, and that being drunk immediately places a student at risk of danger or being unaware of those dangers:

‘And you don’t want to get into the position where you don’t have control about how you’re getting home or not know what you’re doing’ (participant 3, group 1).

The most common suggestion to avoid the consequences of being drunk was to remain with a group of friends and to hold onto your drinks. Watching your drink, particularly if it was being purchased for you, was also a common strategy. It was evident that the drinking behaviours of some participants did not allow for the drinker to avoid harm herself, due to amount which they had consumed:

‘Yeah you’re like… I found that in the morning I’ll wake up and go ‘how did I get home again? … that’s what it’s like, if you have a massive one, well that’s me if I’ve had a massive night drinking….like I’m trying to catch up and the next minute I’m at home in bed and I’ll wake up and go ‘oh my god’ why do I do this? How did I get home? Who dropped me home? Who was I with? Did we go to Castro’s?’ (participant 3, group 1)

It was understood that if students were planning to get drunk, friends or others who are watching out for you became the most effective strategy to avoid any immediate harm.

There was a sense of acceptance among the groups that such consequences were inevitable when the intention is to get drunk, thus, referred back to the importance of friends when drinking to get drunk.

‘I think she’s already decided that that’s what she’s heading for (participant 3, Group 3)

‘But if she had someone responsible with her then they can after a while if they see anything say ‘hey listen here’ (participant 2, Group 3).

In addition, participants in Group One had indicated that there were a variety of medication and other substances that could be used to cope with those harms of a less serious nature. These included nausea and vomiting or the overall seedy feeling usually experienced the following day. These participants also seemed more open in regards to recalling bad experiences as a result of excessive drinking. It was simply accepted that if the decision was made to drink excessively, it was a matter of using whatever is available to reduce the after effects. These included both prescription and non-prescription drugs such as Panadol, Maxolon (prescription only, used to treat nausea) and Travel Calm (an over the counter, car sickness tablet). These medications were used to cope with, or reduce, vomiting and nausea and sometimes used as a preventative technique before the student went to bed on the night of drinking. Vitamin supplements, however, were more likely to be used in the morning as an energy boost (participant 2, group 1).

Despite the wide variety of substances used by participants to cope with the effects of being drunk, one participant indicated that such behaviour was not a planned strategy, but was merely a result of having the products available at home, at the time. Interestingly, this participant had previously suggested the more unusual products to cope with a hangover (such as Travel Calm and Maxolon). It was concluded that because participants do not deliberately purchase products for these reasons, this forces them to take from what is available, and whichever product to be perceived to alleviate the effects most:

continued...
‘...so like I don’t think ‘wait I’m going to be really hung-over tomorrow so I’m going to go to the cupboard and get three Panadol, and have it...’ (participant 4, Group 1).

Participants from Group 3 also recalled other students forcing themselves to vomit which is expected to reduce any chance of having to go home from extreme intoxication. This strategy was also used to lessen the effects of a hangover the following day or so they can continue drinking on the night:

‘Some people I know actually throw up because it makes them feel better, like, even if they don’t have too they’ll like make themselves throw up before they go to bed so they don’t... I’ve got friends that have what’s termed a ‘sneaky spew’ while they’re out and then they keep on drinking’ (participant 1, Group 3)

However all participants in the same group had negative attitudes towards this strategy. No participant indicated they had previously done this and also described the behaviour as other students’ way of doing it.

**DISCUSSION**

Strategies used by students to prevent them from drinking when planning to be in a drinking environment

Strategies to avoid alcohol consumption have not yet been identified among university students who usually consume alcohol. Simon, Kravets and Jones (2004) did interview several regular abstainers but the results of that study and current study’s findings with occasional abstainers are very different. Only one strategy was identified in both studies (hold a non-alcoholic drink in your hand). This suggests that regular abstainers have less to offer to those situational abstainers in regards to strategies to avoid drinking. Therefore those strategies identified in the current study are useful as preliminary findings for further research into how occasional abstinence can be effectively achieved.

The focus group discussions demonstrated that there are a limited number of effective strategies used by students who wish to avoid alcohol within the drinking environment. It was also suggested that trying to do so would be extremely difficult because they are likely to experience the pressure to drink from her peers, or feel excluded from others who are drinking.

While most reported drinking at dangerous levels when they do decide to drink, there is evidence that students also wish to abstain on occasion for various reasons (e.g. exams). Yet, according to focus group participants, situational abstinence is not an effective protective behaviour (alcohol related harm) because it does not allow the student to remain in the drinking circle. Without some additional strategies to help, students are likely to receive pressure or feel excluded from peers. Therefore, even though situational abstinence is regarded (by Haines et al. 2006) as a protective strategy against alcohol related harm, students still require additional strategies to help them implement this behaviour. As identified by Shanahan et al (2002), strategies to avoid drinking may be referred to as ‘coping’ techniques. These are used in response to the potential loss of acceptance in choosing not to drink among peers.

When probed, focus group participants revealed a list of strategies that could be used to reduce the risk of isolation and peer-pressure in regards to drinking. Of these strategies, that perceived to be the most effective is to drive to an event or say you are driving. This strategy is likely to deter the pressure from others to drink and is also the most likely reason for which a student has decided not to drink. This implies that many students, who use situational abstinence, may be acting as the ‘designated driver’. This indeed has been considered worthy of promotion to reduce the rate of drinking driving accidents in a variety of campaigns. However, as Grube and Nygaard (2007) report, there is potential for this to encourage excessive drinking among the passenger students. If one student is protecting herself from pressure by offering a safe ride for peers, her passengers may be drinking more as a result.

However, some students recalled occasions where they have intended to abstain yet ended up drinking anyway. Failed attempts are not uncommon, as noted by several participants in Shanahan et al (2002, 38)’s focus groups, including one who used driving as the avoidance strategy: I always say I’m not going to drink, I’ll drive’ but I end up leaving my car. These reported ‘failed attempts’ are indicative of the lack of strategies available to help students respond effectively to social pressure.

Johnson and Cohen (2004) suggested that investigation into the behaviours of non-drinking students might provide reasons that can be normalised among the student population. However, there is limited evidence from this study that warrants such an approach. Firstly, if a student has never consumed alcohol, it was expected that she would not attract as much peer pressure or response in her decision not to drink. However, if a drinking student ‘suddenly’ decides to abstain on occasion, it is likely she would be made to justify her decision to her peers. Therefore, these respondents are likely to have received more pressure than the regular non-drinking students.

Secondly, some of the suggestions made by the focus group participants as to reasons why a student would abstain, are not worthy of promotion. For instance, suggesting they are taking a break from drinking or saving up for a big weekend may encourage or justify dangerous consumption at a later date. This is reinforced by the results of this study suggesting students often do decide to occasionally abstain, yet find it challenging (and often fail) due to peer pressure and the feelings of social exclusion. It is evident that students prefer strategies that keep them within the social circle, rather than those which directly eliminate or reduce the risk of experiencing alcohol related harm per se. Therefore, despite some students wishing to abstain on...
occassion, promoting situational abstinence may be unsuccessful if students use this as justification for heavy drinking on a different occasion, and considering that refraining from alcohol is expected to remove them from the peer circle.

It is also possible that some students may find it easier to refrain from drinking and do not ‘need’ such strategies. Further research of the same nature (that is, qualitative data collection) may capture a wider variety of avoidance behaviours used by students. It is suggested that such research should remain focused on the ‘situational abstainer’ rather than the regular non-drinking student. The differences in their reasons for not drinking, and the level of difficulty they face in their decision, appear quite distinct.

Protective behavioural strategies used by female students who intend on drinking alcohol, yet not enough to feel any effects (e.g. tipsy).

The list of strategies to limit consumption (in order to prevent feeling ‘tipsy’) compiled in the focus groups were, on the whole, very similar to those identified in the literature (Benton et al. 2006, Haines et al. 2006; Martens et al. 2004). Comparatively, the strategies that were not identified in the literature yet captured in these results largely related to choice of drinks being consumed. For example, several students stated that avoiding double strength or pre mixed drinking would help a student refrain from drinking. These results suggest that other protective behavioural studies have included appropriate measures in regards to the drinking student who wishes to limit her consumption. However, there are some within the literature that have not appeared in the findings of the current study, such as ‘counting the number of drinks,’ or ‘stop drinking one to two hours before you leave the event’ (Martens et al. 2004). The lack of probing in regards to these strategies may have contributed to them not being reported by these participants. However, it may also imply that the small sample size is not entirely conclusive of the variety of strategies potentially used by other students to limit consumption. However, this suggestion remains inconclusive as all three groups did not mention these strategies.

Students are likely to drink a limited amount of alcohol to ‘fit in’ or ‘be social’ particularly when they have decided to limit their consumption. This implies that protective behavioural strategies used by students who wish to limit consumption are perceived to help them feel accepted within the drinking circle, rather than to avoid harm. Interestingly, it was implied by several students that it is harder to stop drinking, than it is not to drink at all. If students are substituting abstinence for a few drinks, it is likely they are doing so to fit into the peer group, thus, limiting consumption is itself a protection against social influence – not alcohol-related harm. Only one participant had suggested that a student might drink only a few because she ‘actually’ might enjoy it yet her sarcastic tone implied that this was unlikely. Therefore, the results indicate that students may drinking a limited amount of alcohol (yet end up drinking more) as an attempt to fit in with the drinking circle.

The concept of failed attempts was revisited by the participants in their discussion of strategies used to help a student limit their alcohol consumption and refrain from drinking excessively.

‘…I don’t drink to get pissed now, I drink and end up pissed. I have to work in the morning but it often doesn’t stop me and I get home and go. Oh that’s going to be trouble’.

While increasing awareness of the dangers of drinking is warranted, university students seem to be already aware of these consequences. The current study also finds many students wanting to limit their drinking on occasion yet find this extremely difficult. These results of the current study reiterate those in similar studies, and confirm the need for further investigation into how young people can be trained in refusal skills and peer-pressure defence specifically in regards to the alcohol environment.

Protective behavioural strategies used by female students who intend on getting drunk, but wish to avoid the consequences of doing so.

Pertaining to the intention of getting drunk, however, fewer focus group participants indicated they engage in such behaviours when they are drinking. This sheds light on the previous studies which have examined the use of protective behavioural strategies (Martens et al. 2004, Haines et al. 2006; Benton et al. 2006). Within some of these studies, respondents were asked to indicate their use of strategies when they ‘use alcohol’ or ‘when they are partying.’ According to these results, their findings may be only applicable to students who have only decided to ‘use alcohol’ not when they are intentionally getting drunk or ‘partying.’

It may be likely that protective behavioural strategies are not useful when encouraging those students who are most at risk, to avoid alcohol related harm According to the participants in this study, only general safety precautions are perceived effective when the decision has been made to get drunk and of these, the friends offer greatest protection. Compared to the previous drinking contexts, peers have moved from a problem to a solution. Yet this may not be the most appropriate strategy if the majority of drinker’s peers are also drinking and most likely, drinking dangerously. This questions whether or not there are any peers within the drinker’s circle who are capable of ‘watching out’ for the safety of others and these participants, have indicated that heavy drinking students do not take action to reduce the risk of harm which is less serious to their health (e.g. hangover).

It appears that the student perspective on protection against alcohol related harm is not directly related to harm per se. For instance, strategies which have the potential to protect against alcohol related harm are continued...
only considered effective by students, if those strategies keep the student included within the drinking circle or help defend them against the pressure from that circle to drink. Therefore, students may be more concerned about the social aspects of drinking than the potential for experiencing alcohol-related harm.

Survey results by Benton et al (2004) have indicated that students seem more likely to adopt protective behavioural strategies (such as alternating drinks and avoiding drinking games) when they have already decided to limit the amount of alcohol they consume. These results and those from the current study must be taken into consideration when viewing PBS as a promising approach to university alcohol misuse. They may imply that students, who are at the highest risk of alcohol-related harm, are less likely to be strategic about reducing the risk of harm. In addition, it seems that those strategies which are promoted, must not have the potential to exclude the student from the peer/drinking circle, as they are likely to be perceived as useless.

Furthermore, it seems that students are trying to limit their consumption in attempt to balance between the wish to refrain from alcohol while still feeling included in the peer circle. The next step should be to further investigate protective behavioural strategies that are defensive against peer pressure, rather than alcohol-related harm per se. If students are drinking because they feel more accepted in the peer circle, then this is the core of the problem – rather than a focus only on alcohol related harm.

Limitations

Whilst the objectives of the study were addressed with appropriate methods, more qualitative data (that is, a greater number of focus groups) could potentially expand on the range of strategies identified by these participants. The decision not to run more focus groups was made in consideration of reaching data saturation in accordance with the project’s objectives and limited time-frame.

However, in combination with those identified in the literature, a comprehensive list of behavioural strategies was formed in regards to the three different drinking intentions; and the consistency of findings between the three groups supports the validity of these findings. A more comprehensive qualitative study that also includes a male sample is warranted in this area to elaborate on the use of PBS, and particularly students’ ability to defend against alcohol related peer pressure.

Conclusions

Due to evidence within the literature that shows that heavy drinkers make up the majority of student drinkers (and that students perceive this to be normal), social marketing campaigns which aim to address this issue using PBS appear to face two challenges. Firstly, students must be shifted into a new social norm of limited consumption, after which (according to this study) they would have a greater chance of being influenced by a campaign that aimed to encourage adoption of protective behavioural strategies.

Secondly, this study also indicates that students will adopt protective behavioural strategies which are more likely to keep them within the peer circle, as exclusion from this circle seems to be the main (perceived) cost in the decision to limit consumption or adopt protective behaviours. Therefore, when developing and promoting a genuine benefit for this population group, that is, protective behavioural strategies that students are likely to use and benefit from, care must be taken not to promote strategies that have the potential to exclude the student from the drinking circle.

References


continued...


Jorgensen, Morten Hulvej, Tine Curtis, Pia Haudrup Christensen and Morten Gronbaek (2006) ‘Harm minimisation among teenage drinkers: findings from an ethnographic study on teenage alcohol use in a rural Danish community,’ Addiction 102(4), 554-559


Household expenditure on alcohol in Australia: facts and trends

Dr Julian de Meyrick and Prof Farhat Yusuf
Business Department
Macquarie University
NSW 2109 Australia
e-mail: julian.demeyrick@mq.edu.au Telephone: 61 2 9850 7464

Abstract

Although alcohol consumption has been a familiar part of many cultures, the damage it is doing to communities is of increasing concern and social marketing campaigns to address the problem are needed. This paper examines demographic patterns in reported expenditure on alcohol among a large sample of Australian households and suggests that this might provide a useful segmentation variable when developing a social marketing campaign aimed at reducing expenditure on alcohol in Australia.

Alcohol expenditure is most likely and is having the greatest impact on household expenditure on all goods and services in households where the household head is a male, has a lower level of education and who has a lower social status occupation. Social marketing campaigns should be developed for testing with this segment in the first instance.

Introduction

In common with many countries, alcohol consumption has played a significant part in the social history of modern Australia. The supply of rum in the early colony was so regular and predictable, that for a short time, it replaced the currency as the medium of exchange. Excessive alcohol consumption was widespread in the time of Gold Rush in the 1850s and became closely associated with the tradition of ‘mateship’ among Australian males. A similar pattern has been observed in colonial and early independent America. Problems associated with excessive alcohol consumption were reported through Europe and Scandinavia. In Australia, the main voices criticising alcohol consumption came from the temperance and some religious movements and became associated with anti-social ‘wowers’ or spoil-sports. In the United States, moves to address alcohol consumption were associated with the unsuccessful Prohibition initiatives. As a consequence, concerted campaigns to address alcohol use in the community were much slower to develop than those addressing other risky behaviours such as tobacco smoking. Campaigns which have included alcohol, for example social marketing and legislative campaigns to reduce the prevalence of driving while under the influence of alcohol, is the driving behaviour that is the target, not the consumption of alcohol. More recently, there is increasing recognition that, while there are benefits from a light to moderate consumption of alcohol, they are outweighed by the costs to the community of excessive alcohol consumption. Initiatives to reduce alcohol consumption have been comparatively low-impact and broad-brush. For example, alcohol marketers include the exhortation ‘Consume alcohol in moderation’ in small print on labels and the National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) publish guidelines setting out ‘safe’ levels of alcohol consumption. None of these campaigns attempts to segment the target market as advised by marketing texts (e.g., Kerin et al, 2008) or social marketers such as Andreasen (2002 and 2006). The same message is used regardless of audience (it is the same message on all retail alcohol containers) and the guidelines differentiate between males and females but not on any other basis. Once target segments have been identified, appropriately tailored campaigns can be developed which are likely to be more effective than a standard, non-differentiated strategy aimed at all groups. This paper examines different demographic groups in reported household expenditure on alcohol to indicate potential higher-priority market segments for which appropriate alcohol campaigns could be developed.

Literature Review

Many studies have sought to determine the burden alcohol consumption places on the community (e.g., Konnopka and Konig, 2007; Patra et al, 2007; Rehm et al., 2003; Room et al, 2003) and there is general agreement that the burden is significant. Alcohol impacts on the community either directly by increasing the incidence of diseases such as liver (Gramenzi et al, 2006) or pancreas (Apte et al, 2006) or indirectly, as it impairs important cognitive and motor-skill functions, it increases the incidence and severity of motor vehicle accidents. Studies by Desapriya et al (2006) and Zaloshnja and Miller, (2006) estimate that if driving while under the influence of alcohol and driving without a seat-belt could be eliminated, it would save U.S. employers US$15.2 billion per annum in reduced health insurance and sick-leave payments and other trauma. Several studies reported that alcohol consumption was associated with half of the injuries treated in hospital emergency facilities (e.g., Salome et al, 2005; Tindale, 2007; Vinson, 2004). A study by Watt et al (2006) found that the relationship was less clear-cut but not as strong. On the other hand, Borges et al. (2006) found that the risk of injury increased even from quite low levels of alcohol consumption.

Andreasen (2006) places great emphasis on the need for social marketers to properly segment the target market ((Andreasen 2006) and many authors cite examples of different segmentation variables being employed in social marketing campaigns. Dawson (Dawson 1994) segmented the health care market mainly on demographic grounds, while (Moufakkar 2006) found different gaming behaviour in different age segments. Guidance on segmentation approaches are contained in the work of (McDonald and Dunbar 1998) and most current marketing and social marketing textbooks (see (Kotler, Adam et al. 2006) and (Kerin, McDonnell et al. 2008) for example). (Wright and Esslemont 1994) lists logical difficulties with the simplistic application of segmentation in place of other marketing strategy approaches. The choice of strategy should, in Wright’s opinion, empirically based. This paper seeks to identify a potential segmentation variable for use in developing a potential alcohol campaign. The next set would be to test this strategy against others.

Studies that have included demographic segmentation variables usually focus on the factors associated with unhealthy levels of consumption and alcohol dependence (e.g., (Degenhardt et al, 2005; Dilia et al, 2004; Gillespie et al, 2007; Jian Li and El-Guebaly, 2007) found demographic gradients in alcohol demand in Australian communities. Similarly Arvanitidou et al. (2007) found demographic gradients in alcohol...
consumption in a large group of metropolitan Greeks, including the finding that parents’ level of education was positively associated with alcohol consumption. A study by Soydemir and Bastida, (2006) also found a relationship between income and alcohol consumption. Green et al (2003) found differences in the reactions to alcohol-abuse prevention messages between different demographic groups. An electronic search of major databases did not reveal any other studies that examine demographic patterns in household expenditure on alcohol in the way that this paper does.

**Data and Methods**

The Household Expenditure Survey (HES) carried out by the Australian Bureau of Statistics in 2003-2004 was the main source of data for this study. In this survey, a household was defined as a person or group of people living together and having common provision for food and other essentials of living (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 2006). The scope of the survey included usual residents of private dwellings in Australia, except foreign diplomatic or defence force staff and people living in remote areas. The sample included 6,957 households throughout Australia. It was selected using a multistage, stratified probability sample design.

In each household a person, aged 15 or over was selected as the ‘reference person’, if they were the first sole person in the household to fulfill one of the following criteria applied: was a partner in a registered or de facto marriage, or a lone parent with dependent child(ren), or the person with the highest income or the eldest person. In this paper we have designated such reference persons as the ‘household head’.

Personal interviews were conducted in the selected households to obtain data on characteristics of households and their members, and various items of income and expenditure. In addition, identified spenders in the households were each issued with a diary to record expenditure on every item over the two week(s) period immediately after the interview. For the purposes of this research all households were divided into two groups: those reporting no expenditure on alcoholic drinks, and those who did spend part of the household budget on alcohol. It is this second group of households who are the focus of this study.

Odds ratios based on binary logistic regression models were calculated to study the impact of selected demographic and socio-economic correlates of alcohol buying behaviour. Categories with an odds ratio of 1 exactly were used as the ‘reference’ for comparison purposes.

**Findings**

Characteristics of households which purchased alcohol

In 2003-2004, of the estimated 7.74 million households in Australia, 58.4 percent incurred expenditure on alcoholic drinks; this proportion calculated by gender was 64.4 for male and 49.1 percent for female headed households respectively.

Figure 1 shows the percentage of households buying alcohol by age and gender of the household head. It appears that the male headed households, which accounted for over 60 percent of all households, had a significantly greater propensity to buy alcohol compared to their female counterparts in all age groups. In both genders, it is households with the head in the youngest age groups where the largest percentage of households reported expenditure on alcohol. In both groups, the percentage of households reporting expenditure on alcohol drops rapidly in the oldest age group.

![Fig 1: Percentage of households buying alcohol by age and gender of household head](image)

continued...
Table 1 shows the percentage distributions of all households and those who bought alcohol and odds ratios by selected characteristics of households and their heads. It is apparent from the table that the likelihood of reporting expenditure on alcohol is significantly lower among households with a head who has only achieved the lowest levels of education.

There is a clear gradient apparent among occupation groups. The likelihood of a household where the head is in a higher status occupation (Professionals and Managers) is twice that of a head in a lower status, Labourer, occupation group.

Households with a head who was born in a country where English is not the principal language is only half as likely to report alcohol expenditure than a household with an Australian-born head and almost one third as likely to report alcohol expenditure as a household with a head born in another, principally English-speaking country (mainly the UK, USA and New Zealand).

There is also a strong, consistent income gradient. Households with an income in the fifth (highest) income quintile are more than nine times as likely to spend money on alcohol as those in the first (lowest) income group.

Table 1: Percentage distributions of all households and those who bought alcohol and odds ratios by selected characteristics of households and their heads

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristic of households and their heads</th>
<th>per cent of households</th>
<th>per cent of all households which bought alcohol</th>
<th>Odds ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Educational qualification of head</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postgraduate</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>68.3</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduate</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>67.1</td>
<td>0.949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>66.1</td>
<td>0.907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>26.0</td>
<td>62.1</td>
<td>0.761</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No post-school</td>
<td>44.5</td>
<td>50.1</td>
<td>0.475</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Occupation of head</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>70.6</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators/managers</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>69.3</td>
<td>0.944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical/sales workers</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>63.4</td>
<td>0.724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradespersons</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>0.863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production workers</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>65.3</td>
<td>0.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labourers</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>54.6</td>
<td>0.502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not reported (inc. retired)</td>
<td>34.2</td>
<td>42.2</td>
<td>0.305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Country of birth of head</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>72.1</td>
<td>60.7</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mainly English-speaking countries</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>64.5</td>
<td>1.576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other countries</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>44.2</td>
<td>0.512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Income quintile of household</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>29.5</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>49.0</td>
<td>2.292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>63.9</td>
<td>4.223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>69.9</td>
<td>5.550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>79.7</td>
<td>9.389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Location of household</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New South Wales</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria</td>
<td>24.6</td>
<td>58.0</td>
<td>0.971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queensland</td>
<td>19.7</td>
<td>56.7</td>
<td>0.921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Australia</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>55.9</td>
<td>0.891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Australia</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>60.3</td>
<td>1.068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tasmania</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>60.7</td>
<td>1.083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT/NT2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>68.8</td>
<td>1.546</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital cities in six states</td>
<td>60.2</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other areas in six states</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>59.3</td>
<td>1.083</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1: Goods and Services 2: Australian Capital Territory/Northern Territory

There is no clear geographic effect with the exception that households in the two territories (ACT and NT) are significantly more likely to report alcohol expenditure than households in the States.

continued...
It appears that households living in the five capital cities (Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Perth and Adelaide) were marginally less likely to buy alcohol compared to those living in the non-metropolitan and rural areas.

Expenditure on alcohol

The 4.52 million households who reported expenditure on alcohol spent an average of $39.94 per week (or $9.41 billion annually) in 2003-2004. This represented 3.8 percent of their total expenditure on goods and services.

Figure 2 shows the average weekly expenditure on alcohol by the age and gender of the household head. It indicates that not only do a smaller percentage of households with a female head spend money on alcohol (Figure 1), those who do spend on alcohol spend less on average than households with a male head. As was shown in Figure 1, Figure 2 indicates that the amount spent on alcohol first decreases, then increases and then steadily decreases with increasing age group. The fluctuations in the middle ages are much more pronounced in Figure 2 than in Figure 1 but the gap between the genders in Figure 2 is much smaller than in Figure 1.

Table 2 shows the corresponding statistics by the selected characteristics of households. It appears that female headed households, on the average, spent less on alcohol and that this expenditure accounted for a much smaller proportion of their total expenditure on goods and services compared to the male headed households. While the older household heads (65+) spent substantially less on alcohol, it represented about the same proportion of their total expenditure as the younger and middle aged household heads.

Income quintiles had a very clear and consistent positive relationship with alcohol expenditure, which represented a much greater proportion of the total expenditure for the poorer households compared to those in the higher income groups.

While the relationship between educational qualifications and alcohol expenditure was not as clear cut as with income, household heads in the higher education categories spent a much smaller proportion of their income on alcohol. This is likely to be due to the positive association between income and education. In the HES, households where the heads had a degree or higher qualification had an average income which was 58 percent higher compared to those with no post-school education.

continued...
The average weekly alcohol expenditure was highest among the households where the head was an administrator/manager followed by tradespersons and labourers. The labourer and tradesperson households spent a much larger proportion of their total expenditure on alcohol compared to the administrator/manager category. This again could be, at least partly, due to the income differentials.

Migrant households from non-English speaking backgrounds spent substantially less on alcohol and this expenditure constituted a much smaller proportion of their total expenditure. While households located in the five capital cities spent more on alcohol, it accounted for a much smaller proportion of their total expenditure on goods and services.

**Conclusion**

This analysis suggests that demographic variables might be useful in segmenting the target market for a social marketing campaign aimed at reducing expenditure on alcohol in Australia.

The data indicates that expenditure on alcohol is having a different impact across different demographic segments in the Australian market. Households with a female head not only spend less on alcohol, they spend a smaller percentage of their...
total expenditure on goods and services on alcohol. This indicates that it is more important for a potential campaign to be salient and relevant for male-headed households. Income quintile is often a less useful segmentation variable because of the more egalitarian distribution of income across the Australian population. Similarly, level of education is not a strong differentiator, however the data indicates that the impact of alcohol expenditure is less at either extreme of the level of education scale, suggesting that a campaign would be efficient if it focused on the middle of the range and did not aim to be salient for the widely different groups at either end. The most important differentiator in this population is occupation and message strategies efficiently targeting these groups can be developed using audience and other research data readily available to marketers. The data examined here indicates that such a campaign could be effectively delivered in English, saving the need, at least in the first instance, for translation into other languages. Geographically, the campaign should include the more populous states but the NT should be included because of the greater impact of alcohol expenditure and the absence of a bias towards upper social status occupations that is found in the ACT.

The next steps for the social marketer should include testing of a campaign specifically tailored to of these target segments.

References

continued...
Lip service or socially responsible?

Sharyn Rundle-Thiele
Visiting Associate Professor (Marketing) University of Lethbridge
Associate Professor (Marketing), University of Southern Queensland

Background
Since the Rudd Government was elected in Australia in late 2007 alcohol has been placed on the Australian national agenda. The widely publicised ‘Alcopop Tax’ introduced in the May 2008 Federal Budget was claimed to be a direct Government measure designed to reduce demand for ready to drink spirits favoured by Australia’s youth who often drink to excess (termed binge drinking). At present the Australian Government is considering revising Australia’s drinking guidelines, effectively lowering the number of standard drinks recommended for Australian adults. The draft recommendations currently being considered by the Australian Government, recommend that men and women should drink two standard drinks or less in any one day (NHMRC, 2007). The Australian alcohol industry provides an ideal case in point to consider whether the concept of social responsibility is sufficient to achieve specific behavioural goals for a social good.

Following a stream of research (examples include Brown and Dacin, 1997; Drumwright, 1996; Luo and Bhattacharya, 2006; Maigian and Ferrell, 2001; Sen and Bhattacharya, 2001) promoting the advantages of being socially responsible corporations around the globe have embraced the management ideas of ‘social responsibility’ and ‘sustainability’. Corporate social responsibility refers to an organisations obligation to use their resources in ways that protect and benefit society, while ensuring they generate equitable and sustainable benefits for shareholders (Graafland & van de Ven, 2006; Mikkila, 2003).

The explosive growth in demand for corporate social responsibility has resulted in a marked increase in the number of groups supplying CSR ratings to investors and consumers (Marquez and Fombrun, 2005, p304). These ratings have now become so important that many large corporations now appoint in house specialists and teams to monitor and communicate their social responsiveness to sustainability initiatives. Fosters Group Limited, one key player in the Australian alcohol industry, is an Australian social responsibility leader recently receiving a Gold rating from Australia and New Zealand’s foremost corporate social responsibility survey, the Corporate Responsibility Index (CRI). In their 2007 sustainability report a wide range of socially responsible policies and practices, under the key headings of workplace (employees), health, safety and environment, community and market are reported. Using current corporate social responsibility thinking we are left with no room for doubt that Fosters is a socially responsible organisation.

This paper contends that it is time to move academic debate from social responsibility where discussions have centered upon considering how companies should be responsible and to whom, towards social performance, which would require companies to articulate the contribution that CSR policies and practices have made towards real social gains, e.g. a reduction in binge drinking or the proportion of people drinking at harmful levels.

This paper takes a corporate social performance viewpoint, exploring Australian adult drinking behaviour highlighting how a corporate social viewpoint can be used to document social good, such as behaviour change.

Method
Observations were chosen to observe alcohol drinking behaviour (Boote and Mathews 1999) and ethical clearance was obtained to observe a public behaviour in a public place. As an entire description of what was observed was not possible (Rust 1993; Kellehear 1993) strategies were used to record as much information as possible. Record sheets were developed to ensure that observers could record key behaviours and consumer characteristics.

Behaviours observed included the number of drinks consumed, the type (brand) and size of alcohol drinks ordered, whether the person was in a shout (e.g. buying drinks in rounds), along with many of the persons activities while on premise. The brands chosen and drink size were used to calculate the number of standard drinks consumed. Where the brand of beer poured could not be observed light beer levels were used to calculate standard drinks. The lowest alcohol levels were chosen to avoid over stating. Key consumer characteristics observed included gender, the number of people the person was with, whether a child was present, and finally whether people were dressed casually or in business attire.

Observations were conducted in seven different venues in Queensland and the ACT, between January 2nd and January 11th, 2008. People were observed on various days and times of the week (Wednesday through Saturday) between midday and 11pm. People were observed in licensed premises including cafes, restaurants, wine bars, sports bars and night clubs. Managers agreed to permit observation research, after they had been advised that the (unobtrusive) observations would not hinder normal business practice or their customers. Four observers were involved in the project and 27 people were observed on average in each data collection session.

continued...
Results

Slightly more males (56.5 per cent) were observed than females (43.5 per cent). Approximately one in ten (10.3 per cent) people drank alone. There were few instances (4.3 per cent) of children present and most people were observed in groups (89.7 per cent). Approximately two-thirds of the people observed were casually dressed (67.3 per cent) while the remaining one-third of people wore business dress (32.7 per cent).

Less than one quarter of people observed did not consume any alcohol. One in three people observed consumed two standard drinks. Nearly one in three people observed drank above the revised Australian Government drinking guidelines. The proportion of men drinking at risky levels was higher (two in five men observed) than women (one in five women observed). Regression analysis was performed to understand factors related to the amount of alcohol consumed. The regression model was a moderate fit (R^2adj = 53.8 per cent), and the overall relationship was significant (F(4, 503) = 195.1, p < 0.001). With other variables held constant, the number of standard drinks was positively related to drinking duration and gender and negatively related to the amount of water consumed.

Conclusions, limitations, future research directions

Covert observations were used in this research to observe whether people adhered to Australian drinking guidelines. The rationale for using observations in this study was that observations can be used to record phenomena with ‘the least response bias of any market research methodology’ and by utilising observations it is possible to ‘record what consumers actually do, not what they claim to have done’ (Boote & Mathews 1999, p. 20).

Covert observations distinguish this research from previous studies concerned with alcohol consumption because rather than asking respondents to recall the quantity of alcohol consumed this research observed people consuming alcohol. Given that many people are not able to calculate the number of standard drinks (see Carruthers and Binns 1992; Lader and Goddard 2006; Rundle-Thiele, Ball and Gillespie 2008) data collected using the method detailed in this paper will be more reliable than survey data. Conservative assumptions were made ensuring that standard drink calculations were under rather than overestimated. Observations took place in natural environments ensuring a truer picture of the phenomenon observed (Boote and Matthews 1999). Covert observations offer researchers the ability to more accurately determine whether people are consuming alcohol responsibly.

This study has an important limitation. The sample was not a true randomly selected sample with observations conducted on-premise in urban areas only. Therefore, the results, while having important implications, cannot be generalised to the entire population. Future research is required to further improve our understanding of alcohol consumption. The participant observation method should be used to observe off-premise drinking. Additional on-premise observations are required with extension to alternate venues such as sporting clubs and rural and semi-rural locations.

Future research endeavours should be directed towards considering the impact of various programmes on on-premise drinking. For example, researchers could undertake observations to obtain baseline data. A second round of observations could then be undertaken to ascertain the impact of socially responsible initiatives such as offering one serve of water with each alcoholic beverage ordered or offering a tapas menu to patrons. Data could then be compared and contrasted to understand the impact of the initiative on the amount of alcohol consumed.

While sustainability and social responsibility have entered the corporate agenda more needs to be done if corporations are to assist in enacting social change. To assist corporations to work towards achieving specific behavioural goals for a social good academic research needs to be focused on corporate social performance rather than corporate social responsibility. Such endeavours will, hopefully, assist us to understand the sustained financial benefits for corporations who are achieving specific behavioural goals and the benefits for the communities they seek to socially change.

References can be obtained from the author on request. Please email sharyn.rundle@uleth.ca or rundle@usq.edu.au
Eating Behaviour: A German Perspective

Debra Harker, Bishnu Sharma, Karin Reinhard* and Michael Harker
University of the Sunshine Coast, Australia, *BA University of Cooperative Education Ravensburg, Germany

Extended Abstract
It is suspected that the transition from dependent living in the family home to independent living during young adulthood influences food choice. Like other western countries, Germany too reports record numbers of overweight and obese individuals with young German adults in a particularly high-risk position. As such, this study sought to investigate if food choice varied by the place of residence (dependent or independent) of these young adults.

A recent study released by the International Association for the Study of Obesity (IASO) found that, among the European Union countries, Germany had the most overweight people. Further, among adults, the study found that nearly six in ten (58.9 per cent) German women were overweight, and that nearly three-quarters (75.4 per cent) of German men were carrying excess pounds. In the IASO study, United Kingdom women came a close second, with a similar proportion (58.5 per cent) being overweight. Among men, the Czech Republic came in second, but the thinnest Europeans of both sexes lived in Italy and France. The report estimated that rates of obesity and overweight in Germany now match those in the United States (Deutsche Welle 2007). Whilst the proportion of German people with a Body Mass Index (BMI) between 25 and 30 has not changed essentially during the last 20 years, the proportion of obese individuals (BMI≥30) has increased considerably. Currently around 70 per cent of men and 50 per cent of women in Germany are overweight or obese (Mensink, Lampert, Bergmann 2005).

Over the same period, social marketing campaigns that focus upon healthy eating have become commonplace throughout the world over. Given the social and individual costs that the increasing rates of overweight and obesity have, understanding food choice from a consumer behaviour perspective may offer insights that enhance the effectiveness of healthy eating intervention strategies, especially those focused on youth. Like many countries, there is a particular focus upon younger consumers in Germany as 31.1 per cent of males, and 16.3 per cent of females, aged 18 to 40 years are overweight; and these figures become more similar for the genders when it comes to obesity, with 7.4 per cent of males and 6.2 per cent of females being obese (Statistisches Bundesamt 2007). The concern with the younger consumer stems from research that tells us that if an unhealthy food choice pattern develops during young adulthood, it is likely that it will continue for the rest of their lives (Betts et al. 1997; Haberman and Luffey 1998; Wardle 1995). According to Gert Mensink of the Berliner Robert Koch Institut, German children and young adults eat less than half of their recommended daily intake of fruit and vegetables. The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Ernährung (www.dge.de) recommends that 6 to 17 year olds should consume 400 grams of fruit and vegetables each day and adults should eat 650 grams. However, only one-third of German adults consume this amount (Anon 2007) and only 50 per cent of six to 17 year old Germans eat the recommended amount of fruit and vegetables (Läsker 2008).

The critical importance of early intervention to establish healthy eating habits has driven many of the youth-centered social marketing campaigns. Indeed, being overweight or obese during childhood and adolescence increases the likelihood of being overweight or obese in adulthood (Australian Government Department of Heath and Ageing 2005). In Germany, evidence exists that young adults, as opposed to older adults, are less likely to consume the minimum recommended daily amount of fruit and vegetables (Anon 2007). Such trends suggest that benefit may be derived from assessing whether young adults achieve dietary guidelines and exploring the factors which influence their food choices, as we have in this research.

In the absence of empirical evidence, we suspected that where people live is one factor that may influence attitude toward food choice. In Germany, young adulthood represents a transitional stage in life when adult independence and self-responsibility are actualised; and attending university is one of the catalysts to many young adults moving away from the family home to begin living independently. A number of studies report similar findings about food choice behaviour, in that tertiary education students’ generally do not make healthy food choices. In American studies, for example, Tavelli et al. (1998, p. 81) found that only eight per cent of college students consumed the minimum recommended intake for each of the food groups, Haberman and Luffey (1998, p. 190) reported that more than 80 per cent of college students consume inadequate quantities of grains, dairy products and fruit and vegetables, while Huang et al. (2003, p. 83) found 69 per cent of college students were not consuming the recommended amount of fruit and vegetables. Germans with a Hauptschulabentschluss (those who finish school after 9th grade, with no further education) are twice as likely to be overweight or obese than Germans with an Abitur (general qualification for university entrance;
finishing school after 13th grade) or Fachhochschulreife (finishing school after 12th grade, no general qualification for university entrance) (Brombach, Wagner, Eisings-Watzl and Heyer 2006).

Of particular relevance to our research was a United Kingdom study of young adults aged 18 to 25 years. While this study by Beasley et al. (2004) was limited to investigating the consumption of specific food types rather than quantities and frequencies of food groups, and respondents were not restricted to tertiary education students, it did provide some initial indications of a relationship between place of residence and healthy food choices. This study found that respondents who lived independently were more likely to consume a ‘good’ diet than those living in the family home (Beasley et al. 2004). One explanation for such behaviour is that independent living brings with it the responsibility of various food-related activities such as budgeting, purchase, preparation and cooking, which are skills that young adults may not possess when transitioning from a dependent living arrangement (Beasley et al. 2004; Crossley and Nazir 2002).

Two research questions were set:

1. Is there a difference in food motive and the serving of food by the type of residence (dependent or independent)?

2. Is there a difference in food motive and the serving of food by the age group of German University students?

This project used a descriptive research design in a cross-sectional setting. The research involved the self-administration of a questionnaire with 305 university students in Germany that was developed from a review of the literature in this area. For our study, the questionnaire was pre-tested on an expert panel and on a subsequent pilot with a small sample of respondents from the target population. Quota sampling was applied due to the unavailability of an appropriate sampling frame and as this method of sampling ensured control of particular characteristics of the target population (Moser 1952; Moser and Stuart 1953). Quantitative data was collected randomly from young adults aged 18 to 24 years utilising a drop-off/pick-up technique.

In terms of our first research objective, concerned with whether there was a difference between the type of residence and food choice, we found that dependent students consumed more serves of vegetables each day, compared to independent students. Dependent students also ate more fruit than their independent counterparts. Indeed, in terms of the other food groups, higher proportions of dependent students ate more serves of every food group than independent students. In the same vein as Beasley et al. (2004) and Crossley and Nazir (2002), we too suspect that independent respondents are likely to assume greater personal responsibility for their food choices in comparison to dependent respondents, whose food choices may be somewhat controlled by their parent(s). However, further research is required to empirically ascertain why this difference exists.

Our second research objective was concerned with whether age played a part in the food choice process and we found that there is difference in mood, weight concern and attitudes towards healthy eating between students under 21 years and above 21 years. The younger group has a more positive attitude towards healthy eating, tends to eat significantly higher serves of fruit, bread, meat, fish, poultry and legumes, and generally eats more than their older counterparts. We also found that the most important characteristics in terms of food choice for students still living in the family home were health, sensory appeal and price, whilst, for independent students, price was overwhelmingly the most important characteristic. Whilst this is not surprising for a student cohort, our findings can inform social marketing campaigns, particularly in terms of the education and motivation components identified by Maibach et al. (2002) and Donovan and Henley (2003). In terms of education, campaigns may consider focusing upon improving the attitude toward healthy eating among young German adults that live in a dependent arrangement within the family home, perhaps encouraging the young adult to be an influencer in food purchases. Furthermore, we suggest that social marketing campaigns that educate young adults about food-related activities, such as budgeting, preparation and cooking, in readiness for, or in the early stages of, their transition to independent living would yield positive results. The motivation component of social marketing may also be informed by our research findings. Specifically, persuasive messages which correspond with Sheth and Frazier’s (1982) inducement process may encourage healthier eating.

1,500 words

References


continued...
Sedentary Behaviour and Obesity in Young Adult Australians: A Social Cognitive Approach

Luke Hawley, Debra Harker and Michael Harker,
University of the Sunshine Coast, Australia

Extended Abstract

Globally, physical inactivity is estimated to cause two million deaths per year, representing an estimated 10-16 per cent of cases each of breast cancer, colon cancers, and diabetes, and about 22 per cent of ischemic heart disease cases (Australia Bureau of Statistics (ABS) 2006b; World Health Organisation 2007). In Australia, physical inactivity contributes to the risk of 6,400 deaths per annum from coronary heart disease, non-insulin dependent diabetes mellitus and colon cancer, and up to 2,200 more deaths due to other conditions, including breast cancer and stroke (ABS 2006b). It is essential that public policy intervention strategies are developed that not only aim to increase physical activity, but reduce physical inactivity, as this may be more effective at reducing the associated health risks (DeMattia, Lemont and Meurer 2006). Wei et al. (1999) suggested that inactivity is a better measure for all-cause mortality risk than Body Mass Index (BMI), with those participating in regular exercise, regardless of weight associated with lower all-cause mortality risk than those who had sedentary lifestyles, regardless of weight.

The aim of this paper is to explore the links between sedentary behaviour and obesity using Social Cognitive Theory (SCT) as a framework. The utilisation of a theoretical framework such as SCT is essential as it specifies methods for behaviour change, helps in discerning measurable programme outcomes, improves replication, identifies timing for interventions, provides the basis for research and strategy as it informs social marketers on what questions to ask during the research phase, and how the various elements of the social marketing campaign are supposed to impact critical social behaviours (Sharma 2005; Goldberg, Fishbein and Middlestadt 1997; Bandura 2004). Indeed, the US Surgeon General recommended the utilisation of SCT as it provides a useful framework for organising, understanding, and promoting good health (cited in Anderson 2006).

With the modernisation of daily activities reducing physical activity, as well as the rising use of computers, televisions, game consoles and mobile technology that often displace physical activity, sedentary activity, particularly screen time, has become a paramount issue. However, the role of sedentary behaviours in the obesity epidemic is not agreed upon by researchers. Some argue that increasing levels of obesity lead to a more sedentary lifestyle due to the inability of sufferers to participate in physical activity; others suggest that increasing levels of sedentary behaviours, often developed through childhood and carried on into adulthood, lead to a reduction in energy expenditure, causing obesity. This lack of consensus amongst researchers, as well as the equivocal evidence supporting either argument, is a major limitation to the development of appropriate intervention methods to reduce the impact of sedentary behaviours and halt the progress of obesity.

continued...
Social marketing has been successfully applied to various causes such as: AIDS/HIV, family planning, anti-smoking, immunization, recycling, high blood pressure, sun-protection, regular checks for various cancers, drink driving, domestic violence and physical activity to name a few (Goldberg, Fishbein and Middlestadt 1997; Kotler, Roberto and Lee 2002). Over the past thirty years SCT has emerged as a predominant theory for understanding human behaviour (Sharma 2005; Bandura 2004; Netz and Raviv 2004; Sharma, Wagner and Wilkerson 2006). Social cognitive theory defines human behaviour within a triadic, dynamic and reciprocal interaction of personal factors, behaviour, and the environment where a human’s cognitive processes are influenced by their perceived self-efficacy, perceived outcomes, perceived expectancy of outcomes within the context of their personal goals, morals and standards, which in turn mediates how and if behaviours will be performed (Bandura 1986). SCT focuses on the promotion of effective self-management of health habits that keep people healthy throughout their lifespan (Bandura 2004, 2005). Bandura (2004, 2005) contends that in order to help people reduce health-impairing habits requires enabling them with the self-management skills and self-beliefs needed to take charge of their health habits, as opposed to using health communications with the emphasis on scaring people into good health. Three hypotheses were investigated:

H1: Lifestyle characteristics (physical activity) significantly positively influence perceptions of self regulation, outcome expectancies, self-efficacy and knowledge.

H2: Personal characteristics (age, gender and BMI) significantly negatively influence perceptions of self regulation, outcome expectations, self-efficacy and knowledge.

H3: A higher perception of self regulation, outcome expectations, self-efficacy and knowledge are significantly negatively associated with a higher participation level in sedentary behaviours.

A self-administered survey was completed by a sample of 310 young respondents with the data analysed by a series of one-way ANOVAs and sequential multinomial logistic regressions.

Hypotheses one and two were tested using one-way ANOVAs. The results of which indicated that participatory levels of physical activity were positively associated with higher mean scores of TV and video self-efficacy and lower mean scores of other sedentary activity (OSA) goal commitment. Thus hypothesis one was partially supported.

Personal characteristics did not provide a significant difference of mean scores on SCT constructs. Age was found to be associated with higher mean scores of TV goal commitment, however after inspecting post hoc comparisons, no significant differences were found amongst groups. Therefore hypothesis two was not supported.

Hypothesis three was tested using sequential multinomial logistic regressions. To determine if the constructs of SCT can be used to predict participatory levels of each of the four sedentary behaviours, a two-step logistic model was used. Step one included only the constructs of SCT, at step two all nine variables were included (lifestyle and personal characteristic variables) to determine if SCT constructs continued to significantly contribute to the prediction of each of the four sedentary behaviours after the addition of previously tested variables.

It was found that, for television and computer use only, the SCT constructs significantly contributed to the prediction of the participation level within that activity. Only TV goal commitment, within the TV logistic model (at step one), was found not to contribute. Prediction improved slightly with the addition of the other variables. For computer use only self efficacy and outcome expectancy were found to contribute to the logistic model (at step one). Therefore hypothesis three was partially supported with SCT constructs able to predict television and computer use with moderate accuracy.

The findings of this study suggest that the level of inactivity amongst this sample may lead to significant health problems in the future. With inactivity estimated to cause two million deaths per year worldwide, representing an estimated 10–16 per cent of cases each of breast cancer, colon cancers, and diabetes, and about 22 per cent of ischaemic heart disease cases, the sedentary behaviour of this sample of eight hours of inactivity per day and only minimal amounts of physical activity must change (ABS 2006b; WHO 2007).

It is important that changes are considered in public policy (initiated by public health practitioners and social marketers) that not only aims to increase physical activity, but reduce physical inactivity, as this may be more effective at reducing the associated health risks (DeMattia, Lemont and Meurer 2006; Wei et al. 1999).

To do this effectively requires the utilisation of a grounded theoretical framework as it specifies methods for behaviour change, helps in discerning measurable programme outcomes, improves replication, identifies...
timing for interventions, provides the basis for research and strategy as it informs marketers on what questions to ask during the research phase, and how the various elements of the social marketing campaign are supposed to impact critical social behaviours (Sharma 2005; Goldberg, Fishbein and Middlestadt 1997).

Recent social marketing efforts have focused on increasing physical activity (Spanier, Marshall and Faulkner 2006; Queensland Government 2007). However some researchers believe that intervention methods aimed at reducing sedentary behaviour as opposed to increasing physical activity could be more effective (DeMattia, Lemont and Meurer 2006). Committing to an exercise regime that is time and equipment dependant is increasingly difficult for overweight and obese individuals (DeMattia, Lemont and Meurer 2006), however by limiting their sedentary behaviours and encouraging a more active lifestyle, combined with healthy dietary habits, the risks associated with inactivity could be reduced (DeMattia, Lemont and Meurer 2006).

1,439 words

Reference List


PILOT STUDY: COMPARING EFFECTIVENESS OF OBESITY PREVENTION AND REDUCTION MESSAGES AMONG CANADIAN ADOLESCENTS

Authors: Jennifer Allyson Dooley, University of Alberta, Canada
Dr. Sameer Deshpande, University of Lethbridge, Canada
Dr. Carol E. Adair, University of Calgary, Canada

1. Introduction

Developed countries are facing a global obesity epidemic (World Health Organisation, 2000). In Canada, similar to other countries, research findings have demonstrated a strong link between obesity and poor eating as well as physical activity habits among adolescents (Shields, 2005). Our study develops obesity prevention social marketing messages aimed at adolescents, with a focus on testing their effectiveness by examining the presence or absence of health and the potential unintended effects associated with this prevention tool.

While media efforts can be effective among adolescents to prevent obesity (Mixon, 2001; Stead, Gordon, Angus and McDermott, 2007), they can also evoke unintended effects – a greater likelihood for the target audience to exhibit undesirable behaviours (Brehm, 1966; O’Dea, 2005) or suffer other adverse consequences. One type of creative strategy is a focus on body-image, which has been used in the past to address the obesity issue as well as to sell commercial products (Kaiser Family Foundation, 2004; O’Dea, 2005). These campaigns often depict thin people, or the ideal body-image, as popular and successful while also containing anti-obesity messages. O’Dea (2005) argued for the need to examine if harmful or dangerous outcomes can result from obesity prevention messages aimed at adolescents, with the premise that the focus on obesity should not exist without acknowledgement of the impact such messages will have on eating disorders.

Health communication researchers have also found that health-benefit messages geared towards adolescents are not highly effective in changing their behaviour (Austin, 1995; Lynch and Bonnie, 1994; Siegel, 1998). Many tobacco prevention media campaigns geared towards adolescents contain health-benefit messages (Beaudoin, 2002; Siegel, 1998) and researchers have found that PSAs geared towards adolescent smoking habits were ineffective if they included information about the health consequences of smoking (Pechmann and Reibling, 2000). Adolescent populations are also theorised to be more motivated to engage in or adopt a new behaviour if that behaviour is attached to an immediate versus longer-term reward (Fawcett, 2000; Mixon, 2001). In order to increase campaign effectiveness, scholars have recommended shifting the messaging in prevention campaigns (Austin, 1995) from the negative health consequences of obesity, or the positive health consequences of a healthy diet and participation in physical activity, to motivationally based positive experience messages.

2. Hypotheses

Two hypotheses are examined: (a) obesity prevention body-image PSAs would be significantly more likely to induce negative weight attitudes, lower self-esteem and stimulate negative mood compared to control condition PSAs; and, (b) obesity prevention positive experience PSAs would receive better ad evaluations and result in more change intentions compared with obesity prevention health-benefit PSAs.

2. Method

First, obesity prevention PSAs from 15 campaigns (83 PSAs) originating in the U.S., Australia, the U.K., and Canada were gathered and grouped into categories.

In phase two, two focus groups (one each for males and females) and interviews with two males (focus groups were planned but only two attended) were conducted. The objective was to get feedback from 13 adolescents (aged 14 to 17) on the PSA strengths and weaknesses. Based on focus group feedback, 16 PSAs were retained (four in each group): (a) body-image: PSAs portrayed the notion of ideal body types or implied that there was an ideal body shape; (b) health-benefit: in the PSAs either the health-benefits of active living and/or healthy eating were mentioned; (c) positive experience: PSAs made no mention of health-benefits, but the fun aspects of active living and/or healthy eating were portrayed; and, (d) control: PSAs focused on different health behaviours than active living or healthy eating.

In phase three, the study dependent measures were pre-tested by 10 participants aged 13 to 17 using verbal probing cognitive interviewing (Collins, 2003). The dependent measures were: unintended effects (state self-esteem, mood, and weight attitude), PSA likeability, and behaviour change (physical activity and healthy eating intention). Unintended effects were measured using the State Self-Esteem Scale (SSSE; Heatherton and Polivy, 1991), the Multiple Affect Adjective Check List (MAACL; Zuckerman and Lubin, 1965, 1985), and the Attitudes about Weight and Dieting Scale (AAWD; Crandall, 1994). PSA likeability was measured using the Ad Evaluation Scale (Kelly et al., 2006). Behaviour change was measured using the healthy eating and physical activity intention scales (Baker, Little, and Brownell, 2003) as well as Prochaska and DiClemente’s (1983) Stages of Change model.

In phase four (pilot study), 95 participants (50 females/45 males) were randomly assigned to one of four groups: (a) body-image, (b) health-benefit, (c) positive experience, or (d) control; and randomly exposed to four PSAs. Using a pre-post measurement protocol, participants in groups of eight, filled out baseline instruments, viewed the four PSAs for their group, and then completed post-measures. Each testing session took approximately one hour.

For phase’s two to four, participants were recruited using systematic snowball sampling (Bernard, 1999). Ethics approval was received from the University of Calgary.
3. Hypothesis Testing: Main Pilot Study Results

Unintended Effects: One-way ANOVA revealed a marginally significant main effect of type of PSA on mood change. Planned comparisons using Tukey’s honestly significant difference (HSD) post-hoc comparison revealed a significant pairwise mood change difference for mean anxiety wherein those exposed to body-image PSAs were more likely to show an increase in anxiety between pre and post administration compared to those exposed to control PSAs. Consistent with the hypothesis, body-image PSAs were significantly more likely to stimulate anxiety in participants compared to control PSAs. However, body-image PSAs were not more likely to induce negative weight attitudes or produce immediate self-esteem changes compared to control PSAs. See Table 1.

Positive Experience PSAs: One-way ANOVA revealed a significant main effect of PSA type on overall ad evaluation and associated subscales (Table 2). Tukey’s HSD post-hoc demonstrated significant pairwise differences; control PSAs received lower overall evaluations, attitude, and believability ratings compared to all other conditions. Contrary to predictions, positive experience PSAs did not receive more positive ad evaluations compared to health-benefit PSAs. Interestingly, health-benefit PSAs received higher readability ratings than body-image and positive experience.

One-way ANOVA revealed a significant main effect of PSA type on healthy eating planning change (Table 3). Tukey’s HSD post-hoc comparison demonstrated significant pairwise differences between health-benefit and control PSAs, where the former resulted in healthy eating planning between pre and post administration. Chi-square tests of independence examining stages of change across groups for shifts in physical activity and healthy eating found no significant differences. Contrary to predictions, positive experience PSAs did not receive more change intentions or shifts in stages of change compared to health-benefit PSAs.

4. Discussion

Overall health focus in PSAs did not reduce the effectiveness of obesity prevention PSAs, although body-image PSAs did induce an increase in participant anxiety.

Exposure to body-image PSAs may stimulate anxiety in youth. Haines and Neumark-Sztainer (2006) discussed how societal pressures to conform to the ideal shape and size may result in ‘thin-ideal internalisation’ (p. 5). They presented a model outlining a sequential link between media exposure, thin-ideal internalisation, body dissatisfaction, and anxiety. The results from the current study support this relationship and suggest that exposure to overweight or obese media images may also cause internalisation of the thin ideal.

Contrary to predictions, adolescents found health-benefit PSAs to be more readable than body-image and positive experience PSAs and also stated more plans to eat healthy in comparison to control PSAs. Interestingly, the nutrition health-benefit PSAs featured the current health statistics of the obesity epidemic, while the physical activity health-benefit PSAs featured long term health consequences. This finding supports the notion suggested by several researchers that long term health rewards (Pechmann and Reibling, 2000) are not appealing to adolescents, but develops the research field by suggesting that short term or immediate health-benefit information may be appealing to adolescents.

5. Limitations and Future Research

Findings are based on responses from urban Calgary adolescents, and do not represent all Canadian adolescents. Likewise, a potential lack in external validity with using snowball sampling (Kerlinger and Lee, 2000) may exist. Since the PSAs were from a variety of organisations around the world, some materials may not have been as relevant to Canadian adolescents. Last, both presence of peers and test anxiety in the experimental setting (Hembree, 1988; Stycos, 1981) may have impacted the internal validity.

Future research could expand on that of Haines and Neumark-Sztainer (2006) to examine if media exposure to overweight images causes internalisation of the thin-ideal or changes in attitudes toward weight. Research on the readability and behaviour intention of health-benefit PSAs that portray short term or immediate health messages compared to those that portray long term health messages is necessary. The use of such strategies in real-world settings, with exposure to communication efforts over a longer time period and direct behavioural measures, is also warranted.

Possible anxiety effects found in this study among adolescents following body-image PSA exposure support the necessity for a multi-disciplinary planning team for obesity prevention campaigns; experts from obesity, eating disorders, and marketing. Lessons could be learned from countries such as Great Britain, who have undertaken environmental and policy-related changes in conjunction with social marketing to address obesity (Kaiser Family Foundation, 2007).

References


Social Marketing and a Total Market Approach: Performance Measures


*Research & Metrics, Population Services International, 1120 19th Street, N.W. #600, Washington, DC, 20036, USA
schapman@psi.org, hyang@psi.org
**Research Division, Population Services International/Madagascar, BP 7748, Antananarivo 101, Madagascar, lantor@psi.mg, jackyr@psi.mg
***Centre for Population Studies, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, Keppel Street, London, WC1E 7HT, martine.collumbien@lshtm.ac.uk

This article proposes and demonstrates a segmentation method and measures for monitoring and evaluating the performance of social marketing and other interventions that form part of a total market approach to influencing health-related behaviour in developing countries. The proposed segmentation bases and sequence are vulnerability, consumption, equity-based measures, source of supply preference, access and other determinants. The performance measures are effectiveness, cost-effectiveness, equity, efficiency and access. Applying the method and measures to a social marketing intervention in Madagascar to increase use of hormonal contraceptives, evidence of effectiveness and equity is found based on two rounds of cross sectional surveys. Evidence of efficiency and access is weak and merits improvement in data quality. Cost-effectiveness data are not currently available.

Over the past 30 years, funding decisions for social marketing and other interventions that deliver health products and services in the developing world have been made largely on the potential contribution of a single public, non-governmental or commercial source of supply to influence behaviour or increase commercial market share. An unintended consequence of making funding decisions by source of supply and with different performance objectives in mind can be that interventions conflict or are unnecessary. Interventions delivering free or subsidised products may dissuade higher income consumers from using commercial sector products. Interventions supporting commercial or subsidised product delivery may increase inequities in use rates across socio-economic strata. Commercial only interventions may be ineffective in increasing access and use, creating a trade-off between effectiveness in improving health and the efficiency of the health system. The assumption that product or service delivery intervention itself is necessary may be incorrect if the determinants of behaviour or supply source choice could be influenced through communications alone or other mechanisms.

To avoid these conflicts, intervention evaluators have called for the adoption of a total market approach, labelling it arguably central to the future of social marketing in the developing world. A total market approach aims to influence health-related behaviour equitably and efficiently by financing and coordinating interventions that may work across one or more sources of supply and using communications, regulatory, financing or other strategies that can influence behaviour directly or indirectly via changes in access to products and services. It is a process that includes population and service delivery monitoring; performance evaluation of public, non-governmental and commercial actors in delivering products and services to different market segments divided in part by willingness to pay; and efforts to shift consumers with high willingness to pay away from wholly or partially subsidised supply sources.

The segmentation method and performance measures proposed are based on the Making Market Systems Work for the Poor or M4P concept, which addresses situations where one or more merit goods or services are perceived to be sub-optimally supplied and consumed under existing market conditions. The segmentation bases and sequence are vulnerability, consumption, equity-based measures, source of supply preference and physical access and psycho-social determinants of consumption, including willingness to pay. These identify five total market approach performance measures. The first measure, effectiveness, depends first on segmenting a population into those who are vulnerable in some way and those who are either not or less vulnerable. Among those who are vulnerable, effectiveness is defined as an increase in merit good or service consumption as a result of social marketing or other interventions. When the merit good or service is defined narrowly, such that there is one or more alternative merit goods or services or risk behaviours, then two additional effectiveness measures are halo and substitution effects, which are defined here respectively as an increase or decrease in consumption of the alternative merit good or service or, for the substitution effect alone, an increase in the practice of risk behaviours. If there is a decrease in the use of modern methods other than hormonal contraceptives, then that is a substitution effect. The second measure, cost-effectiveness, can be defined differently based on data availability across interventions. Cost information can
be estimated from a donor, organisational or consumer perspective and effectiveness measured as above or estimated based on models relating behaviour changes to health status or disease burden reduction.

The third performance measure, equity, depends on segmenting users by socio-economic strata to determine the extent to which disparities in use are associated with this proxy measure of ability to pay. Equity is defined as the absence of a difference in consumption across socio-economic strata and measured using the concentration index. Other differentials may also be of interest, such as those relating to gender, age or education. The fourth measure, efficiency, is defined in terms of trends in market share between commercial and subsidised sources of supply. An increase in commercial market share as the result of a social marketing or other interventions is evidence that the commercial market is being crowded in. Alternatively, a decrease means that the commercial sector is being crowded out. Efficiency can be analysed in terms of the determinants of source of supply choice, including the equity-based measures above, willingness to pay and other psycho-social and access determinants. The fifth performance measure, access, is defined in terms of a population's proximity to the merit good or service and the presence of psycho-social determinants of consumption and purchase.

In terms of total market approach performance measures, social marketing in Madagascar between 2004 and 2006 was effective in terms of influencing contraceptive use and had a halo effect in increasing the use of methods not supplied by the social marketing intervention. No evidence of cost-effectiveness is available. Social marketing activities did not decrease inequities over the project period. Yet, as of 2006, socio-economic status is not a determinant of contraceptive use overall, indicating that this factor alone is not a barrier to using contraception in Madagascar. Other factors are significant determinants of contraceptive use, specifically social support and self-efficacy, which the social marketing intervention has proven itself effective at changing, as well as age and marital status. Evidence of the intervention's impact on efficiency is weakened by the high proportion of users not being able to recall the hormonal contraceptive brand they were currently using. There is no evidence that social marketing is crowding out commercial sector suppliers. The sharp decline in willingness to pay from 2004 to 2006 indicates that fewer in the population would be prepared to pay the substantial premium required to purchase commercially supplied brands, creating a barrier toward shifting users to commercial sources of supply.

In decision-making terms, continuation of the social marketing intervention is merited, with a need to continue improvements in performance measurement. The evidence does not support price increases in social marketing brands in an effort to increase cost-recovery. Users of non social marketing brands, many of whom receive products via the public sector, have lower levels of education, a likely proxy for income, than those who use social marketing brands. Keeping prices at current levels without for example increases in perceived social support, is unlikely to result in significant shifting of public sector users to social marketing. The large price gap between the social marketing and commercial products and low levels of ability to pay makes significant shifting of users to commercial products and consequent improvements in efficiency unlikely in the near term.

Evidence indicates that social marketing brands can be found in just over 30 per cent of randomly selected geographic areas in Madagascar. Perceptions of availability did not improve between 2004 and 2006, indicating that additional efforts to expand geographic access are merited. The continuing importance of other perceptions as determinants of behaviour argues for expansion of family planning communications to address these issues. Such an expansion could be done through the social marketing intervention and or undertaken by other actors.

The data presented have limitations in decision-making terms. Cost effectiveness information is not currently or routinely available for public review. Access information is available, but without a report explaining methods and standards used for measurement. Efficiency information is unreliable given the inability of respondents to recall which brand they used, most likely those that are distributed via the public sector. While expensive efforts to strengthen brand awareness and recall of users are unlikely to be justified only to measure market share, the halo effect evidence and high rates of recall of the social marketing brand may indicate possible benefits to the public sector to branding its products. The willingness to pay results merit closer review given their sharp decline over the intervention period and likely adverse consequences for shifting purchases to the commercial sector.
Redefining Social Marketing: Adapting and adopting contemporary commercial marketing thinking into the social marketing discipline

Dr Stephen Dann, Australian National University

Abstract

Social marketing is built on the adaptation and adoption of commercial marketing theory and practice. If ‘social marketing’ is understood to be a generic term for the involvement of marketing in social change, then the variations in the definitions of the discipline can be seen as a byproduct of marketing’s desire to produce customised variations to meet the specific needs of a target market. In the era of mass customisation in commercial marketing, social marketing itself can take on a variety of forms to meet the specific needs of a social change campaign whilst retaining the core elements of adapting and adopting marketing.

As marketing continues to redefine its purpose and parameters in light of social, economic and technological advances, effective social marketing needs to draw on this evolution of marketing thought to continue to develop best practice. This paper unifies and reconciles the multiple definitions of social and commercial marketing to create a social marketing definition that provides a robust framework for social marketing practice, and functional set of parameters to serve as a conceptual framework for academic social marketers. The creation of the social marketing definition was achieved through the use of text mining methodology to derive fundamental principles of social marketing definitions. These are combined with the core themes of the American Marketing Association (2007) and the Chartered Institute of Marketing (2005) contemporary definitions of commercial marketing, and the principles of the social marketing definitions from the National Social Marketing Centre (2007) and Kotler, Lee and Rothschild (2006) to ensure a robust definition for theory and practice.

Introduction

Social marketing was founded on the premise of adapting commercial marketing theory and practice to assist the success of social causes. Since the founding definition from Kotler and Zaltman (1971), social marketing researchers and practitioners have been in the business of adapting and adopting the dominant commercial marketing ideas, practices and concepts of their day. As part of this tradition, the current paper presents a new definition of social marketing based on the adaptation of the current commercial marketing thinking, an analysis of prior social marketing definitions and the expansion of key contemporary social marketing definitions. The paper uses a text mining methodology to derive fundamental principles of social marketing definitions, which are combined with the core themes of the American Marketing Association and Chartered Institute of Marketing definitions of marketing to form the conceptual framework for the new definition. Finally, the paper also introduces an exploration of the sub-components of the new definition of marketing by specifying the conceptual parameters of ‘behavioural change’ and ‘benefit’.

A new definition of social marketing

From the outset, this paper recognises the potential controversy in presenting a new definition of social marketing into a field crowded with existing definitions. However, the rationale for the definition is simple – the AMA (2007) redefinition of commercial marketing has created an opportunity to reexamine the core frameworks of social marketing by adapting the new view of commercial marketing for the benefit of social change. As part of the exploration of the new definition, this paper contributes to the development of the social marketing field through developing a definition based on the adaptation of contemporary commercial marketing, and the use of textual analysis of prior social marketing definitions to enhance and extend the existing conceptual groundwork. The paper defines social marketing as

Social marketing is the adaptation and adoption of commercial marketing activities, institutions and process as a means to induce behavioural change on a temporary or permanent basis.

‘Behavioural change’ [in social marketing] is achieved through the creation, communication, delivery and exchange of a competitive social marketing offer (ie new or adapted behaviour) that induces voluntary change in the targeted social group, and which results in benefit to the social change campaign’s recipients, partners and the broader society at large.

Benefit [in social marketing] is where the return on social investment through actual or perceived returns exceeds the financial and non financial costs of the social marketing activity.

The core objective of social marketing under this definition is to facilitate behaviour change through increasing the adoption of a positive behaviour (eg exercise) or decreasing the use of a negative behaviour (over nutrition), and attempts to do this by moving the individual’s preference from the negative actions (under exercising, over eating) to the positive outcomes (exercise, diet change) for the benefit of the individual, group or society. The definition is derived in part on the AMA (2007) and CIM (2005) definitions of commercial marketing, existing social marketing definitions of Kotler and Lee (2008), Andreasen (1995), Kotler and Zaltman (1971), NSMC (2007), Andreasen (2002a, 2002b) and the results of the text mining analysis detail later in the paper.

continued...
Literature review

The paper examines two main areas of literature – contemporary definitions of commercial marketing, and a broader exploration of the social marketing literature to uncover different definitions and applications of the social marketing concept.

Commercial marketing

Between social marketing official foundation in 1971, and the time of writing of this paper, there have been four AMA definitions and two Chartered Institute of Marketing definitions, and a further ten definitions of marketing from the combined publications of Kotler, Pride, Ferrell, and McCarthy (Ringold and Weitz, 2007). For the purposes of this paper, only the official definitions of the peak bodies of the AMA and CIM will be addressed in review of commercial marketing due to the limits of space.

The first official AMA (1937) definition portrayed marketing as the performance of business activities that direct the flow of goods and services from producers to consumers (Gundlach, 2007; AMA, 1937). Commercial marketing existed as a form of guiding mechanism to bring marketer and marketplace together, and, whilst limited to a focus dominated by distribution and products, it formed the conceptual framework against which Kotler and Zaltman (1971) framed their seminal social marketing works. In 1985, the AMA redefined marketing as the process of planning and executing the conception, pricing, promotion, and distribution of ideas, goods, and services to create exchanges that satisfy individual and organisational objectives. The definition recognised the expanded domain of the discipline and the influence of social marketing through the inclusion of ‘ideas’ as part of the core commercial framework, whilst incorporating the Bagozzi (1975) exchange concept and the McCarthy (1960) marketing mix. The AMA (1985) definition has been one of the most influential conceptual frameworks in social marketing as its influence can be seen on the Kotler and Roberto (1989) and Andreasen (1994) definitions amongst others (Appendix 1). Similarly, the core precepts of exchange, satisfaction of organisational and individual objectives and the recognition of marketing tactical systems such as the planning and the marketing mix are also evident in the NSMC (2006) social marketing benchmarks.

Within the same period, the Chartered Institute of Marketing defined marketing as the management process which identifies, anticipates and supplies customer requirements efficiently and profitably (Nicholas, 1998 in Kavulya, 2004). Although this approach to marketing is very much a marketing management view of the discipline, it retains the customer orientation as central requirement of the practice. As a result, the CIM’s definition has been influential in the development of the British social marketing frameworks that have the central requirement that interventions must begin with the target customer (French and Blair Stevens, 2006).

In 2004, the AMA released a third definition of marketing which marked a radical re-imagining of the discipline as an organisational function and a set of processes for creating, communicating and delivering value to customers and for managing customer relationships in ways that benefit the organisation and its stakeholders. Discussions of the limitations of the AMA 2004 definition for commercial marketing (Shultz, 2007; Zinkhan and Williams, 2007; Wilkie and Moore, 2007 and Gundlach 2007) and social marketing have been conducted at length elsewhere (Dann, 2005, 2006a; 2006b; 2007). In summary, this era of the definition is notable for its brevity and controversy. As the shortest lived definition of marketing, the AMA (2004-2007) definition continues to cameo in journal articles and textbooks as the production cycles catch up with the speed of change, and the adaptation of the new definition works through the publication cycles. The impact of the definition can also be seen as the ‘create, communicate and deliver’ framework is integrated in the Kotler, Rothschild and Lee (2007) definition of social marketing.

The Chartered Institute of Marketing issued a slightly modified and updated definition in 2005, where marketing became the management process responsible for identifying, anticipating and satisfying customer requirements profitably. Two subtle wording changes ushered in the commercial focus of the CIM (2005) definition by dropping the efficiency requirement, and replacing the production orientated ‘supplies customer requirements’ with a satisfaction metric. At the time of writing, this remains the official definition of the Chartered Institute of Marketing.

In late 2007, the American Marketing Association launched a new definition of marketing to address some of the complaints raised by AMA (2004). Marketing is the activity, set of institutions, and processes for creating, communicating, delivering, and exchanging offerings that have value for customers, clients, partners, and society at large. Discussions of the impact of AMA (2007), the change from AMA (2004) and the influence of the new definition on commercial marketing have been conducted elsewhere (Dann and Dann, 2007; Dann, 2007). In summary, the AMA (2007) offers a value development framework of creating, communicating, delivering and exchanging between multiple actors in the marketplace, thus recognising that marketing is a social process conducted in the context of society, rather than planned, executed and implemented in a vacuum. The inclusion of ‘clients’ as a distinct category of recipient of marketing is an explicit recognition of the influence of social marketing on the development of commercial marketing theory and practice. Whilst traditionally, social marketing’s mantra is ‘adapt and adopt’, the AMA’s willingness to credit the influence of the subdiscipline opens the opportunity for social marketing to move forward into an ‘adapt, adopt and export’ mindset where the discipline gives back to the parent discipline through the focus on consumer based intervention, and deeper understanding of the issues surrounding behaviour change.

continued...
Unification and reconciliation

The AMA (2007) definition is focused on orientating marketing to customer needs as a form of value creation and exchange, whilst the CIM (2005) definition addresses meeting the long term survival requirements of the organisation through customer need fulfilment. In isolation, both represent functional applications of marketing to guide practitioners and frame academic research. In combination, they represent coverage of the key issues of commercial marketing – the need for a customer orientated approach to value generation, and the fulfilment of the long term goals of the organisation through cost recovery and profit. The author proposes applying both definitions of marketing to the conceptualisation of social marketing to create a marketing world view of meeting the needs of the marketplace whilst effectively serving organisational goals of profit, stakeholder value and organisational longevity. For the purpose of the paper, the two definitions of marketing are examined for their conceptual and theoretical similarity to establish a shared ground of marketing theory to adapt for the basis of a social marketing definition. Table 1 outlines the component elements of the CIM (2005) and AMA (2007) definitions as a means of comparison.

Table 1: Comparison of CIM and AMA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Mechanism</th>
<th>How</th>
<th>Why</th>
<th>Whom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CIM (2005)</td>
<td>Management Process</td>
<td>Identify Anticipate</td>
<td>Satisfy (Profit)</td>
<td>Customer requirements (Profit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMA (2007)</td>
<td>Activity Processes Institution</td>
<td>Create</td>
<td>Offerings that have value</td>
<td>Client, Customer, Partner, Society</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the surface, several differences exist between the AMA and CIM definitions. First, the explicit mention of profit contrasts with the indirect ‘offering of value’ of the AMA, although the exchange of value between marketer and clients, customers, partners and society can be interpreted broadly as a recognition of the flow of financial gain to the marketing organisation. Second, the CIM presents a more abstract framework for the operation of marketing as a means of ‘identification, anticipation and satisfaction’ versus the more task orientated approach of the AMA as ‘create, communicate, deliver and exchange’. However, both definitions reflect a shared goal of market orientation through the ‘customer satisfaction’ and ‘offerings that have value for the customer’ components. Similarly, the ‘management process’ and ‘activity, processes and institutions’ view of marketing as a procedural element as well as structural component of the organisation cover similar conceptual domains. Finally, although the AMA has broader target base in ‘client, customer, partner and society’, each of these four targets could be legitimately described as having customers’ requirements that can be met by marketing offerings. For the purpose of this paper, the minimum elements of commercial marketing that should be incorporated into a social marketing adaptation consist of the shared customer orientation and the recognition of the marketing tool kit in the form of ‘marketing processes’ shared by the CIM and AMA. In addition, the implementation frameworks of ‘creation, communication, delivery and exchange’ flesh out the procedural tool kit, whilst the CIM’s ‘identify, anticipate and satisfy’ structure can also assist in dealing with social marketing’s traditional difficulties of addressing areas of negative demand, or where the market is unaware of the need for the social marketing product (Andreasen, 2006; Andreasen, 1995; Kotler and Roberto, 1989).

Social marketing

Social marketing as a body of knowledge has a wide range of applications, case studies, theoretical models and definitional constructs. Kotler and Zaltman (1971) first coined the term ‘social marketing’ to describe what they saw as the use of marketing for the design, implementation and control of programmes calculated to influence the acceptability of social ideas and involving considerations of product planning, pricing, communication, distribution and marketing research. Although initially focused on influencing the acceptability of ideas, social marketing evolved into the behavioural outcomes focus through the later definitions from Kotler and Roberto (1989) A social change management technology involving the design, implementation and control of programmes aimed at increasing the acceptability of a social idea or practice in one or more groups of target adopters, and Kotler, Lee and Rothschild (2007) defining social marketing as a process that applies marketing principles and techniques to create, communicate, and deliver value in order to influence target audience behaviours that benefit society (public health, safety, the environment and communities) as well as the target audience. Similarly, Andreasen (1994) defined social marketing as the adaptation of commercial marketing technologies to programmes designed to influence the voluntary behaviour of target audiences to improve their personal welfare and that of the society of which they are a part, and later emphasised the behavioural orientation of the discipline by describing social marketing as the application of marketing technologies developed in the commercial sector to the solution of social problems where the bottom line is behaviour change. The behavioural orientation is also present within the official definition of social marketing by the National Social Marketing Centre which describes British social marketing as the systematic application of marketing concepts and techniques to achieve specific behavioural goals relevant to a social good (French and Blair-Stevens, 2006). Space restrictions prevent a discussion of further definitions of marketing although the definitions collected for analysis in the paper are listed Appendix 1.

continued...
Practitioners have relied on a range of commercial marketing derived techniques from the basic marketing mix such as pricing (Barbas and Horn 1993), distribution (Agha and Kusanthan 2003; Agha, Karlyn and Meekers 2001), promotion (Dutta-Bergman 2003; Dutta and Bodie, 2006) and product design (Marshall et al 2007) even where limits exist on the level of control over the nature of the product (Brinberg and Axelsson 2002). Social marketing practice also extends to more complex issues of branding (Andreasen, 2002a; Agha, Do and Armand 2006), communicating uncertain future benefits (Kotler and Lee, 2008), and the conversion of marketing research insight into behavioural outcomes (Andreasen, 2002b; Kotler and Zaltman, 1971). As social marketing deals with intangibles such as health, equity and social justice, it has also been at the forefront of examining how to use marketing for intangible value offerings from Wiebe's (1951-1952) paradigm setting question regarding broth and soap, to the Kotler and Zaltman (1971) definitive statement of marketing's applicability in the social change arena, and into the new paradigms of service dominant logic (Lusch, 2007) and customer co-creation of value (Brunner et 2007)

Social marketing can be applied at the micro-marketing level of individual behaviour change (Rothschild, 1999) through to macro-level influences in shaping personal decision choices by altering market conditions through upstream marketing (Goldberg, 1995; Andreasen, 2006) and moving into macro level efforts to address planetary behaviour change through preventing further global warming or addressing other multinational environmental issues (Bird, 2008). A small sample of recently published articles in 2008 has seen social marketing in application in Iraq for combating brucellosis (Maxwell and Bill, 2008), assisting in alleviating compulsive impulse shopping (Silvera et al, 2008); collaborating in cause related marketing (Thomas, 2008); grappling with the nature of 'cool' (Bird and Tapp, 2008); attempting to reduce syphilis rates (Darrow and Bierstecker 2008) and green marketing (Bird, 2008). Consequently, with such a broad sweep of practical applications, a relatively dynamic change environment in the definition of the parent discipline, and a need for adaptation to a range of non traditional areas of marketing application, social marketing understandably has a range of differing definitions.

Analysis of Social Marketing Definitions

For the purposes of this paper, forty five definitions of social marketing have been collected for thematic analysis. These definitions range from the Wiebe (1951-1952) 'selling brotherhood like soap' through to the recently released definition of social marketing by Kotler and Lee (2008). As evident from the data set which spans over four decades, there have been no shortage of additional attempts to refine, define and conceptualise social marketing. It is to the point that Andreasen (2006) recognised the lack of consensus as a possible weakness of the discipline. However, Stead et al (2007) points out that social marketing is not a single theory and is a structural framework that encompasses a discipline which draws on a range of bodies of knowledge. Similarly, in practice, Smith (2008) notes that social marketers are drawn from a diverse array of backgrounds such as health, marketing, science or public policy to name a few.

In the same vein, Burton (2001) notes in the discussion of critical marketing that the absence of a single overarching theory or definition is a feature, as critical marketing is comprised of three interrelated theoretical structures. Critical marketing is seen as a descendant of Lazer and Kelley's (1973) work where, under the guise of defining social marketing, they created a separate division of marketing thought that examined the consequences of marketing's actions as well as the business side sequences that led to this outcome. For the purpose of this paper, the author acknowledges Lazer and Kelley's (1973) definition as a foundation of critical marketing, rather than an integral part of social marketing's definition history.

Social marketing's lack of a universal definition can be seen to be a beneficial feature that allows for the fluidity of thought necessary for the adaptation and adoption of commercial marketing theory into the social change environment. The breadth of coverage when viewed through marketing thought can be seen as the use of the product portfolio concept whereby the differing definitions and applications of social marketing grouped under the shared generic product category name. Whilst most marketers would be able to define 'cola', few would be able to agree on the exact composition of the drink, and even fewer would agree that Coca Cola and PepsiCo should produce identical products. Consequently, if social marketing is considered the generic term for the involvement of marketing in social change campaigns, then the proliferation of definitions are simply a byproduct of marketing's desire to produce product variations to meet the specific needs of a target market – be that marketing journal editors, conference reviewers or government agencies. Competition, an inherent part of commercial marketing, will determine which definition attains the temporary ascendancy in the social marketing marketplace as the best representation of the current adaptations of commercial marketing.

Method and Text Mining

The definitions of marketing have been examined for thematic clustering through the use of the Leximancer text mining software. Leximancer operates as a stand-alone system that uses a machine learning protocol for textual analysis which results in a visualisation of common themes and related concept groups from textual data (Smith, 2000). This machine learning protocol was used to reduce human bias in the analysis, and to facilitate knowledge discovery by ascertaining underlying themes in the data through semantic and relationship information extraction (Smith and Humphreys, 2006).
Data set
Appendix 1 contains the full list of definitions used in the analysis. However, the paper cannot claim to contain a definitive list of social marketing definitions due to limitations on the definition selection process. The analysis excluded any website based definitions, blogs, trade press or government periodicals, and instead focused on the academic papers where social marketing was given a specific meaning for the context of the paper. This ensured that the concepts presented in the analysis had been subjected to peer review prior to publication, and the exposure to peer review is utilised as a proxy minimum quality standard measure.

Process and Results
The Leximancer analysis consisted of three stages. The initial analysis explored the data set for the presence of one or more dominant thematic clusters. Once the top level domain had been ascertained, subsequent analysis was used to explore within the dominant theme to examining clustering of concepts with the domain, and to test for any major overlap between these concept groups. Three visualisation maps have been provided to illustrate the phases of the analysis. Figure 1 represents the initial analysis to ascertain the primary conceptual domain(s) of the social marketing definitions.

Figure 1: Primary domain

Analysis 1 resulted in a confirmation of the apparently self evident – the dominant theme of the definitions is the application of marketing. Two items of note emerged from the conceptual clusters – first, the analysis detected the systematic use of marketing in the form of change programmes; and, second, the ‘influence’ was a significant factor. This connects to the previously stated assumption of social marketing as a form of voluntary change regime (Andreasen, 1995; Rothschild 1999).

For the second analysis, the Leximancer software was instructed to ignore the concept ‘marketing’ as a means to explore the interactions within the overall domain. This approach, in conjunction with the machine learning technique of the Leximancer software allowed the system to extract the major thematic groups within the definitions primary domain of ‘marketing’. This resulted in the discovery of a major thematic cluster under of ‘behaviour’ and a minor thematic cluster of ‘activities’ which are illustrated in Figure 2.

Figure 2: Secondary Thematic Groups

The ‘Behaviour’ cluster encompasses the majority of the identified outcomes of social marketing with concepts such as ‘society’, ‘change’, and ‘voluntary’. The behavioural orientation of social marketing is also supported throughout the social marketing literature as behaviours are easier to measure, observe and change than internal attitudes and belief (Almendarez, Boysun and Clark 2004). Behaviour can also be used as a learning tool to assist attitude change and value development through the ‘do-feel-learn’ model espoused by Kotler

continued...
The resultant thematic cluster of ‘Behaviour’ and ‘Voluntary’ reinforce social marketing as a non-coercive means of social change which rejects the Donovan and Henley (2003) inspired ‘involuntary change’ categorisation. The intersection set includes the voluntary exchange aspect of commercial marketing, alongside the role of social marketing as an influencer in society rather than a mandatory behaviour outcome. Within voluntary, there is also support for the Rothschild (2002) self interest through the location of ‘beneficial’ and ‘improve’ the voluntary set. In addition, ‘designed’ as part of the intersecting set represents the consistent theme of social marketing as a planned activity that is based on analysis, research and designed behaviour interventions (Kotler and Zaltman, 1971; Andreasen, 1995; Kotler and Lee, 2008). Finally, one further extension of the Leximancer analysis was conducted to ascertain the connection between the previously identified ‘activities’ minor thematic cluster, and the ‘voluntary’ and ‘behaviour’ major clusters. The linkage between the activities theme and the concepts of ‘research’ and ‘techniques’ is illustrated in Figure 4.

Figure 4: Overlapping Venn Set, and Connected Concepts

The link between ‘activities’ research and techniques recognising the input/output structure of social marketing as a research driven approach to understanding the consumer (inbound), and as behavioural change inducing intervention mechanisms (outbound).

Findings

Overall, the Leximancer thematic analysis of selected social marketing definitions identifies the primary domain conceptual of marketing, which is in line with the dominant view of social marketing as a sub discipline of the broader marketing framework (Kotler and Lee, 2008; Kotler and Zaltman, 1971). Second, within the broader marketing domain, there are three key areas that need to be recognised in the form of behavioural outcomes through voluntary change induced through marketing activities which include commercial techniques and market research. The analysis has produced a bounding set of expectations from prior research and practice. First, the definition needs to respect the pedigree of social marketing as part of the broader marketing discipline, and inclusive of the use of marketing techniques. Second, social marketing...
is a means for behavioural change, and this should be reflected in the definition in that behaviours are embedded in the individual consumer, and societal level change can only be affected (and effected) through mass adoption of individual level behaviours. Third, and finally, voluntary change, either explicitly or through the use of the exchange construct, is a necessary requirement for any conception of social marketing.

**Contemporary Social Marketing Definitions**

Two current definitions of social marketing have been identified in the literature as ‘best practice’ understanding of the conceptual domain of social marketing amongst English and American social marketers. The National Social Marketing Centre definition of social marketing was selected as representative of both contemporary British social marketing practice, and indicative of a government sanctioned and endorsed definition of marketing. The NSMC (2007) defines social marketing as the systematic application of marketing, alongside other concepts and techniques, to achieve specific behavioural goals, for a social good.

The second social marketing definition is taken from the most recent formal definition of marketing published by Kotler, Lee and Rothschild (2007) who outlined social marketing as a process that applies marketing principles and techniques to create, communicate, and deliver value in order to influence target audience behaviours that benefit society (public health, safety, the environment and communities) as well as the target audience. As one of the founding authors of social marketing, Kotler’s contemporary definition of social marketing was selected as an independent definition to contrast the government endorsed status of the NSMC (2007), and as a recognition of the influence of Kotler on the framing of the meaning of social marketing. These two definitions are first examined against the results of the Leximancer analysis where three key elements of social marketing have been identified as the recognition of marketing, a focus on behavioural change, and the emphasis on voluntary change (Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recognises marketing</td>
<td>applies marketing principles and techniques</td>
<td>systematic application of marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural focus?</td>
<td>target audience behaviours</td>
<td>achieve specific behavioural goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary?</td>
<td>influence</td>
<td>other concepts and techniques?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Significantly, the NSMC (2007) definition does not have an easily identifiable connection to the voluntary change. However, as a systematic application of marketing techniques, it is possible to imply the existence of the voluntary exchange through the application of commercial marketing exchange theory. That said, definition by implication has been a weakness of the AMA (2004) definition of commercial marketing (Dann, 2005; Gundlach, 2007; Dann and Dann, 2007), and remains a problematic approach that relies heavily on shared frames of reference for similar interpretations. The failure of shared frames of reference can be noted with the regional variation in the interpretation of the American Marketing Association (2004) marketing definition’s use of the term managing customer relationships which was either interpreted as the Nordic School of relationship marketing (Dann and Dann, 2007) or the Berryian school of database marketing through direct mail (AMA, 2007 in Dann and Dann, 2007). As both Kotler, Lee and Rothschild (2006) and the NSMC (2007) definition make reference to the application of marketing, Table 3 outlines the compatibility and points of crossover between the two commercial marketing definitions, and the two social marketing definitions highlighted in this paper.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Mechanism</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Market</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CIM (2005)</td>
<td>Management Process</td>
<td>Identify Anticipate</td>
<td>Satisfy (Profit)</td>
<td>Customer requirements (Profit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMA (2007)</td>
<td>Activity Processes Institution</td>
<td>Create Communicate Deliver Exchange</td>
<td>offerings that have value</td>
<td>Client Customer Partner Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSMC (2007)</td>
<td>Systematic application</td>
<td>marketing</td>
<td>achieve behavioural goals achieve social good</td>
<td>Targeted audience</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table examines four areas within the definitions – mechanism is the means by which marketing is applied, method is the techniques used in marketing, purpose is the reason for the marketing activities being conducted, and finally, market is the recipients of the marketing efforts. From the matrix in Table...
3, commercial and social marketing definitions can be seen to demonstrate appropriate levels of overlap between method, mechanism and market, and the disciplinary distinct purposes of behaviour influence, profit and exchanges of value. Whilst similarities are present between the four concepts of marketing, there are also opportunities presented by the AMA (2007) ‘create, communicate, deliver and exchange’ framework which are not present in the predecessor definitions, particularly Kotler, Rothschild and Lee’s (2007) definition which is heavily influenced by AMA (2004). Further, the CIM’s profit focus, when examined in terms of return on investment, or return of rewards greater than costs for the activities undertaken present opportunities for social marketing to consider the social pricing of marketing activities. Finally, the two definitions of social marketing predate the development of the AMA (2007), which, by the admission of the AMA was designed to recognise the contribution of social marketing to the broader marketing discipline. Consequently, there is a market opportunity to learn from the prior definitions and to build on the AMA (2007)’s recognition of social marketing to create a new definition that combines the key elements of the predecessors, and the two commercial marketing frameworks.

Developing the New Definition

As a result of the prior analysis, and consideration of the influences of the existing social and commercial marketing definitions, the paper defines social marketing as the adaptation and adoption of commercial marketing activities, institutions and process as a means to induce behavioural change on a temporary or permanent basis.

‘Behavioural change’ is achieved through the creation, communication, delivery and exchange of a competitive social marketing offer (ie new or adapted behaviour) that induces voluntary change in the targeted social group, and which results in benefit to the social change campaign’s recipients, partners and the broader society at large. A ‘competitive social marketing offer’ is an alternative behaviour that has been developed through the identification or anticipation of market need for an socially beneficial alternative behaviour that satisfies the same needs the individual is currently meeting through the consumption or use of less socially desirable good, service or idea. ‘Benefit’ is where the return on social investment through actual or perceived returns exceeds the financial and non financial costs of the social marketing activity.

There are five primary influences on the new definition of marketing – the AMA (2007), CIM (2005), Kotler, Lee and Rothschild (2006) and NSMC (2007) definitions, and the results of the Leximancer analysis. Core principles from the four definitions have been outlined in Figure 5, and the thematic frameworks that have been used to shape the new definition. In accordance with the results from the analysis of the prior definitions, the new definition consists of a three core themes – ‘marketing’, ‘behavioural outcomes’ and ‘voluntary activity’. A fourth element of ‘benefit’ has been added in recognition of the AMA (2007) exchange, NSMC 2007’s ‘social good’, CIM (2005) profitability, Rothschild’s (2002) self interest motivation, Bright (2000) observation of the need for cost effectiveness in social marketing, and finally, the exchange paradigm’s requirement of mutual benefit.

Figure 5. Core Principles and Influences on the New Definition of Social Marketing

continued...
Conclusion

The paper addresses the unification and reconciliation of multiple definitions of social and commercial marketing to create a social marketing definition that provides a robust framework for social marketing practice, and functional set of parameters to serve as a conceptual framework for academic social marketers.

The decision to develop a new definition of social marketing is based on three factors. First, the recent release of the new AMA definition of marketing provides a core marketing framework to adapt for social marketing purposes. Second, although marketing is a global discipline, the American Marketing Association definitions, and American social marketing research has had a strong influence on the conception of social marketing throughout the world. Although it is arguably a proportionate influence, social marketing is not an American enterprise, and as such, the influence of the British commercial and social marketing definitions should not be ignored. Further, with the National Social Marketing Centre at the vanguard of Anglo-European social marketing, the time is right to incorporate their research and knowledge into a disciplinary core. Third, although many definitions of social marketing exist, there has been limited research in exploring the commonality of themes, and the development of a social marketing framework based on analysing social marketing's self-identification. As several researchers have previously called for social marketing specific theory, this paper is attempting to deliver a disciplinary reflective analytical platform to move social marketing forward based on insights from the historical development of the discipline. Finally, with the broadening application of social marketing, and the recent challenges to the internet marketers trying to claim the definitional domain of social marketing for social media marketing, there is a need for clarification of the key themes of social marketing theory, practice and definition, even if the definition in this paper is not proposed as a universal framework, the paper has gathered together many of the key definitions of social marketing since the discipline's foundation.

References

AMA 1937 American marketing association: An Association for the Advancement of Science in Marketing : Proposal for Constitution and By-laws, Chicago: AMA
American Marketing Association 2004, 'Definition' Marketing News, September 15, 2004
American Marketing Association 2007 'Definition' MarketingPower.com
Andreasen, A, and Herzberg, B. 2005 Social Marketing Applied to Economic Reforms. Social Marketing Quarterly. 11(2):3-17
Bird, T (2008) We Have Ways to Make You Green ... Five secrets of successful social marketing, Alternatives Journal; 34 (1) 28-31
Brace-Govan, J and Harrick, J (2006) Is there a role for blogging in activist social marketing or can you blog brotherhood?, 3rd Australasian Nonprofit and Social Marketing Conference, 10-11 August 2006, Newcastle
continued...


Dann, S and Dann, S 2007 Competitive Marketing Strategy, Pearson, Sydney


Darrow W and Biersteker S 2008, Short-Term Impact Evaluation of a Social Marketing Campaign to Prevent Syphilis Among Men Who Have Sex With Men, American Journal of Public Health, 98 (2) 337-343


Dutta, M. J and Bodie, G 2006 health orientation as a predictor of exercising: a psychographic approach, Social Marketing Quarterly 11 (4) 3-18

Dutta-Bergman, M J (2003) Demographic and psychographic antecedents of community participation: applying a social marketing model, Social Marketing Quarterly, 9(2) 17-31


Lindenberger, J. 1999. Publisher’s Note. Social Marketing Quarterly, 5(4) 2-4


Maibach, E 2003 Recreating Communities to Support Active Living: A New Role for Social Marketing, American Journal of Health Promotion 18 (3) 114-119


Maxwell, J and BILL D 2008 Developing a Brucellosis Public Health Information and Awareness Campaign in Iraq, Military Medicine 173 (1) 79-84


Maxwell, J and BILL D 2008 Developing a Brucellosis Public Health Information and Awareness Campaign in Iraq, Military Medicine 173 (1) 79-84


CoreFiles/NSMC_Social_Marketing_BENCHMARK_CRITERIA_Sept2007.pdf


continued...
Social marketing is a tool with which an agency responsible for spreading ideas can enhance its understanding of that function. Fine (1990b) argued that social marketing should be used to address socially desirable aims; that is, objectives that benefit society as a whole. Fine (1990a) defined social marketing as the application of marketing methods to the dissemination of ideas – socially beneficial ideas – to create a demand for socially beneficial outcomes.

Donovan (1997) and Albrecht (1997) both emphasized the importance of using social marketing to address social issues and promote social change. They argued that social marketing provides a conceptual framework that guides strategy development, the use of formative research to gain input from the people the intervention plans to reach, and the evaluation of programme effectiveness in terms of achieving desired outcomes.

Bryant, Forthofer, McCormack-Brown and McDermott (1999) highlighted the importance of targeting social marketing efforts to specific segments of the population. They argued that social marketing requires a deep understanding of the audience and their needs and preferences.

Bailey (1997) and Stead, Gordon, Angus, and McDermott (2007) both emphasized the importance of evaluating the effectiveness of social marketing initiatives. They argued that social marketing is a dynamic and evolving field, and that ongoing evaluation is essential to ensure that social marketing efforts are effective.

Rothschild (2001) added that social marketing should be used to address social issues in a more systematic and business-like manner. He argued that social marketing should be used to address social issues that have significant economic, social, and political consequences.

Smith (2001) argued that social marketing should be used to address social issues in a way that is consistent with ethical principles. He argued that social marketers should be guided by a relevant and culturally sensitive ethical framework.

Andreasen and Herzberg (2005) added that social marketing should be used to address social issues in a way that is consistent with the principles of marketing. They argued that social marketing should be used to address social issues in a way that is consistent with the principles of marketing, and that social marketers should be guided by a relevant and culturally sensitive ethical framework.

Smith (2004) argued that social marketing should be used to address social issues in a way that is consistent with the principles of marketing. He argued that social marketing should be used to address social issues in a way that is consistent with the principles of marketing, and that social marketers should be guided by a relevant and culturally sensitive ethical framework.

Appendix 1: Social Marketing Definition Data Set

Albrecht (1997) defined social marketing as the application of commercial marketing techniques to individual and societal benefit, rather than commercial gain. Social marketing creates induced, yet voluntary behaviour change (through persuasion) and the technique is based on strong research related to segmented audience needs and perceived barriers.

Andreasen (1995, p110, in Smith 2001) defined the application of commercial marketing technologies to programmes designed to influence the voluntary behaviour of target audiences to improve their personal welfare and that of the society of which they are a part.

Andreasen and Herzberg (2005) argued that social marketing is a tool with which an agency responsible for spreading ideas can enhance its understanding of that function and carry it out in a more systematic and business-like manner.

Gibbs (1997) defined social marketing as an attempt to influence consumers for the greater good, and as such, always has an ethical aspect.
Social Marketing seeks to induce consumer change that is deemed inherently good as opposed to change that is good merely because it increases profits or non-profit earnings.


Hastings (2002) — Social marketing is about technology transfer…

Kirby (1997 in Albrecht 1997) — The application of appropriate marketing tools and the systematic analysis, development, implementation, evaluation and integration of a set of comprehensive, scientifically based ethically informed and user relevant programme components designed to ultimately influence behaviour change that benefits society.

Kotler 1975 utilizes market segmentation, consumer research, concept development, communications, facilitation, incentives and the exchange theory to maximise target group response

Kotler and Lee (2004) — Corporate social marketing is a means whereby a corporation supports the development and/or implementation of a behaviour change campaign intended to promote public health, safety the environment or community well being.

Kotler and Roberto (1989) — A social change management technology involving the design, implementation and control of programmes aimed at increasing the acceptability of a social idea or practice in one or more groups of target adopters

Kotler and Zaltman (1971) — social marketing is the design, implementation and control of programmes calculated to influence the acceptability of social ideas and involving considerations of product planning, pricing, communication, distribution and market research

Kotler, Lee and Rothschild (2007) — Social marketing is a process that applies marketing principles and techniques to create, communicate, and deliver value in order to influence target audience behaviours that benefit society (public health, safety, the environment and communities) as well as the target audience.

Kotler, Roberto and Lee (2002) — ‘the use of marketing principles and techniques to influence a target audience to voluntarily accept, reject, modify, or abandon a behaviour for the benefit of individuals, groups or society as a whole.

Lindengerger (1999) — ‘a means by which complex and complicated populations can be understood; methods to apply multidisciplinary expertise to problems; and the technology for managing behaviour change programmes in coordinated fashion’

MacFadyen, Stead and Hastings (1999 in Hastings 2002) — Marketing…can also encourage people to adopt behaviours that will enhance their own - and their fellow citizens’ - lives

Maibach, Abroms and Marois 2007 — the use of marketing to elicit health behaviour change from individuals

Maibach, Rothschild and Novelli (2002 in Maibach, 2002). social marketing is a process that attempts to create voluntary exchange between a marketing organisation and members of a target market based on mutual fulfillment of self-interest. The marketing organisation uses its resources to understand the perceived interests of the target market members, to enhance and deliver the package of benefits associated with a product, service or idea, and to reduce barriers that interfere with its adoption or maintenance. Target market members in turn, expend their resources in exchange for the offer when it provides clear advantages over alternative behaviours. Success of the social marketing programme is defined primarily in terms of its contributions to the well being of target market members or to society as a whole

Maxwell and Bill 2008 — a method that uses commercial marketing technologies to influence voluntary behaviour of target audiences to improve their personal health and welfare

NSMC (2005) — The systematic application of marketing concepts and techniques to achieve specific behavioural goals relevant to a social good.

NSMC 2007 — The systematic application of marketing, alongside other concepts and techniques, to achieve specific behavioural goals, for a social good

O’Hara et al 2007 — Social marketing is the utilization of traditional marketing practices to inform, persuade, and promote action to induce behavioural change for the benefit of individuals and society

Olshesfly, et al 2007 — social marketing applies marketing techniques used successfully in mass marketing and advertising to promote increase in knowledge, behaviour change and social change

Rothschild (1999 in Maibach, 2002) — social marketing consists of voluntary exchanges between two or more parties in which each is trying to further its own perceived self interest whilst recognising the need to accommodate the perceived self interest of the other to achieve its own ends

Rothschild (2001 in Andreasen, 2001) — ‘marketing refers to attempts to manage behaviour by offering positive reinforcing incentives and/or consequences in the environment. The choice environment is made favorable for appropriate behaviour through the development of alternatives with comparative advantage (products and services), favourable cost-benefit relationships (pricing) and time and place utility enhancement (channels of distribution) (p19)

Rothschild (2002) — [Social] Marketing is based on the concept of creating an exchange wherein the agent offers the person the best possible set of benefits while reducing the barriers to making that choice.

Rothschild (2004 in Newton-Ward, 2004 et al) — social marketing offers voluntary choices within an environment that encourages and supports responsible and progressive choices.

Schwartz (1997 in Albrecht 1997) — A programme planning process which promotes voluntary behaviour change based on building beneficial exchange relationships with a target audience for the benefit of society.

Smith (1997 in Albrecht 1997) — A large scale programme planning process designed to influence the voluntary behaviour of a specific audience segment to achieve a social rather than a financial objective and based upon offering benefits the audience wants, reducing barriers the audience faces; and/or using persuasion to influence the segment’s intention to act favourably

Smith (1997 in Albrecht 1997) — ‘any marketing programme for the primary purpose of promoting socially beneficial behaviour rather than financial gain’

Smith (1998) — ‘social marketing for me is about social change, individual behaviour change and structural adjustments to obviate the behaviour or enable it to occur’

Smith (2002) — Social marketing is a process for promoting voluntary social change

Smith (2005) — …marketing designed exclusively to improve the social condition of a marketing segment

Stead et al 2007 — is the use of marketing concepts in programmes designed to influence the voluntary behaviour of target audiences in order to improve health and society

Sutton (1996 in Hastings, MacFadyen and Anderson, 2000) — Social marketing practice is guided by theories of human behaviour that help us think about consumers’ motivations and influences and measure the outcomes of our programmes.

Wiebe (1951-1952) — Selling brotherhood like soap
How is value created? A process model for value creation in government social marketing services

Nadia Zainuddin
School of Advertising, Marketing and Public Relations
Queensland University of Technology
GPO Box 2434, Brisbane QLD 4001 Australia
Phone: +61 7 3138 8393
Fax: +61 7 3138 1811
Email: n.zainuddin@qut.edu.au

Josephine Previte
UQ Business School
University of Queensland
St Lucia 4072 Australia
Phone: +61 7 3381 1075
Fax: + 61 7 3365 6988
Email: j.previte@business.uq.edu.au

Rebekah Russell-Bennett
School of Advertising, Marketing and Public Relations
Queensland University of Technology
GPO Box 2434, Brisbane QLD 4001 Australia
Phone: +61 7 3864 2894
Fax: +61 7 3138 1811
Email: rebekah.bennett@qut.edu.au

Value creation is an area with long-standing importance in the marketing field, yet only limited empirical work has been published to date that explicates the value construct. The significance of value creation is well recognised in the academic literature. Within marketing, value is a core concept (Woodruff 1997). It is considered a fundamental basis for all marketing activity (Holbrook 1994) and an absolute necessity for the continued existence and (in the case of commercial marketing) success of a firm (Slater 1997). In the context of social marketing, the receipt of value can be regarded as an incentive for consumers to perform desirable behaviours that contribute towards greater social good. However the value creation process has not been the focus of social marketing research. Thus the aim of the research outlined in this paper is to conceptualise the influence of value on the outcomes of a social marketing programme, through an understanding of the value creation process.

The main challenge of social marketing is not just creating socially desirable behaviour change in individuals, but also sustaining it. This research proposes that in order to convince individuals to perform and maintain socially desirable behaviours, value must be created and offered to them as an incentive for doing so. Often it is government departments that implement policy and strategies to create behavioural change in its citizens. Additionally, governments are charged with the responsibility of positively shaping society (Ryan, Parker and Brown 2003). Social marketing is a social change process frequently used by governments to perform this activity as it provides a management framework to guide the targeting of changes in social structures that can facilitate individual behaviour change in order to reach their potential (Donovan and Henley 2003). This includes ensuring that individuals have access to basic human rights, such as health services, housing, and education, which impact on health status (Gruskin, Pfaffker and Smith-Estelle 2001). These changes subsequently impact on society overall and government departments are in the best position to implement and enforce structural change. Interestingly, only minimal research has been published to date that explains the influence of government decision-making on social marketing practice. As such, government organisations have been selected as the context of this research.

In many instances in government, the nature of the social product tends to be services-oriented rather than goods-based. With the dominance of services (rather than goods) as the social product offered by government social marketers, this research draws upon services marketing theories. In adopting this focus, the research applies Lovelock, Patterson and Walker’s (2004) services typology to refine the conceptualisation of value in government social marketing services.

Specifically, services directed at people rather than at possessions are addressed. Government social marketing services aimed at people are selected because a significant proportion of government social marketing campaigns are targeted at people (such as healthy lifestyle and healthcare) rather than at their possessions (such as recycling). No distinction is made between tangible and intangible actions as there are elements of continued...
both in many government services. For example in education services, the tangible elements include books and learning facilities, while the intangible elements include skills gained through working in groups. As such, an examination of value creation in the context of government social marketing services is used.

Despite the importance of value creation, there is little research in the field to address the value construct and there are no commonly accepted value measures (Sweeney and Soutar 2001). Thus the guiding research question to be addressed by this study is:

**How is value created in a government social marketing service?**

It is important to address this question as it is necessary to establish a firm understanding of the value construct. Furthermore, government services that use social marketing are widely utilised by the community and these services contribute to the greater social good. This demonstrates the relevance of examining value creation in this context.

In the published literature, Sweeney's (2003) Customer Value Development Model provides a useful starting point in understanding how value is created for consumers in government services. The model (see Figure 1) outlines the consumption stages by which consumers go through in their determination of value received from a service interaction with important stakeholders. In addition, it also reveals that value is dynamic, dialogic and experiential.

**Proposed model of value creation in social marketing**

A process model of value creation with a social marketing focus is proposed in this research. In proposing a value creation model for social marketing, there are critical elements that require attention. Firstly, there may be different types of value that exist in social marketing. For example in recycling programmes, consumers may derive altruistic value from knowing they are contributing towards the conservation of resources. On the other hand, for health screening programmes, consumers derive emotional value from knowing they have taken the necessary preventative measures to safeguard their health and wellbeing. Secondly, there may be different sources of value that influence the type of value that exists in social marketing for consumers. For example, informational value sources might lead consumers to derive functional value from understanding the facts about a government service.

The proposed model (Figure 2) builds on Sweeney’s Customer Value Development Model by including four types of value from Holbrook (2006) and Sheth, Newman and Gross (1991) as well as including four sources of value from Smith and Colgate (2007). Next, a consumption stage is added to reflect the significance of interactions as a key element of services, regardless of whether they are interpersonal or automated. The first three stages of the proposed model have been renamed pre-consumption, consumption and post-consumption to reflect the nature of social marketing services as being those that are widely consumed by citizens, rather than being purchased. A feedback loop is also incorporated as often in social marketing, while individuals may adopt a behaviour, this is often temporary and not maintained. This is reflected in the Stages of Change model by Prochaska, Norcross and DiClemente (2005) which highlights that trial behaviour is not the final stage, but is followed by a behavioural maintenance stage. This is an important inclusion to the proposed model as social marketers are focused on achieving sustained behavioural change.

continued...
Other key social marketing outcomes for government social marketing services are satisfaction for the consumers, leading to behavioural intention to perform the desired social behaviour. The outcome from this value creation process will be sustained behavioural change. Existing measures of satisfaction, behavioural intentions and outcomes (see Figure 2) are useful measures to report sustainable change. Again, there is no empirical support to show how the value creation process influences these key outcomes for social marketing. Thus the proposed model contributes to the field by demonstrating how value creation affects key outcomes of social marketing.

The purpose of providing this model is to conceptualise and indicate research opportunities to empirically test value creation in a government social marketing service. However, to date there has been no value scale published that measures value creation with a government social marketing service orientation. A proposed research design that could usefully inform the conceptualisation of the model should commence with a qualitative exploratory investigation in order to identify the types and sources of value that exist at the first three stages of the proposed model. Insights gained from this exploratory research can then be used for the modification of existing value scales to produce value measures for a government social marketing service. Following these two research phases, measures can then be used to empirically test the value creation process model for government social marketing services. It is anticipated that the results from this proposed research design will yield several contributions to both theory and practice.

Conclusion
Theoretically, this research will clarify the concept of value creation in a government social marketing services context. It is anticipated that this research will provide an explanation for a value creation process model for government social marketing services. More importantly, this research could be used to further explain the influence of value creation on social marketing outcomes.

Practically, this research could be used to clarify the expectations of value that customers have of government service organisations through the identification of the types of value that exist at the first three stages of the value creation process model. Furthermore, the research will also explain how different sources of value can influence the different types of value consumers receive from government service organisations. Arguably this will present a more practical understanding of what causes behavioural change in consumers. Most importantly, this research would provide a diagnostic tool for improving organisational strategies through the development of more effective social marketing campaigns.

References
Donovan, Rob and Henley, Nadine (2003), Social Marketing Principles and Practice. Melbourne: IP Communications.

continued...


Fear Appeals – Lancaster Room

Examining the Effect of Fear Patterns with Repeated Exposures

Jennifer Algie¹, Sandra C. Jones² and John R. Rossiter¹

¹ School of Management and Marketing ²Centre for Health Initiatives, University of Wollongong

Abstract

This study used an experimental design to test the advertising wear-out of fear-relief and fear-only patterns in fear appeal anti-speeding advertisements, using both static and dynamic measures of fear. A driver-behaviour simulation test, which had previously been shown to be a valid and reliable test of drivers’ speed choice across a range of realistic driving situations, was used as the predictive dependent variable. The static measure findings of this study, that investigated consumer reactions to fear-appeal TV commercials over repeated exposures, were that emotion and attention wear-out occurred immediately for both fear patterns, while persuasiveness of each of the advertisements, in terms of reduction in speeding behaviour, were highest for the fear-relief advertisements. The dynamic measure findings were that the pattern of felt fear and relief, if any, remained constant with successive exposures, although the level of fear experienced diminished by a third (fear-relief) to a half (fear-only). Despite some loss of ‘fearfulness’, the fear-relief commercial continued to be effective in reducing (simulated) speeding behaviour when repetition progressed from moderate to heavy.

Keywords

Fear appeals, fear patterns, advertising wear-out, repeated exposures, continuous measurement, road safety advertising.

Introduction

A pattern of fear is the sequence of fear arousal and fear reduction, if any, that is felt by the viewing audience when exposed to a fear appeal advertisement. A previous study (Thornton, 2006) had identified two main types of fear patterns within four anti-speeding television commercials – fear-relief and fear-only. A fear-relief pattern involves arousing fear and causing the audience to experience an unpleasant feeling that is then reduced by showing the consequences of the recommended behaviour. A fear-only pattern, commonly used in road safety advertising, is created by only arousing fear and not reducing fear by providing relief components within an advertisement. This study investigates advertising wear-out of fear patterns within anti-speeding TV commercials using both static and dynamic measures of fear and compares the behavioural effectiveness of fear-only and fear-relief advertisements with moderate and heavy repetition.

Research Objectives

The research objectives of this study were: first, to determine if the two patterns (fear-only and fear-relief) remained effective over successive exposures or if they wore out, in regard to both attention wear-out and emotion (fear, shock and relief) wear-out; and second, to measure the behavioural effects of ‘moderate’ and ‘heavy’ repetition of fear-appeal advertisements.

Justification for the Research

It is important to consider the effect of repeated exposures on the two types of fear patterns as both theoretically and practically it is more useful to know the effect of the patterns after several exposures, given that most advertisers, in any domain (commercial or social marketing) aim for at least three exposures (to inform, persuade, remind) of a television advertisement to a target audience, and often achieve many more exposures. These ‘many more’ exposures may cause a fear-appeal TV commercial to ‘wear-out’, losing its persuasive effect. Given the budget constraints, particularly of government departments and road safety authorities, television advertisements in road safety campaigns have to remain effective during multiple viewings as it is too expensive and inefficient to produce advertisements that will have an initial effect but then have to be replaced regularly due to loss of attention or impact. ‘Shock’ advertising has been a...

continued...
popular technique used by Australian road safety authorities in recent years, and it is believed that shock advertisements lose their impact after just a few exposures because their ‘shock value’ diminishes quickly (Moore and Harris, 1996; Tedmanson, 2001). This loss of ‘shock value’ was referred to by Hughes (1992, p.61) as wearout, that is, ‘a reduction in subjects’ favourable responses after repeated exposures to a message. A favourable response from the social marketer’s perspective, in relation to fear appeal advertisements, would be that the target audience does feel fear, and as a result of this feeling, does intend to adopt the promoted behaviour. Advertising wear-out is very important to commercial companies and there have been numerous studies (Henderson-Blair and Rabuck, 1998; Pechmann and Stewart, 1988) that have investigated wear-out of advertising for general products and services. The measures used for wear-out in these previous studies included sales, purchase intent, awareness, recall, persuasion, reminder potential and competitive imagery (Scott and Solomon, 1998). When studying advertising wear-out in social marketing, different measures of wear-out apply, such as expected changes in social behaviour rather than buying behaviour. This study examines the issue of advertising wear-out in the area of anti-speeding advertising as the wear-out of fear appeal anti-speeding advertisements has received minimal attention by previous researchers.

There are several causes of wear-out. It can occur because of diminished attention, counter-learning (interference) from other advertisements, or loss of acceptance due to counter-arguing with the message (over-exposure) (Rossiter and Percy, 1997). Emotion wear-out, for example diminished fear due to habituation, also occurs and is particularly important for social marketing advertisements as the issues or causes being promoted largely rely on emotions to motivate the target audience to act in a socially desirable way. Action measures of wear-out can be used (Stewart, 1999); for example, brand choice after advertisement exposure or in the instance of anti-speeding advertisements, speed choice.

Both Ephron (1995) and Jones (1997) raise several disadvantages of media scheduling following the effective frequency theory. This theory assumes the traditional perspective on advertising scheduling by purporting that advertising has to be repetitive for consumers to learn and remember advertising messages (Ephron 1995). It must be noted, however, that their research is in regard to advertising for commercial products and services, with no mention of the implications of, or generalisability to, social marketing messages. The new model that both authors support is based on continuous advertising that involves an advertisement being exposed to consumers only once just prior to their weekly purchase. The new model represents a shift from a focus on frequency to a focus on reach. The research suggests that one exposure to a brand message has a greater effect on brand share than additional exposures (Ephron, 1995, p.18). However, this rule holds only for well-known and established brands in a market. Ephron also stated that learning theory is largely irrelevant because brands are competing for purchases, not teaching messages (Ephron, 1995, p.20). These opinions demonstrate that both journal articles focus on commercial brands with data for each study being collected from such sources as AC Nielsen scanning data. Research is required that explores effective frequency in social marketing areas, where learning theory is still relevant and where there are fewer competing brands (for example speeding behaviour versus driving within the speed limit).

There is no research regarding how viewers react during repeated exposures to fear appeals. Studies of repeated exposures to investigate ‘wear-out’ have typically used positive-appeal commercials for products (e.g., Belch, 1982; Machleit and Wilson, 1988; Silk and Vavra, 1974). Positive-appeal commercials have also been used in all previous studies using continuous ‘moment-to-moment’ recording of reaction patterns to TV commercials (Aaker, Stayman, and Hagerty, 1986; Baumgartner, Sujan, and Padgett, 1997), which is the pattern-recording method employed in this study.

The two types of fear patterns, given repeated exposures, may result in different effects. It is argued that a fear-only advertisement is likely to suppress the bad behaviour only temporarily. Therefore, there is a need for frequent reminders, which is the reason why road safety advertisers often select a heavy media schedule for their hard-hitting ‘shock’ (fear-only) campaigns. These fear-only advertisements (especially the ‘shock’ subtype advertisement) may lose their ‘shock value’ with repeated viewings however, as mentioned previously, this is an uninvestigated question.

There is a distinction between emotion wear-out of feelings such as fear, shock and tension, and behavioural wear-out, that is measured by using a driving-simulation task. It is highly likely that emotion wear-out will occur quite quickly with successive exposures of a fear-only advertisement. That is, once viewers have initially seen a fear-only advertisement and have experienced feeling ‘shocked’ by the graphic images, it is likely that they will be significantly less shocked on repeated viewings of the advertisement. If emotion wear-out does occur quite quickly this would be of concern to road safety advertisers who believe in the principles of positive punishment, as this theory would require the audience to feel as fearful as possible to have the greatest behavioural effect. Correspondingly, fear-relief pattern advertisements could be considered blander than the fear-only (‘shock’) advertisements, and thus may lose viewers’ attention more quickly, resulting in fewer (or weaker) negative reinforcement ‘trials’. This behavioural effect of repetition of both fear-only and fear-relief advertisements, that is the more important outcome in regard to meeting the objectives of road safety advertisements, is unknown and requires investigation.

**Method for Obtaining Static Measures of Advertising Wear-out**

An experimental design was the method used to address the research objectives in this study. This involved an advertising experiment that tested the effectiveness of two types of underlying ‘patterns’ of fear arousal continued...
Social marketers find it difficult to define advertisement effectiveness measures because of a large amount of uncontrollable variables therefore an advertisement experiment is extremely useful for predicting the effectiveness of an advertisement. The major advantage of using an experimental design to measure the effectiveness of various advertisements is the greater control of extraneous factors than if testing the advertisements in their natural setting of in-home viewing. For example, Cacioppo and Gardner (1999, p.89) stated that laboratory studies can afford impressive control over relevant variables, an important feature when dissecting phenomena as complex and multiply determined as the emotions. The effects of the advertisements are more likely to be isolated when other variables are controlled, such as the age of the viewing audience, number of advertisement exposures, similarity in time of measurement, and avoidance of competing advertisements. The major drawback of this experimental design is an artificial setting for viewing advertisements.

A post-only monadic experimental design was used for the static wear-out study to avoid sensitising the audience to the purpose of the study. A total of 284 participants, from a first-year marketing class, divided into four experimental groups, took part in the experiment. For three consecutive weeks each group viewed one advertisement (the same advertisement) per week and then completed a questionnaire pertaining to the advertisement after each viewing session. The advertisements were shown in tutorial classes. The assignment of the four advertisements to various tutorial classes was based on convenience, given the relative randomness of how students were allocated to tutorials in the first instance (that is, by a computer programme that allocated tutorial places for students at the beginning of session). No quota sampling was undertaken, which resulted in an uneven gender balance in the experimental groups. There was also an attrition rate over the three weeks of the experiment, with many students not attending all three sequential weeks of tutorials. Hence, while there was an initial group of 284 students in week one, the number of usable responses dropped to 87 when analysing only those participants who were present in all three weeks of the study. The drop-out participants from the study, who were students who missed one or two tutorials within the three-week testing period, had no special characteristics or differences to those who remained in the study. This study was given ethics approval by the University's Human Research Ethics Committee. Participants were offered a $AUD20 bookstore voucher if they completed the three week task. Every participant was also thanked with a $1 charity chocolate.

A separate group of 42 participants was used for the control group that undertook the Video Speed Test. The Video Speed Test (VST) developed by British researchers Horswill and McKenna (1999), involved participants watching a video of seven short scenes of a person driving a vehicle in real driving situations. After each scene, participants indicated how much faster or slower, if at all, they would drive in that situation. That is, the test measured the person’s tendency to speed up or slow down in each of the varied, driver-as-camera, videotaped driving scenarios. The VST has been shown to correlate highly with self-reported habitual speeding and to be statistically significantly related to drivers’ past involvement in speed-related accidents (Horswill and McKenna, 1999). The participants were also university marketing students aged 18-25 years old and therefore were of a similar demographic composition to those participants in the experimental groups. Bloom and Novelli (1981) pointed to the need for a control group for studies. The control group was not shown an advertisement prior to undertaking the VST, as other advertisements may have included arousing elements that would influence speed choice.

### Table 1: Description of the experimental advertisements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fear-relief advertisements</th>
<th>Fear-only advertisements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement 1 – ‘Pizza’ showed a pedestrian being hit by a speeding car, a surgeon then commenting on how speed caused the fatal injuries, followed by a second scenario showing in slow motion the pedestrian’s body being hit by the car (fear component) and then a final recommendation by the surgeon to reduce speed with a different scenario showing a person driving below the speed limit who was able to stop their car and not hit the pedestrian (relief component).</td>
<td>Advertisement 3 – ‘Pram’ showed three different speeding scenarios with a car avoiding, frightening, then hitting a pedestrian (fear component), with information at the end of the advertisement about stopping distances at different speeds, and a recommendation to drive more slowly in local streets (relief component).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement 2 – ‘Trike’ showed visuals of children riding tricycles on a driveway with audio of a catchy and upbeat jingle; a child then riding his trike onto the road and being hit by a speeding motorist with audio of screeching brakes followed by a dramatised heartbeat sound (fear component)</td>
<td>Advertisement 4 – ‘4WD’ showed a mother driving her children to school in a 4WD speeding along local streets; and on her way to the school she ran over a child crossing the road and killed him (fear component).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

continued...
Results: Static Measures of Fear Patterns with Repeated Exposures

Table 2 provides a summary of the various demographic and driving characteristics of the participants of the study. Chi-square and analysis of variance (ANOVA) were undertaken that determined that each of the experimental groups were not statistically significantly different in terms of their average age, years of driving experience, regularity of driving, and speeding history and behaviour. The advertisements did not differ in terms of the advertisement execution variables of realism, believability, ability to convince, and relatedness to the target audience. However, the groups did differ by gender, with groups three and four containing a significantly greater proportion of females. A split sample by gender was therefore conducted in the ANOVAs.

Tables 3 and 4 show the wear-out of fear, shock and relief and attention for participants who participated in all three weeks of the study. Repeated measures analysis of variance was used to test for wear-out on the fear, shock, relief and attention measures of wear-out. Fear, shock, and relief were measured on a 4-point answer scale, whereby participants were asked to rate how fearful, shocked or relieved they felt when viewing the advertisement, with 0 equal to ‘not at all’, 1 equal to ‘slightly’, 2 equal to ‘quite’ and 3 equal to ‘extremely’.

Table 2: Test for equivalence of participant groups (static measures)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ad 1 - Pizza (n=27)</th>
<th>Ad 2 - Penn (n=15)</th>
<th>Ad 3 - Trike (n=23)</th>
<th>Ad 4 - 4WD (n=22)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants (Wk 1)</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants (all weeks)</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average age</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age range</td>
<td>17-30</td>
<td>17-27</td>
<td>17-26</td>
<td>17-27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avg yrs of driving</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender (Male per cent)</td>
<td>52 per cent</td>
<td>37 per cent</td>
<td>57 per cent</td>
<td>31 per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speeding fine</td>
<td>27 per cent</td>
<td>21 per cent</td>
<td>16 per cent</td>
<td>22 per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regularity of driving</td>
<td>56 per cent</td>
<td>54 per cent</td>
<td>69 per cent</td>
<td>69 per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood of speeding</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>2.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realistic</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>2.55</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>2.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Believable</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>2.51</td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>2.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convincing</td>
<td>2.65</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>2.74</td>
<td>2.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related to driver</td>
<td>.31</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related to situation</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seen the advertisement before</td>
<td>5.0 per cent</td>
<td>4.0 per cent</td>
<td>3.8 per cent</td>
<td>3.2 per cent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the first week, Advertisement 4 (4WD) had the highest level of fear. The higher rate of wear-out for the fear-only advertisements seemed to have been caused by a higher initial (Week 1) fear rating. It should be noted that after three weeks of exposure Advertisements 1, 2 (fear-relief) and 4 (fear-only) had the same rating of fear. All of the advertisements decreased in fear by the third weekly exposure, but Advertisement 3 (Trike) had the highest wear-out rate of fear (53 per cent). Advertisement 3 (Trike) had the highest recording of shock in the first week of the study and had the highest wear-out, but in this instance it was for the emotion of ‘shock’. All the advertisements had higher wear-out rates (percentages) for the emotion of shock than for the emotion of fear. Each of the advertisements provided very little relief to the participants, however, as expected, the fear-relief pattern advertisements, Advertisements 1 and 2, had higher ratings of relief, than the fear-only advertisements, Advertisements 3 and 4. The relief scores for Advertisements 2 (fear-relief) and 4 (fear-only) actually increased after the third exposure. Participants’ relief scores therefore differed across the types of advertisements. Open-ended responses could perhaps better explain this occurrence, thus in future studies reactions to advertisements could also be obtained using both closed-ended and open-ended responses.

Table 3: Emotion wear-out

continued...
Attention was measured on a 5-point scale, with 5 indicating that the participant ‘paid absolute attention to the advertisement’, 4 indicating that the participant ‘watched most of the advertisement’, 3 indicating that the participant ‘only watched half the advertisement’, 2 indicating that the participant ‘hardly paid any attention to the advertisement’ and 1 indicating that the participant ‘ignored the advertisement entirely’ due primarily to the artificial exposure situation. Repeated-measures ANOVA found that attention wear-out occurred for Advertisements 1, 3 and 4. There was, however, minimal attention wear-out for each advertisement given the viewing environment was a classroom setting, therefore greater attention is expected than in an in-home viewing situation. Despite participants being shown an advertisement each week, meaning forced exposure to the advertisement, this did not mean forced attention, as there was still some diminishing effect on attention over the three weeks of the experiment, demonstrating that absolute attention is not paid to advertisements, even in experimental settings.

Table 4: Attention wear-out

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ad 1 – Pizza (n=30)</th>
<th>Ad 2 – Pram (n=17)</th>
<th>Ad 3 – Trike (n=26)</th>
<th>Ad 4 – 4WD (n=25)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Week 1</td>
<td>4.87</td>
<td>4.76</td>
<td>4.78</td>
<td>4.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week 2</td>
<td>4.63</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>4.62</td>
<td>4.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Week 3</td>
<td>4.23</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>4.04</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wear-out – Week 1 to 3</td>
<td>13 per cent</td>
<td>2 per cent</td>
<td>15 per cent</td>
<td>17 per cent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F statistic (repeated measures)</td>
<td>4.72</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>6.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sig</td>
<td>.017</td>
<td>ns</td>
<td>.040</td>
<td>.007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The VST measure of speed choice (after the third exposure) showed significant differences between advertisements (F = 3.47, p = .01). A post-hoc test (Least Significant Difference) was undertaken, given the significant finding of ANOVA, and revealed that the mean score for Advertisement 3 (Trike) was significantly higher than the mean scores for both Advertisements 1 (Pizza) and 2 (Pram). The VST mean scores are reported by total and gender due to the larger proportion of females in groups 2 and 4 as shown in Table 5. The control group’s average score was +6.98 km/hr (male = 8.03, female = 5.79). Advertisement 3 (mean = +8.7 km/hr; m = 11.0, f = 6.3) resulted in the highest VST speed, despite receiving high scores for evoking fear and shock. Advertisement 3 was significantly different to Advertisements 1 (+4.2 km/hr; m = 6.2, f = 2.1) and Advertisement 2 (+3.3 km/hr; m = 7.9, f = 2.5), but not to Advertisement 4 (+5.8 km/hr; m = 7.5, f = 4.9). Advertisement 2 (Pram) and Advertisement 1 (Pizza) were more persuasive advertisements in terms of reduced speed, particularly for females.

Table 5: Behavioural measure of advertisement effectiveness – VST dependent variable (Participants in all three weeks of the study – static rating condition)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advertisement</th>
<th>Total avg VST kms/hr</th>
<th>Male avg VST kms/hr</th>
<th>Female avg VST kms/hr</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement 1 – Pizza</td>
<td>4.18 (n = 30)</td>
<td>6.22 (n = 15)</td>
<td>2.13 (n = 15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement 2 – Pram</td>
<td>3.30 (n = 16)</td>
<td>7.92 (n = 2)</td>
<td>2.52 (n = 14)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement 3 – Trike</td>
<td>8.72 (n = 24)</td>
<td>10.95 (n = 14)</td>
<td>6.33 (n = 10)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertisement 4 – 4WD</td>
<td>5.76 (n = 19)</td>
<td>7.50 (n = 6)</td>
<td>4.87 (n = 13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>6.98 (n = 51)</td>
<td>8.03 (n = 27)</td>
<td>5.79 (n = 24)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Method for Obtaining Dynamic Measures of Advertising Wear-out

This study also examined advertising wear-out using the fear-relief continuous measurement dial to produce dynamic measures (CRM) of fear (tension) wear-out. The dial and programme were designed to develop a more valid measure of fear arousal and reduction (relief) that would capture viewers’ responses when viewing the entire advertisement. The data collection procedure for obtaining the dynamic measures of the advertisements was more time-intensive, due to individual recording versus the group recording that was undertaken for the static measures. Therefore, only one fear-relief advertisement, Advertisement 1 – ‘Pizza’, and one fear-only advertisement, Advertisement 3 – ‘Trike’, were used in the dynamic measures test of wear-out.

Participants were recruited from first-year undergraduate marketing classes. A pre-questionnaire was given one week prior to the commencement of the advertisement testing that contained the West, French, Kemp and Elander (1993) scale of speed choice. This was used to allocate even numbers of speeders and non-speeders to each advertisement group. Non-drivers were screened out. Participants were offered a $20 university bookstore voucher as an incentive. Payment of the incentive was contingent upon participation for all three weeks of the study. Initially, 53 participants took part during the first week of the experiment, with 41 returning for the second week, and 37 for the third week. The data for the following analysis were taken from 37 participants’ recordings for all three weeks of the experiment. Subsequent comparison of the dropouts’ patterns with those of the final sample showed no discernible differences in reactions to the advertisements. Participants were randomly allocated to the two experimental groups to watch one of the two anti-speeding advertisements each week, for three consecutive weeks. Participants were shown one anti-speeding commercial only, rather than seeing the advertisement within a group of general commercials.

continued...
Showing other advertisements may have aroused the participants, thereby increasing their speed choice (for example, an exciting advertisement for Coca-Cola may have aroused the viewer and result in higher speed scores). Also, it was necessary to keep the experimental design of the dynamic measurement component of the study relatively consistent with static measurement study to allow for comparative analysis.

Participants were not told of the driving test to come, but were told they would be watching commercials, a task that would take 5 minutes to complete each week, for three consecutive weeks. All participants were tested individually. A lounge-room (in-home) viewing situation was simulated by conducting the experiment in a comfortable office with a sofa and coffee table, with the participant sitting approximately 2 metres from the television set. Each week, for three consecutive weeks, the participant would undertake the CRM-dial task while watching their allocated test advertisement. Immediately after the test advertisement exposure in the third week, each participant underwent the VST speed-choice test (Horswill and McKenna, 1999).

**Results:** Dynamic Rating of Fear Patterns with Repeated Exposures

Group mean patterns of felt fear and relief experienced are shown for the ‘Pizza’ (fear-relief) commercial in Figure 1 and for the ‘Trike’ (fear-only) commercial in Figure 2. As expected, the ‘Pizza’ advertisement response conformed to the double fear-relief pattern, with a first peak when the pedestrian was hit by the car and a second when the accident was re-enacted in slow motion, each followed by fear reduction, that is, relief, during the recommendations by the surgeon to drive slower. The basic reaction pattern to ‘Pizza’ across repeated exposures, three in this experiment, one week apart, did not change. This finding confirmed the result of eye-tracking research with print advertisements on successive viewings, where the ‘scan-path’ remained consistent each time the reader saw the advertisement (Pieters, Rosbergen, and Wedel, 1999). There was some diminution of fear on each successive viewing of the ‘Pizza’ advertisement. By the third exposure, the peak fear response reduced to about two-thirds of its initial exposure level for ‘Pizza’.

Figure 1: CRM-dial ratings of Advertisement 1 – ‘Pizza’ (fear-relief) with repeated exposures

![CRM-dial ratings of Advertisement 1 – ‘Pizza’ (fear-relief) with repeated exposures](image)

The ‘Trike’ advertisement response conformed to a slow build-up of fear that peaked suddenly (shock) when the youngster was hit by the car. However, there was greater diminution of fear on each successive viewing of the ‘Trike’ advertisement. By the third exposure, the peak fear response reduced to about half of its initial-exposure level for ‘Trike’, that had a slightly higher initial exposure peak than ‘Pizza’, as would be expected for a ‘shock’ commercial. There was a further intriguing result in the pattern for ‘Trike’; by the third exposure, there was a clear anticipatory fear reaction that occurred before the youngster was hit, because the viewer was now aware that a shock was coming. Furthermore, the ‘Trike’ advertisement, with each successive exposure started to morph into a fear-relief advertisement.

The VST mean scores are again reported by total and gender due to the unequal representation of males and females in each advertisement group as shown in Table 6. In regard to the total sample, both test advertisements, Advertisement 1 – ‘Pizza’ (mean = +2.92km/hr; m = 4.61, f = 2.00) and Advertisement 3 – ‘Trike’ (mean = +3.79km/hr; m = 6.17, f = 2.47), resulted in significantly lower VST speed-scores (F = 5.48, p = .006) to the control group (mean = +6.98km/hr; m = 8.03, f = 5.79). The difference between the test advertisements was not significant (F = .16, p = .696). However, analysing the results by gender showed that the significant differences found between the test advertisements and the control group were mainly driven by the female speed-choice scores (F = 2.70, p = .079) in comparison to male speed-choice scores (F = 2.01, p = .148).
Advertising Wear-out: Comparison of Moderate and Heavy Exposures

The separate data collection processes (for the static and dynamic measures of advertising wear-out) within this study allowed for the examination of what happens to fear appeals with heavy repetition, and specifically how two types of fear appeals, classic fear-relief and the newer ‘shock’ approach (fear-only), continue to influence driving-speed reduction after many exposures. In part two of this study, participants watched the fear-appeal commercials three times while also making moment-to-moment (MTM) dial ratings of fear and relief experienced during the commercial. This forced-exposure viewing situation could be equivalent to ‘heavy’ repetition in natural viewing, similar to receiving at least nine in-home exposures. In the static measures component of this advertising wear-out study, these commercials were viewed three times without CRM ratings, that is estimated to be the equivalent of about six in-home exposures (Rossiter and Percy, 1997). In both experiments, the VST simulated driving test was administered after the final exposure, so comparisons can be made in regard to the behavioural effects of each advertisement after ‘moderate’ repetition (static measures condition) and ‘heavy’ repetition (dynamic measures condition).

The VST is known to differ in effect by gender (male vs. female drivers, with male drivers tending to speed more than females in all situations, on average), therefore the results are reported for the total student sample, and by gender in Table 7. The entries in the table are the mean changes in driving speed from the speed selected by the separate control group which undertook the VST without seeing any commercial beforehand: a plus sign indicates driving faster than the control group’s speed and a minus sign indicates speed-reduction that is, driving slower.

Table 7: VST scores (change in speed in km/hr) for moderate and heavy repetition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total sample</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fear-relief Advertisements</strong> ('Pizza')</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate repetition</td>
<td>-1.8 (n = 62)</td>
<td>-2.2 (n = 34)</td>
<td>-1.9 (n = 28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy repetition</td>
<td>-3.0 (n = 19)</td>
<td>-3.8 (n = 8)</td>
<td>-2.4 (n = 11)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Fear-only Advertisements** ('Trike') | | |
| Moderate repetition | +2.1 (n = 25) | +3.8 (n = 21) | -0.5 (n = 14) |
| Heavy repetition    | -2.1 (n = 18) | -0.6 (n = 6)  | -2.8 (n = 12)  |

‘Pizza’ (fear-relief) was the more effective commercial overall in the static measures experiment (−2.2 km/hr speed reduction for the total sample) and it remained the more effective commercial under heavy repetition in this experiment. The effectiveness appeared to increase slightly (−3.1 km/hr for the total sample) although the smaller sample size in the dynamic measures condition of the experiment necessitates caution in interpreting this result.

‘Trike’ (fear-only), under moderate repetition, caused young males (and because women were neutrally affected, the total sample) to increase their speed. However, under heavy repetition, in the dynamic measures condition of the experiment, the fear-only approach seemed to wear in, in that its effect on young males...
became neutral (~0.6 km/hr) and it then began to work with young female drivers (~2.8 km/hr). It appears that fear-only advertisements may work better after multiple viewings. Overall, however, after heavy repetition, the fear-only appeal, 'Trike', commercial was still less effective than the classic fear-relief appeal, 'Pizza', commercial.

This study investigated consumer reactions to fear-appeal TV commercials over repeated exposures. It was found that the pattern of felt fear and relief for the 'Pizza' advertisement remained constant with successive exposures, although the level of fear experienced did diminish by a third. The level of fear experienced because of the 'Trike' advertisement (fear-only) diminished to a half with the pattern of fear morphing into a fear-relief pattern.

Despite some loss of 'fearfulness', the fear-relief commercial continued to be effective in reducing (simulated) speeding behaviour when repetition progressed from moderate to heavy. Despite loss of 'shock value', the late shock (fear-only) commercial seemed to become more effective with heavy repetition, perhaps due to the development of an 'anticipatory shock' reaction with repeated viewing and the tendency for viewers to feel greater relief at the end of the advertisement by the third exposure. Overall, however, the fear-relief approach was found to be more effective in reducing young drivers' speed.

Managerial Implications
The findings suggest that researchers and practitioners need to focus on the pattern of fear, and not just on the level of fear, within road safety fear appeals advertisements. Asking road safety practitioners to classify their advertisements into the two broad categories of fear-only or fear-relief patterns would be a starting point in educating practitioners to start thinking differently about how they construct road safety advertisements. Additionally, the findings of the repeated exposures experiments undertaken could aid practitioners in deciding on the life cycle of their advertisements. The studies indicated that shock-appeal road safety advertisements, despite losing their shock value quite quickly, had favourable behavioural effects with increased exposures. This suggests that there is less need to design new advertisements, thus potentially saving significant amounts of money, particularly given the funding spent on new creative executions.

Limitations and Directions for Future Research
A student sample was used for this study. Such a sample is appropriate when internal validity is the main consideration as opposed to external validity (Lynch, 1999). Generalisations about different target audiences and the general population cannot be made, however, given the results an extension of the study to other groups within the population would help address external validity. A controlled experiment allows for the effects of an individual advertisement to be measured rather than trying to measure wear-out in the context of advertising campaigns and other real-life influences. An important qualification for this study was the forced-exposure design. 'On-air', these TV commercials may begin to lose attention substantially after half a dozen or so viewings (although the results of the static measures condition of the experiment, using the equivalent of six viewings, suggested that consumers still reported 'watching most' of the commercial). After nine or more on-air viewings that were artificially simulated in this experiment, loss of attention may cause the advertisements to also lose their influence on drivers' speed reduction. The use of an experiment can be criticised for its superficial setting; for example, in this study, subjects paid absolute attention to the advertisement whereas in the real-life situation of watching TV at home, they may not have paid attention to the advertisement to the same extent. It is suggested that three experimental advertising exposures for the dynamic rating component of this study would be equivalent to approximately nine exposures in-home viewing situations (Rossiter and Percy, 1997), with the results of this study showing that even with forced exposure to the advertisements there was a decline in the attention paid to the advertisements over the three weeks in the static measures component of this study. Most road safety advertisements are aired in short bursts, for example, just before a holiday period, thus making nine exposures realistic.

Conclusion
The major research objective of this study was to analyse how viewers reacted to successive exposures of different fear pattern TV advertisements, using both static and dynamic measures of advertising wear-out. Emotion and attention wear-out occurred immediately for all fear patterns, using static measures of fear and relief. It was shown that fear-only pattern advertisements had higher rates of wear-out than fear-relief patterns. Additionally, fear-relief advertisements were more effective, using a behavioural dependent variable of speed-choice, the VST. The dynamic measures condition of the study showed that the fear-only 'shock' advertisement began to 'wear-in' and became more effective with repetition but fear-relief continued to be the most effective type of commercial for deterring speeding among young drivers.

References
Bloom, Paul N., and Novelli, William D. (1981), 'Problems and Challenges in Social continued...
Introduction

This paper deals with emotions in order to demonstrate that recycling behaviour is associated more with positive emotions than with cognitions. The resulting model displays a marked contrast to the classic cognitive paradigm in the sense that this perspective highlights the idea that consumers act on the basis of their affective reactions, with cognitive factors playing a minor role. In addition, it shows within the hedonic process there are alternative routes to achieve both recycling involvement and behaviour depending on both the emotional and cognitive characteristics of individuals.

REFUTING FEAR IN HEURISTICS AND IN RECYCLING PROMOTION: TOWARDS A SOCIAL MARKETING BASED ON HOPE

PhD Lecturer Gonzalo Diaz Meneses
University of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria
Faculty of Economics and Business
C Building, office 1.15
35017 Tafira Campus
The Canary Islands (SPAIN)
Phone: 003428452807
Fax: 003428451829
gdiaz@dede.ulpgc.es

Introduction

This paper deals with emotions in order to demonstrate that recycling behaviour is associated more with positive emotions than with cognitions. The resulting model displays a marked contrast to the classic cognitive paradigm in the sense that this perspective highlights the idea that consumers act on the basis of their affective reactions, with cognitive factors playing a minor role. In addition, it shows within the hedonic process there are alternative routes to achieve both recycling involvement and behaviour depending on both the emotional and cognitive characteristics of individuals.

continued...
Methodological aspects

A questionnaire was used to gather information about cognitive and emotional aspects and involvement with recycling. Recycling behaviour was also measured using this questionnaire. This questionnaire was self-administered and the individuals chosen at random. This work used a sample of 339 individuals and the error is 5.32 per cent (confidence interval 95.5 per cent). The fieldwork took place in spring 2007.

The characteristics of the measuring instrument in terms of questions on the following variables of the study are:

- Knowledge of recycling and ecological conscience: a 16-item, 5-point Likert type scale based on that proposed by Bohlen et al. (1993) and Scholder (1994). It refers not only to information about knowledge of ecological damage and the impact of one's own actions on nature but also to practical information about the function of recycling. To be specific, the respondent was asked to indicate his/her level of agreement with those 16 item statements on the scale, with 1 indicating the lowest level of agreement and 5 the highest.

- Sentiments and emotions related to recycling: a 48-item, 5-point Likert type scale based not only on Dunlap and Van Liere (1984) and Grendstad (1999) from the environmental literature, but also on Westbrook and Oliver (1991) from the psychological literature on emotions. It gathers information not only about the respondent's disquiet about the balance of nature and the possibility of an ecological crisis but also to answer the following question: What kinds of emotion did you feel during your recycling behaviour experience? In this way, the respondent had to express his/her level of agreement with those 48 statements on the scale, with 1 indicating the lowest level of agreement and 5 the highest.

- Involvement with recycling: a 6-item, 5-point semantic differential question based on Zaichkowsky (1985) and Díaz and Beerli (2002) and defined as involvement and responsibility regarding recycling; with 1 on the scale indicating low involvement and 5 high involvement.

- Recycling conduct: three Likert type questions, each with one item and five points, referring to the respondent's level of collaboration related to the total glass, paper and container material generated in the household and to be recycled, with 1 on the scale indicating low collaboration and 5 indicating high collaboration.

Analysis of results

This work focuses on the analysis of the emotional profile of consumers from the perspective of their role as collaborators in selective waste collection programmes. The results show that, if the aim is to design campaigns in keeping with the target audience, there must be greater emphasis on emotional than on cognitive aspects. Thus, one practical implication that it seems logical to suggest is that the consumer might be convinced to recycle by peripheral routes of persuasion, such as music and poem appeal, a sense of humour or telling stories about our emotional bond with nature.

Prior to testing the hypotheses, we carried out a factor analysis with varimax rotation of the scales used to measure the cognitions, emotions and involvement with recycling. We also tested the reliability of the three scales by means of Cronbach's alphas and the scales displayed values that indicate the reliability of the dimensions under consideration.

To test Hypotheses One and Two, a correlations analysis was applied between the factors related to the cognitions scale and emotions scale and the variable of recycling behaviour. As result shows, there is a statistically significant relationship between five emotional factors and five cognitive factors and recycling behaviour. On that basis, it is clear that Hypothesis One, which proposes that recycling behaviour is more correlated with positive emotions than with negative emotions, is accepted. In fact, of the five emotional dimensions with statistically significant associations with recycling behaviour, only the feeling of shame and guilt (emo3) displays a negative valence.

In addition, it is clear that the greater the involvement with recycling is, the more positive the valence of those emotions is. Moreover, the unpleasant emotions, namely sadness, followed by boredom and tedium and anger display differences in terms of consumer involvement with recycling in that the more involved with recycling the consumer is, the less he/she tends to feel this type of emotion. On that basis, Hypothesis Three, which proposes that the higher the involvement with recycling is, the more strongly the positive emotions are associated with recycling behaviour is accepted.

Similarly, in the case of the cognitive factors, knowledge of how to recycle, ecological interest, ecological conscience and ecological disconcern, in that order, display statistically significant differences in terms of consumer level of involvement with recycling. To be specific, it is clear that the higher the involvement with recycling is, the more strongly the cognitive resources are associated with recycling behaviour, as proposed in Hypothesis Four.

In order to test whether there are statistically significant differences in terms of emotions and cognitions, depending on the level of recycling behaviour, a means difference test was performed. To that end the variable related to recycling behaviour was divided at percentiles 33 per cent and 66 per cent to create three sub-samples, each with a different level of collaboration with recycling. A comparison of the two...
sub-samples representing those who recycle most and those who recycle least shows that changes in the behaviour generate the most significant effects in the emotions associated with recycling. On that basis, Hypothesis Five, which proposes that, while any change in the involvement with recycling is associated to more differences in terms of cognitions than emotions, any change in the recycling behaviour is associated with more differences in terms of emotions than cognitions, is fully accepted.

Conclusions
The call for consumers to be ecologically responsible is frequently based on fear appeal, which could be projected by warning of environmental disasters; for example, the recent dire warnings about climate change. In that respect, it is thought that such ecological campaigns lead to greater awareness of the danger than could result from following a model unrelated to the principle of sustainability. However, while recognising the undoubted advance of the pro-environmental logic that can be induced by planting the idea of natural disaster in everyone’s mind, one should ask whether society and consumers need to feel threatened in order to achieve social mobilisation in favour of nature. In response to that question, this work focuses on the analysis of the emotional profile of consumers from the perspective of their role as collaborators in selective waste collection programmes. The results show that, if the aim is to design campaigns in keeping with the target audience, there must be greater emphasis on emotional than on cognitive aspects. Thus, one practical implication that it seems logical to suggest is that the consumer might be convinced to recycle by peripheral routes of persuasion, such as music and poem appeal, a sense of humour or telling stories about our emotional bond with nature.

However, as already indicated, the citizen’s recognition that waste recycling is more important is something that is better achieved by informative means than by affective means. This is because involvement with recycling is more significantly associated with knowledge of how to recycle and with ecological conscience and interest than with determined emotiveness, although the emotions of peace of mind and confidence remain present. Nevertheless, as recycling behaviour does not always have to be high involvement, it seems appropriate to use peripheral routes of persuasion or an emotional approach in the case of low involvement audiences.

Finally, this work proposes that greater effort be devoted to the heuristics of hope; it is not the fear of doomsday that should become the basis of the ecological ideology of the new millennium but rather the hope that the consumer can become more oriented to recycling.

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THREAT APPEALS IN THE ADVERTISING OF COUNSELING SERVICES

Ms Katrin Eccarius
Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand
Ms Jayne Krisjanous
Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand
Dr Janet Carruthers*
Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand
Dr Nick Ashill
Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand

*Corresponding author, School of Marketing and International Business, Victoria University of Wellington, PO Box 600 Wellington, New Zealand. Tel: +64 4 4636917, Fax: +64 4 4635231, email: janet.carruthers@vuw.ac.nz

Abstract
This paper discusses effective advertising of counselling services to target audiences. It proposes a new model for empirical testing, and analyses threat appeals in regard to their effectiveness for high anxiety students, one of the major target groups for counselling services. In particular, affective and cognitive responses to a threat appeal advertisement and their effects on attitude toward the advertisement and behaviour are examined. A significant gap in the literature exists that integrates both affective and cognitive responses within conceptual models of threat appeal advertising. This study contributes further to knowledge of threat appeal effectiveness, targeting ‘anxious’ audiences.

Keywords: Advertising effectiveness, threat appeals, anxiety, counseling services

Introduction
In recent years, the reported incidence of mental health disturbances world-wide has risen dramatically to some 450 million (World Health Organisation, 2003). Furthermore, amongst them, 150 million, especially those in high income countries, will suffer from clinical depression at one point in their lives (World Health...
One group identified as particularly ‘at risk’ for anxiety-related illness are students (Dunne and Somerset, 2004).

Anxiety is often regarded as a predisposing factor in the development of clinical depression (Campbell and Brown, 2002). Therefore, lowering levels of felt anxiety, before the onset of depression would be worthwhile. One possible intervention is counselling, a professional process whereby personal and interpersonal conflicts are discussed with a third party, with a view to alleviation of anxieties and identification of strategies to deal specifically with concerns. Counselling services are available in most countries through both communal and educational institutions, such as schools and universities (World Health Organisation, 2005).

One means of attracting high anxiety individuals to seek counselling assistance is through effective advertising. Although advertising effectiveness has been extensively researched, there is much scope to further research this topic in regard to counselling services, where issues such as social stigma toward mental health disturbances can be a barrier to seeking help.

The extant literature discusses ‘attitude toward the ad’ as a mediator between advertising content and behavioural outcomes (for example Holbrook and Batra, 1987; Henthorne, LaTour and Natarajan, 1993; Ajzen, 1988). Ajzen (1988) considers attitude as a multidimensional construct comprised of cognitive responses (based on perception or knowledge), affective (feelings) and conative (behaviours inclinations) dimensions. Theories that rank order the affective, cognitive and conative aspects have been extended in communication models, for example, ‘Think-Feel-Do’ models and integrative models (Vakratsas and Ambler, 1999; Holbrook and Batra, 1987). Most models integrate both affective and cognitive elements and act on the assumption that both have a combined effect on the conative response. Some scholars however assume that, depending on the situation and topic, advertising messages are only processed cognitively, whereas other situations favour an affective processing of the message (Kim & Morris, 2007; Fang, Singh, & Ahuwalia, 2007; Agrawal, Menon, & Aaker, 2007; Brown, Homer, and Inman, 1998).

There are many studies of advertising effectiveness that depending on the model applied, consider either the affective or the cognitive response. There are, however, few studies that investigate the effect of both of these two responses on advertising outcomes (Sojka & Giese, 2006; Potter, 2006; LaTour and Rotfeld, 1997; Holbrook and Batra, 1987). This study overcomes this limitation by integrating both emotional (valence, arousal and specification dimensions) and cognitive (as involvement and self-efficacy) responses that take place after exposure to the ad.

Studies of advertising in health-related areas often examine the efficacy of threat appeals. Many studies attempt to determine whether threat appeals create positive attitudes toward the ad and have a positive impact on behaviour. However, findings reported in the literature are conflicting, ranging from negative effects to very positive effects on advertising outcomes (Jones & Owen, 2006; Brown, Homer, and Inman, 1998; Keller and Block, 1996).

In the domain of research into advertising within health contexts, counselling services have not been an oft selected choice. Indeed, there is a need to investigate advertising effectiveness in different contexts, as it is very unlikely that one model can be generalisable to all contexts, due to various different intervening variables (Brown, Homer, and Inman, 1998; Holbrook and Batra, 1987). The target audience for counselling services communications is in many ways specific, due to its high level of anxiety. As a consequence, anxiety plays a major role in the formation of emotions, cognition and attitudes for this target group (Vogel et al., 2005).

Therefore, the major objectives of the study were to determine the advertising effectiveness of threat appeals tailored to counselling services and how the processing of the message occurs. The focus was on high anxiety individuals, as a major target group for counselling services. More specifically, the study aimed to identify the emotional response of high anxiety individuals and whether this response has a strong effect on advertising outcomes. At the same time, an additional research aim was to determine if cognitive evaluations have a stronger impact on advertising outcomes than the affective response and whether they moderate the impact of the emotional response on advertising outcomes.

The remainder of this paper is structured into four sections. The first outlines the proposed model and discussion of related literature. In doing so, hypotheses that relate to advertising effectiveness using threat appeals in counselling services are presented. Second, an empirical study that was performed in a university setting is explained. Thirdly, results and implications for advertising researchers and those involved in counselling services are discussed. Finally, limitations to the study are addressed and suggested opportunities for further research put forward.

continued...
The Research Model and Hypotheses

The model used to study the relationships between anxiety and advertising effectiveness is depicted in Figure 1.

Figure 1. Conceptual Model

![Conceptual Model Diagram]

We claim that this conceptual model is new in many ways. Firstly, it is a model that integrates both affective and cognitive response pertaining to their impact on advertising outcomes. There are few studies in the literature that integrate both sides, however the effect of both of them has been empirically proven many times (LaTour and Rotfeld, 1997; Holbrook and Batra, 1997). The conceptual model is particularly adapted to the topic of advertising processing within the context of counselling services. Variables such as stigma against seeking professional psychological help held by respondents and their levels of anxiety are taken into account (Chandra & Minkovitz, 2007; Vogel, Wade, & Hackler, 2006). This is in support of the authors’ claim that there is a need for ad effectiveness models that can be applied to specific contexts, as an all-embracing advertising model that can be used to determine the ad effectiveness overall is deemed to be optimistic, due to the many intervening and context specific variables that may exist in many contexts (Brown, Homer, and Inman, 1998; Holbrook and Batra, 1997).

In the context of counselling services, it could be expected that the threat message is processed on an emotional level. Persons who possess a high level of anxiety are likely to experience strong negative reactions toward a threat appeal, as it exposes them to possible consequences that may occur when they do not seek the help of professional counsellors. Empirical support for this theory can be gained from the conceptual premises of the 'State-Trait Anxiety Inventory' (Spielberger 1972), who found that persons with a high level of trait anxiety (which is a stable personality characteristic) develop a higher level of state anxiety (a temporary feeling of anxiety) when exposed to a threatening situation.

It can, however, also be expected that the threat appeal is processed in a cognitive way. Threat appeal research over the last forty has developed from an affective processing point of view towards pure cognitive models of threat appeal processing. Initially, 'Drive Models' predicted that fear, as the emotion experienced when exposed to threat appeals, drove attitudes and behaviour. Underlying theory promotes an inverted U-shaped relationship between attitude and level of fear, and therefore a moderate threat appeal is favoured (Dillard, 1994; Witte and Allen, 2000). Empirical findings, however, have proven to be conflicting in support of the inverted U relationship, leading to reduced confidence in the Drive Model as a predictor of response. Following models, such as The Parallel Response Theory (Leventhal, 1970) or The Subjective Expected Utility Model (Rogers, 1975) pushed emotional response toward the ad aside, in favour of cognitive elements. Some newer studies do not even measure emotion as a control variable (Dillard, 1994; Witte and Allen, 2000).

The affective response, fear, however, has most often been empirically proven to have an effect on attitudes and behaviour (Brown, Homer and Inman, 1998; Henthorne, LaTour, and Natarajan, 1993; Dillard, 1994). Additionally, most cognitive studies that did measure fear as a control variable found effects of fear on behavioural intention (Dillard, 1994). It is therefore important to measure both types of responses to determine the magnitude of each of them and their interaction.

This present conceptual work supports application of a multidimensional concept of emotional response. Initial studies in the field consider emotion as one dimensional (for example, Diener and Emmons, 1985), assuming that emotions are experienced in a bipolar way, either positively or negatively. This view is disputed by Green, Goldman and Salovey (1993), who found that measurement errors could have biased the results of bipolar studies. Their study indicated that both positive and negative feelings can co-occur when exposed to negative or positive stimuli. Further studies found that emotions of one valence (positive or negative) can lead to different outcomes (Holbrook and Batra, 1987; Babin, Darden, and Babin, 1998; Raghunathan and Pham, 1999), identifying possible types of emotional reactions to advertisements, such as fear, joy, and sadness. In addition, other empirical results have lead to an argument for magnitude of the experienced emotional response as an important contributor to outcomes. Russel, (1980); Watson and Tellegen, (1985), have found the arousal dimension to be significant. To give consideration to these developments and empirical findings, the proposed study measures the emotional response on the valence (positive versus negative), arousal (magnitude of emotion) and type of emotions (for instance, fear, joy, sadness).
In line with these theories, the first hypothesis is as follows:

H1: When exposed to a threat appeal, high anxiety individuals will develop stronger negative emotional responses than their low anxiety counterparts.

Cognitive response can involve many different variables such as self-efficacy, problem recognition, and response cost (see Rogers, 1975). Whilst some studies attempted to integrate all of the dimensions, no significance for all of them in the same context has been found. Most empirical studies however have found that at least one cognitive component has an effect on outcomes, such as attitudes and behavioural intention (Witte and Allen, 2000; Dillard, 1994). It is therefore important to integrate cognitive elements that are applicable to the context of the study.

Involvement has often been proven to be one of the most important variables in advertising effectiveness. Many studies suggest that it has a significant effect on advertising outcomes such as attitudes and behaviour (Howard and Sheth, 1969; Cochrane and Quester, 2005; Greenwald and Leavitt, 1984; Brown, Homer and Inman, 1998). The second most often included variable in cognitive advertising models is perceived self-efficacy. A high level of perceived self-efficacy can help persons to consider the advertising messages in a calm and rational manner. When considering the message rationally, a high level of involvement can be created. There is empirical validation of the interrelationship of these two constructs. Rudolph, Gangl, and Steven, (2000) studied voting behaviour states, finding that persons with a high (political) efficacy develop high involvement towards voting when they possess a high level of anxiety concerning political situations. Anxiety therefore drives involvement when the person possesses a high level of self-efficacy. Low efficacy individuals do not develop a high level of involvement under high anxiety conditions due to inhibition effects.

H2: High anxiety individuals will experience higher levels of involvement when they have a high perceived self-efficacy than individuals with low perceived self-efficacy and/or low anxiety.

‘Attitude toward the ad’ is considered as one of the most important constructs in advertising effectiveness (Holbrook and Batra, 1987; Henthorne, LaTour and Natarajan, 1993). The variable mediates emotional and cognitive responses toward the ad and conative or behavioural outcomes of them. It has often been shown that the affective response plays an essential role in forming attitudes. Research also shows that cognition and affect can interact with each other to create attitudes (LaTour & Rotfeld, 1997; Homer, 2006; Yoon, Pinkleton, & Ko, 2006; Henthorne, LaTour & Natarajan, 1993). The majority of studies on ad-evoked emotions found that cognitive elaboration moderates the direct relationship between emotions and attitude toward the ad (Brown, Homer, & Inman, 1998). Most often, involvement has been shown to be a cognitive moderator of the relationship (for example Greenwald & Leavitt, 1984; Brown, Homer, & Inman, 1998).

H3: Persons who experience a stronger negative emotional response toward the advertisement will develop a more positive ‘attitude toward the ad’.

H4: The relationship between emotional response and ‘attitude toward the ad’ will be stronger among low involved individuals than among their high involved counterparts.

The proposed study integrates a committed and an uncommitted behavioural component as the outcome variables of attitude toward the ad. Behavioural Intention is considered the committed action, as it is integrated in Ajzen’s (1991) ‘Theory of Planned Behaviour’. This variable is most often used to suggest the actual behaviour when its observation is impossible. The study includes this construct, as the actual behaviour of the respondents cannot be observed due to privacy obligations of counselling services and ethical considerations. The study also includes the uncommitted action variable of information seeking intention (Roser and Thompson, 1995). In the context of counselling services, the respondent might not currently be in a state where he/she feels a need for the help of a counsellor. This can however change when a threatening experience (such as the loss of a relative, failure in an exam) occurs. At the time being, the highly involved respondent might consider taking an uncommitted action by seeking further information. This information can lead to use of the counselling service at a later point in time and functions as a reminder when the person comes into a need-for-counselling situation (Locander and Hermann, 1979).

H5: A positive ‘attitude toward the ad’ will lead to a greater information seeking intention.

H6: A positive ‘attitude toward the ad’ will lead to greater usage intention of the counselling service.

Research Method

Sample and Measurement

Data for this experimental study was collected from third year university students during tutorial sessions. This convenience sample was highly appropriate as it is the very audience of interest for the context of the study. Respondents were asked to complete a survey questionnaire in a self-administered manner.

In designing the survey instrument to measure the constructs in the research model, the relevant writings were canvassed. Reliable and often applied question items were used to measure the constructs. In

continued...
Hypothesis One, the emotional items were collected in a pilot study. Students of a similar study (n=135) and age group were exposed to the advertisement and their emotional responses were measured on existing scales. In a second step, the students stated their emotional responses in open-ended questions. The most often experienced emotions were then used for the emotional scale in the following experiment study.

A total of 162 questionnaires were collected in the experiment study; 130 completed the experiment questionnaire and 32 students a respective control questionnaire. Before exposure to the threat appeal print advertisement contained in the questionnaire, students answered questions on demographics, levels of anxiety, stigma and attitudes to counselling, previous counselling experiences and perceived self-efficacy. Post-ad exposure, questions containing emotional and cognitive responses, ‘attitude toward the ad’ and information seeking and intention were asked.

The data analysis of the experimental study was undertaken using the statistical software SPSS. After reliability and factor analysis, the hypotheses of the study were tested using the analysis of variance (ANOVA) and covariance (ANCOVA) (Cavana, Delahaye, & Sekaran, 2001; Field, 2005).

Results

The ‘State-Trait Anxiety’ relationship of Hypothesis One was not supported by the underlying study. High anxiety individuals did not develop stronger negative emotions toward the advertisement. The results however showed a significant negative relationship between anxiety and negative emotions. A highly anxious person developed less strong negative feelings toward the advertisement than a person with low levels of anxiety. From the results of the study, it could be assumed that the high anxiety individuals applied defensive mechanisms to inhibit overwhelming negative emotions (Kavadas, Katsanis & LeBel, 2007; Keller & Block, 1996; Ray & Wilkie, 1970). Relationships between variables are summarised in Table 1.

Table 1. Relationships between variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis Testing</th>
<th>Independent Variable(s)</th>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>F Value</th>
<th>Significance</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Nature of Relationship</th>
<th>Hypothesis approached</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Trait Anxiety</td>
<td>Negative Quiet Emotions</td>
<td>51.964</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.311</td>
<td>negative</td>
<td>rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Trait Anxiety</td>
<td>Negative Stressed Emotions</td>
<td>42.560</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.345</td>
<td>negative</td>
<td>rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Trait Anxiety &amp; Perceived Self-Efficacy (moderator)</td>
<td>Anxiveness</td>
<td>5.882</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.218</td>
<td>negative</td>
<td>rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Negative Stressed Emotions</td>
<td>Ad-Attitude</td>
<td>1.239</td>
<td>0.265</td>
<td>0.104</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Positive Feelings</td>
<td>Ad-Attitude</td>
<td>2.453</td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>0.125</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Negative Stressed Emotions &amp; Emotional Response (moderator)</td>
<td>Ad-Attitude</td>
<td>2.167</td>
<td>0.197</td>
<td>0.215</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Positive Feelings &amp; Emotional Response (moderator)</td>
<td>Ad-Attitude</td>
<td>1.535</td>
<td>0.216</td>
<td>0.167</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ad-Attitude</td>
<td>Information Seeking Intention</td>
<td>3.188</td>
<td>0.030</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>approved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ad-Attitude</td>
<td>Usage Intention</td>
<td>2.084</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>positive</td>
<td>approved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results also did not support the relationship between anxiety, perceived self-efficacy and involvement as suggested in Hypothesis Two. There was, however, a significant relationship between anxiety and involvement. Results showed that individuals with higher levels of anxiety developed a lower involvement toward the advertising message than low anxiety individuals. Empirical involvement studies have sometimes shown that highly involved individuals become less involved when exposed to a strong threat appeal (Kavadas, Katsanis, & LeBel, 2007; Keller & Block, 1996; Petty, Cacioppo, & Schumann, 1983; Gray, 1987). The respondents use defensive mechanisms similar to the ones employed for the affective responses. They deny the personal relevance of the message and act as low involved individuals (Kavadas, Katsanis, & LeBel, 2007; Keller & Block, 1996).

There was also only partial support for Hypothesis Three and Four. The emotional responses that were categorised in three groups were processed in different ways and had only sometimes an effect on ‘attitude toward the ad’. A direct relationship could only be established between positive feelings and ‘attitude toward the ad’. This relationship was additionally mediated by involvement. Positive feelings and involvement both positively affected each other and ‘attitude toward the ad’. In the case of negative quiet feelings, involvement moderated the feelings-‘attitude toward the ad’ relationship. A stronger involvement strengthened the positive relationship, so that ‘attitude toward the ad’ was explained to a greater extent. Stronger negative quiet emotions, however, did not lead to differences in the value of ‘attitude toward the ad’. Negative stimulated feelings were not considered for the evaluation of the advertisement at all.

continued...
Hypotheses Five and Six were approved. ‘attitude toward the ad’ both had a significant effect on information seeking intention and on usage intention of the counselling service.

The results demonstrated that a strong threat appeal is not effective for counselling services. Rather, it led to defensive strategies among the target group, which inhibited the processing of the advertisement. The results however showed that positive emotions toward the advertisement and cognitive involvement had a positive impact on advertising outcomes, such as ‘attitude toward the ad’ and behavioural intentions. Consequently, highly threatening messages should be rejected in favour of weaker threats or even purely positive appeals.

Conclusions and Future Research

In conclusion, this paper has discussed the importance of understanding how the processing of advertisements might be context-specific. It proposed a new model, specific to counselling services (at the present time) that integrates both affective and cognitive responses to a threat appeal advertisement. Specifically, the relationships between anxiety, emotions and cognitions and advertising effectiveness were examined. Understanding the nature and determinants of how advertising is processed by an ‘anxious’ audience, and particularly where other factors such as social stigma play a part, is a necessary and critical starting point in developing and implementing effective communication strategies targeting audiences for counseling services.

The empirical findings suggest a number of important managerial implications. As positive emotions and a high involvement are major success factors in the advertising effectiveness of counselling ads, it is important to strengthen these with the design of the communication. A stronger perceived self-efficacy and lower stigma contributed to improving attitudes toward counselling and toward the ad and would consequently lead to enhanced usage intentions of the counselling service. At the same time, it is always important to consider the uniqueness of the target group.

As a limitation, the study could not take into account all the possible advertising effectiveness variables. Future research should expand the conceptual model with those variables and in a non-laboratory setting. As treatment aimed at anxiety reduction and the avoidance of more serious mental disturbances is a major healthcare incentive today, the testing of this model would do well to be extended to other groups with known risk factors or increased vulnerability toward anxiety, such as substance abuse or anorexia.

References

Getting the User Involved in the UK National Health Service

Abstract

The aim of this research is to gain a better understanding of the role social capital has in the potential success or failure of social marketing intervention strategies. Social marketing has evolved over the last forty years from planned social change (Kotler & Zaltman, 1971) and marketing of social causes (Fox & Kotler, 1980) having received increased interest since the late 1990s due to the recognition of the magnitude of preventable health problems and an acknowledgement that existing communication strategies were not effective (DOH, 2004).

Drawing on commercial marketing theories, concepts and techniques, social marketing seeks to improve health and well being; according to Andreasen (2002) it is defined as:

A social change management technology involving the design, implementation and control of programmes aimed at increasing the acceptability of a social idea or practice in one or more groups of target adopters. It utilises concepts of market segmentation, consumer research, product concept development and testing, directed communication, facilitation, incentives and exchange theory to maximise the target adopter’s response. (p. 7).

A central focus of any social marketing intervention is effective communication (Bernhardt, 2004) with recognition from the Commission of the European Communities (CEC, 2002) of the need to seek not just pan-European but global solutions to issues affecting the health and welfare of individuals, although there is less evidence of specific social marketing initiatives in member countries.

However, before social marketing interventions can be devised and communication strategies developed, there is a need to understand the market environment as well as the target audience.

Within the context of the English National Health Service, the service user is centrally placed and required to be consulted on all matters of policy and service development (NHS Plan, 2000). Such a patient-centered led service is seen as a mechanism for not only achieving improvements in communities’ health and well being generally but also in the improvement of local healthcare service provision (DOH, 2004). The benefits of such civic participation are well documented (Putnam, 1995; Kawachi et al., 1999b; Baum et al., 2003). Social capital theory as developed and articulated by Bourdieu (1986), Coleman (1990) and Putnam (1992) and others has brought attention to the role of civic participation and its relationship to community cohesiveness.

The review of literature identified differences in the ‘stock’ of social capital within different societies and communities (Krishna, 2001; Putnam, 2000) as contributing to problems in social cohesion and difficulties in social mobility among communities. Putnam’s (1995, 2000) findings concerning the dramatic decline in social capital in the United States over the past few decades led to considerable speculation about whether or not the findings could be generalised to other culturally and developmentally similar nations, notably the UK. The question of declining social capital in the UK is particularly interesting since as Hall (2002) notes, the nation has long had some of the densest networks of civic associations in the world (p. 22). Hall’s (2002) study discovered that overall levels of social capital have not declined substantially in Britain since the war (p. 29). Nor were there any significant generational effects (Hall, 2002, p. 32). The only indicator of social capital that demonstrated significant decline was the indicator of levels of social trust, defined as the general inclination of people to trust their fellow citizens (Hall, 2002, p. 32). Hall found both an overall decline in levels of social trust and striking differences in the extent of the decline in various groups, with trust declining more markedly among the working class than the middle class, and social trust declining much more dramatically among younger generations than older generations (pp. 32-33). He attributed the declining levels of social trust in the UK to various factors the most importance of which he theorised was a shift away from a collectivist identity to a society more oriented to individualism (p. 43).

Research methodology

In conducting this research, a qualitative approach known as Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) was used. This approach involves trying to understand the experiences individuals has in life, and what meanings those experiences hold (Smith, 2004). IPA is being widely used by researchers in health, clinical and social psychology, particularly in the UK, who are trying to understand individuals experience and how participants themselves make sense of their experiences. In generating the sample the researcher took a purposive sampling approach (Bryman, 2004) on the basis of wanting to interview people on the basis of their social anchorage (years of residence, familiarity with the community and social ties (Bowling, 1997). continued...
Interviewees were recruited from a council housing estate in the South of Bristol with the help of key local contacts. The interview length ranged from 20 minutes to 45 minutes with an average time taken of 23 minutes. The data generated from the interviews was interpreted and analysed using a four-step process (Malhotra & Birk, 2003), data assembly, data reduction, data display and data verification and resulted in the systematic search for themes within the data. In order to address the subjective nature of qualitative data analysis and its associated reliability and validity problems, detailed notes were maintained throughout relating to the analysis undertaken.

**Findings and discussion**

On examination of the transcripts three main findings emerged:

1. Interviewees had strong informal social networks;
2. There was strong sense of generalised reciprocity and
3. Diversity was limited within the social groupings.

This research found that although there was a distinct sense of belonging, with trustworthiness and generalised reciprocity being high within discrete social groupings, these were not carried over into the wider community setting. In fact these kind of social groupings have potential downsides. Within the transcripts, there were various comments relating to social exclusion, the restriction of individual freedoms and the establishment of patterns of behaviour which are outside of mainstream society. There were clear indicators that within such strong social networks the impact of social marketing interventions had limited impact. For example, in families were the key authority figure smoked (usually a parent) the children were more likely to smoke. However, there is a positive side in that should the key authority figure stop smoking this has a strong influence on other smokers within the social grouping. The focus here being that if you can get the main ‘players’ within a social grouping to change their behaviour they can become positive role models.

**References**


Contract No.: Document Number.


Framing messages for volunteer recruitment: Identifying motivational and socio-psychological factors

by Peter Vitartas
School of Commerce and Management
Southern Cross University
Lismore, Australia
peter.vitartas@scu.edu.au

and

Simon Rose
Jones Donald Strategy Partners
Sydney, Australia
simon.rose@yahoo.com.au

ABSTRACT
In Australia non-profit organisations receive assistance from an estimated 6.3 million volunteers annually. These volunteers perform a range of activities and tasks at no cost to the organisation. In addition 604,000 people are employed by the 700,000 non-profit organisations. For many members of the public the work of non-profit organisations and their volunteers are essential for support and services not otherwise available, and their contribution makes a significant impact on our society. One of the problems faced by non-profit organisations is the maintenance and management of volunteers. In this paper it is proposed that internal marketing to the organisation’s volunteers provides a potential retention strategy, however to undertake such a strategy it is necessary to understand the factors that attract and motivate volunteers to continue in the organisation.

A self administered questionnaire collected data from 245 volunteers of a spiritual organisation across four factors identified from the literature as well as volunteer satisfaction. The factors included the organisation’s cause, social interaction from the non-profit activity, the reputation of the non-profit organisation and procedural justice. Results from a stepwise multiple regression indicated that social interaction from the non-profit activity and procedural justice were significantly related to volunteer satisfaction. Based on the findings it is recommended that non-profit managers need to facilitate socialising and friendships among volunteers as part of their internal activities. Non-profit managers should also ensure that decision-making and procedures undertaken within the organisation be carried out in an open, fair and judicial manner. It is suggested that marketing and promotional material for volunteer recruitment emphasis aspects of procedural justice.

INTRODUCTION
The non-profit sector in Australia plays a significant role in society as well as contributing to the economy. Approximately 700,000 non-profit organisations exist in Australia of which most are classified as small organisations (National Roundtable of Nonprofit Organisations, 2006). In 1999/2000 it was reported that non-profit organisations operating in Australia employed 604,000 people who made up 6.8 per cent of total employment in the country (National Roundtable of Nonprofit Organisations, 2006). In 2004 approximately 6.3 million Australians, which is 41 per cent of adults, volunteered for a total duration of 750 million hours (National Roundtable of Nonprofit Organisations, 2006).

The extent of volunteering prevalent in Australian society has important implications. Economically, voluntary contributions are equivalent to 13.3 billion dollars donated to the non-profit sector (National Roundtable of Nonprofit Organisations, 2006). Socially, Lyons (2001) has argued that non-profit organisations make an important contribution to society through their demonstration and encouragement of collective action. As non-profit organisations encourage collective action it could be said that this helps to create a sense of community through a group of likeminded people looking to improve social capital.

With billions of dollars of labour provided by volunteers it is apparent that their effort is indeed valuable for the progression of non-profit organisations. However non-profit organisations often face challenges when attempting to further their cause due to a lack of resources. The very term ‘non-profit’ implies that it is not uncommon to have a lack of resources at hand. Volunteers are vital for carrying out the goals of the organisation especially when there is little finance to support full-time paid workers. For instance Annie O’Rourke from Media Team Australia argued the biggest challenge facing the non-profit sector was ongoing financial support because there is never going to be a big source of dollars (Kazi, 2005, pg. 58). Non-profit organisations may rely on many individual donors and government funding, and in such a case there is no single source that provides all that is necessary to operate effectively. Volunteers are essential to non-profit organisations because they compensate for a potential lack of funding and do not require financial support, yet carry out support functions.

People contributing their free time to non-profit organisations provide the foundation for carrying out the organisation’s cause. Drucker (1990) stated it is the people belonging to a non-profit organisation that directly affect its performance capacity and level of success. Furthermore Drucker (1990) commented that the non-profit manager must push the members to do more because the organisation can only do as well as...
the people it holds. This idea raises an important question for non-profit managers: what factors encourage greater displays of volunteer behaviour in non-profit organisations? Similarly Van Vugt and Hart (2004) commented that the survival and influence of non-profit groups depended on the availability of its members to invest regularly in the organisation's cause. Thus, contributions from volunteers are vital for the growth and stability of a non-profit organisation. Non-profit managers who understand what encourages volunteer contribution will have an advantage in implementing activities that bring the best out in volunteers. This can be beneficial for both parties involved, namely the non-profit organisation and the team of volunteers. The non-profit organisation can enjoy better productivity from their volunteer base which in turn advances the cause of the group. Volunteers that see their non-profit organisation accomplish its goals can only be pleased. Furthermore non-profit managers that understand their volunteers are in a situation to create activities that are enjoyable and entice volunteers to continue their participation for the non-profit organisation.

As volunteers are critical for the functioning of many non-profit organisations, maintaining a healthy relationship is critical for their continued support. Berry (1981) was one of the first to advocate treating employees as internal customers, while since then, others have provided examples of a link between the treatment of employees and their subsequent treatment of customers (Herington et al. 2006). To understand this relationship it would be valuable to understand factors affecting volunteer satisfaction with the organisation in which they work. Semik (2005) argued that in the Australian non-profit sector there is a culture and management approach that undervalues evaluation of programmes and services because it is viewed as diverting resources away from those in need. Research and development however is necessary for the non-profit sector because it provides knowledge on the effectiveness of the non-profit organisation, its activities and volunteers. This paper seeks to contribute to the understanding of volunteer behaviour in the non-profit sector and how management can communicate effectively to attract and retain volunteers.

**VOLUNTEER SATISFACTION**

The contribution of a volunteer can be measured by expressions of positive volunteer behaviour such as satisfaction. Locke (1976, pg. 1300) defined job satisfaction as a pleasurable or positive emotional state resulting from the appraisal of one's job or job experiences. Volunteering is like an unpaid job so the definition can be adapted to refer to volunteer satisfaction. Satisfaction can be viewed as an expression of how one evaluates their role and experience in actually contributing to a non-profit activity (Clary et al). (1998) reported that volunteers who received benefits matching their specific motivations were more satisfied with their involvement and had greater intentions to continue in the short and long term future.

The functional approach to understanding motivation suggests that multiple psychological functions exist that may predict behaviour (Katz, 1960). In relation to volunteering the functional view proposes that while the acts of volunteers might appear quite similar, there are different reasons that encourage one to display voluntary helping behaviour (Clary et al., 1998). Clary and Snyder (1999, pg. 156) claimed that encouraging volunteers to continue their participation requires matching the motivational concerns of individuals with situations that can satisfy those concerns. Furthermore Clary and Snyder (1999) discovered in a study of volunteers that the majority favoured multiple motivations and the minority indicated just one motivation. Although Clary and Snyder (1999) conducted research into motivations using diverse samples, the detail of who was surveyed was not specified and it is unclear which environments the findings relate to. It would appear accepting a number of specific strategies for different types of volunteers is more effective in meeting the needs of volunteers.

A review of the literature identified four potential factors affecting volunteer satisfaction. These were; the organisation's cause, social interaction from the non-profit activity, the reputation of the non-profit organisation and procedural justice. These are introduced and discussed in the following sections.

**Organisation's Cause**

The cause of a non-profit organisation is the reason for carrying out specified non-profit activities, and in this sense the reason is based upon certain values that the organisation wishes to promote. Clary and Snyder (1999, pg. 157) argued that the 'values' function serves to motivate volunteering. The 'values' function has been defined by Clary and Snyder (1999, pg. 157) as occurring when the individual volunteers in order to express or act on important values. This type of function suggests that volunteers are motivated to express personal values that they have in common with the non-profit organisation. Furthermore the cause of a non-profit organisation is usually represented by underlying values, and volunteers have the opportunity to action their belief in the purpose or cause through the non-profit organisation. Sargeant and Woodliffe (2005) found in a series of focus groups that while donors of charitable organisations expressed commitment to the cause of the organisation, they were not necessarily committed to the organisation carrying out the cause. Volunteers are perhaps more likely to be committed to the cause of the organisation as they involve themselves in the activities of the organisation.

**Social Interaction**

Another motivating factor for volunteer behaviour that has been identified in the literature is the opportunity to interact in a team or social environment during the non-profit activity (Clary et al. 1998; Chapman & Morley, 1999; Prestby et al., 1990). Prestby et al. (1990) found that the most active continued...
participants of a block association, focusing on community development and local crime prevention, received greater social benefits suggesting that socialising was considered important. Prestby et al. (1990) also cited a number of other studies (Rich, 1980; Silloway & McPherson, 1986; Yates, 1973) that have demonstrated the most active volunteers are motivated to some extent by benefits such as friendship and socialising. Clary and Snyder (1999, pg. 157) argued that volunteering allows an individual to strengthen his or her social relationships and cited instances such as door knocking appeals, performing music at church services, and attending meetings, involve people working together as volunteers as examples where social interaction occurs.

Yet there is conflicting evidence on the effect of the social function on volunteer satisfaction. A study by Chapman and Morley (1999) supported Clary and Snyder's (1999) 'values' and 'social' functions as being significant in contributing to the prediction of the 'volunteers' overall satisfaction with the non-profit activity. However the 'social' function was rated as low in terms of importance compared to the 'values' function. The finding may suggest that volunteers are satisfied from socialising but do not consciously consider it when deciding to volunteer. If so this would conflict with Clary et al's (1998) research that provided evidence of the 'social' function explaining volunteer participation. Further research is need to be conducted into the effects of the 'values' and 'social' function to confirm its role in the non-profit environment.

**Reputation of the Non-Profit Organisation**

Social identity theory provides insight as to how volunteers relate to an organisation's reputation. It is a social-psychological theory arguing that individuals seek a positive identity through like-minded groups that can be positively differentiated from other groups (Turner et al., 1987). The theory highlights the importance of a group or organisation's reputation and its influence on behaviour as the following research points out.

Turner et al. (1987) proposed that when social identity is unsatisfactory the individual will either attempt to make the existing group more distinct from other groups or leave the group altogether for a more positively distinct group. The proposition has been supported (Zdaniuk & Levine, 2001) although not in a non-profit context while Tidwell (2005) in a study of the effects of social identification on volunteer behaviour and using Mael's (1988) measure of organisational identification, found that those who identified highly with their organisation were more likely to be satisfied. The findings indicate that the reputation of the non-profit organisation is positively associated with volunteer satisfaction. Research covering identification with the reputation of the organisation might provide more tangible results that can be utilised in a practical way by non-profit managers. If the findings confirm reputation as a factor in volunteer satisfaction then non-profit managers would need to consider the reputation of the non-profit organisation.

**Procedural Justice**

Procedural justice is based on a social psychological perspective of how members within a group perceive the fairness of procedures used to reach an outcome or decision. Korsgaard et al. (1995, pg. 63) defined procedural justice as concerned with the impact of the fairness of decision-making procedures on the attitudes and behaviour of the people involved in and affected by those decisions. Two key theories were important for the development of the psychology of justice; relative deprivation and equity theory. For relative deprivation Lind and Tyler (1988) credited Merton and Rossi (1957) for their argument that individuals judge their particular situation by comparing it to the situation of others who surround them. Here the focus is on an individual, in contrast to equity theory which emphasises the perception of fairness within relationships.

Equity theory as proposed by Adams (1965) was recognised as directly contributing to procedural justice theory (Sapienza & Korsgaard, 1996). Adams (1965) argued that in human exchange relationships there is the possibility that either person could believe an exchange was inequitable. Inequity, it was argued, is judged upon the received outcomes proportional to his or her contributions to the relationship. Any perceived state of inequity would prompt a state of tension, be it anger or guilt, which motivates the person to reduce or eliminate the state of inequity. Equity theory and relative deprivation contributed to the development of procedural justice by identifying the impact of subjective judgements as a significant factor affecting peoples' behaviour (Lind & Tyler, 1988).

Following the contribution of relative deprivation and equity theory significant literature covering procedural justice was developed during the 1970s and 1980s (see for example Folger, 1977; Leventhal, 1980; Leventhal et al., 1980; Thibaut & Walker, 1975). It was during this time researchers identified that people not only had the fairness of outcomes in mind, but also the fairness of the procedures leading to the outcomes (Gilliland & Chan, 2001). Thibaut and Walker (1975) were amongst the first to talk about procedural justice and their research led to the distinction we still use today between the outcome and the process to reach the outcome. Originally Thibaut and Walker's (1975) procedural justice literature arose from the fields of law and social psychology, where they made their conclusions primarily based on studies of courtroom procedures. It was argued that the ability to express arguments during a procedure and the ability to influence the actual outcome were key requirements in order for the parties to perceive a sense of procedural justice, which in turn led to increased satisfaction (Thibaut & Walker, 1975). These findings supported the case for equality among all members of a group and simply not a select few advantaged by social or economic status.

continued...
While Thibaut and Walker (1975) explored procedural justice in a legal setting and emphasised personal control criteria, Leventhal (1980) added to an understanding of the concept through observations of groups and organisations in a more general approach considering the role of group members. Colquitt (2001) successfully validated a model of procedural justice based on the work of Thibaut and Walker (1975) and Leventhal (1980).

A perception of procedural justice has been found to have positive effects on individual behaviour. Researchers have found that it enhances attitudes towards the leader and organisation (Tyler & Caine, 1981; Tyler et al., 1985), task performance (Earley, 1984), and participation in organisational activities (Alexander & Ruder, 1987; Alexander et al., 1984; Alexander & Russ, 1985). The positive influence of procedural justice in these settings was not in a non-profit environment, and therefore the concept could prove valuable in structuring non-profit activities if results were found particularly on volunteer satisfaction. Encouraging volunteers to engage effectively in non-profit activities is a key focus for non-profit managers because they have trouble exerting influence on volunteer behaviour (Paton & Cornforth, 1991).

Based on the literature reviewed above the four constructs – organisation's cause, social interaction, reputation of the organisation and procedural justice - were hypothesized to affect volunteer satisfaction. Details of the study testing the hypotheses are outlined in the following section.

METHODOLOGY

This section provides a summary of the methodology adopted in the study. The background to the sample is discussed in terms of the non-profit organisation and types of volunteers utilised in the study. The survey instrument is designed in the form of a postal self-completion questionnaire. Measures for the questionnaire are drawn from the literature and an exploratory interview with the non-profit organisation.

Scripture Union Australia

The study investigated volunteer behaviour with the assistance of Scripture Union - a world-wide Christian non-profit organisation that began in Wales in 1867 and is now operating in over 130 countries. The non-profit organisation runs autonomously in each country, linked together by Scripture Union International. Scripture Union Australia is registered as a charitable institution with the Australian government.

In Australia each state has an independent Scripture Union movement and there are strong links between the state branches. Scripture Union is present in every capital city with approximately 10,000 volunteers per year active in beach missions, urban missions, camps as well as secondary and primary schools. These volunteers are involved in sports, recreation, education and one on one activity. In 2004 over 5,000 volunteers participated in beach missions (Scripture Union Australia, 2006).

The sample was drawn from Christian short-term mission volunteers from Queensland, New South Wales and Victorian state branches. A short-term mission involved a period of one to two weeks where the volunteers initiated creative and recreational activities as well as discussing Christianity with interested members of the public. These activities are normally carried out at local public places such as a well known park or beach.

Questionnaire Design

The data collection was carried out by the participants completing a self-administered questionnaire. The questionnaire was constructed based on items selected from the literature and adaptation for Scripture Union’s missions following interviews with the Missions Coordinator of Scripture Union Queensland. Items were drawn from work by Prestby et al. (1990) for social interaction, Clary and Snyder (1999) for organisations cause and Mael (1988) for reputation of the organisation. The measures for procedural justice were taken from Colquitt’s (2001) construction which was based on work from Thibaut and Walker (1975) and Leventhal (1990). Satisfaction was measured by seeking overall satisfaction with their last Scripture Union mission.

A pre-test was undertaken with students and academics of a university where the study was being based as well as management within Scripture Union to ensure the questionnaire was user-friendly and free of errors. A package consisting of a covering letter with details of the study, a flyer with a support message from management at Scripture Union, the questionnaire and a reply paid envelope were mailed to 1,000 randomly selected volunteers from the mission’s volunteer database. Data was analysed using SPSS.

Determination of Factors

Factor analysis was used to confirm the multi-item constructs measured in the study. Factor analysis is a type of analysis used to summarise or reduce a large set of variables based on interdependent relationships rather than dependant relationships (Malhotra et al., 2006).

The items examined in the factor analysis included procedural justice (PJ - seven items), cause of the non-profit organisation (C - two items), social interaction from the non-profit activity (SI- three items), and the reputation of the non-profit organisation (R - six items).

Prior to performing factor analysis the suitability of the data for factor analysis was assessed. The Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin value was .80, exceeding the recommended value of .6 (Kaiser, 1974) and the Barlett’s Test of Sphericity (Bartlett, 1954) reached statistical significance, supporting the factorability of the correlation matrix.
matrix. An inspection of the screeplot revealed a clear break after the fourth component so a four factor solution was requested. The four factor solution using promax rotation explained a total of 55 per cent of the variance. Interpretation of the components was in line with the scale items identified from the literature.

Reliability analysis was undertaken for each of the scales with the procedural justice, reputation of the organisation and social interaction scales having a Cronbach alpha coefficient of .80, .79 and .74 respectively, all above 0.7, indicating the scales were reliable. The cause of the non-profit organisation was measured by only two items and the mean of the inter-item correlation was used to determine its reliability, as opposed to the Cronbach alpha coefficient which is sensitive to the number of items per scale (Cho et al., 2003). Streiner and Norman (1995) suggested that an adequate item-scale correlation should be above 0.2 and from a review of other studies (Broome, 1999; Kivimaki et al., 1997) a strong correlation is not recommended as it would indicate item redundancy where the items are the same rather than uniquely reflecting a factor. The mean of the inter-item correlation was 0.45 which was within an acceptable range confirming the reliability of the scale.

Following confirmation of the factors, composite scores were calculated for each factor by averaging each respondent’s answers to the items comprising the scales consisting of multiple variables. This permitted regression analysis of the factors with volunteer satisfaction.

**RESULTS**

A total of 245 valid responses were obtained providing an effective response rate of 24.9 per cent. The sample characteristics matched the expectations provided by Scripture Union management and the gender characteristics corresponded to a national survey of Christians (NCLS Research, 2001). The volunteers were primarily older teenagers and young adults, with 66.9 per cent being aged between 18 and 25. Given the younger age of the sample there was a large share of singles (53.1 per cent) with a small, but still significant, proportion of those married (27.3 per cent). Being involved at church was considered important with 95.1 per cent attending a church service at least once a week. This was not surprising given that the mission required the expression of Christian values. The majority of the volunteers lived in a metropolitan city (63.7 per cent) followed by regional/rural centres (28.6 per cent) and other rural/remote areas (7.3 per cent).

Table 1 presents the results of the regression analysis to determine whether a linear relationship existed between the four composite factors identified in the study and volunteer satisfaction. The composite values for the procedural justice and social interaction factors were significant at the 0.05 level.

Table 1: Initial Model Estimation from Volunteer Satisfaction (a)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th></th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coefficient</td>
<td>0.118</td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>0.474</td>
<td>5.012</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedural Justice</td>
<td>0.681</td>
<td>0.065</td>
<td>0.474</td>
<td>5.012</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation</td>
<td>0.111</td>
<td>0.095</td>
<td>0.070</td>
<td>1.107</td>
<td>.245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cause</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>0.104</td>
<td>0.036</td>
<td>0.603</td>
<td>.547</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Interaction</td>
<td>0.190</td>
<td>0.086</td>
<td>0.121</td>
<td>1.979</td>
<td>.049</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) Dependent Variable: Satisfaction with Scripture Union mission
Adjusted $R^2=.28$
$F=23.379$
$N=245$

Table 2 presents the final model of a stepwise elimination where only factors that are statistically significant in the model for volunteer satisfaction are retained. An advantage of stepwise multiple regression is that the independent variables are entered based on individual consideration and the influence of two or more variables together is not recognised (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2001). Hence only those factors that make a significant contribution to the prediction of the dependent variable alone are included in the final model, and mediating factors influencing significant contributions in other variables are not considered.

The results from the stepwise multiple regression indicated that only procedural justice and social interaction are included in the model of volunteer satisfaction. The model was significant ($F(2, 229)=45.34, p<.000$) and provided an adjusted R square of .28. Each variable is significant at the .01 level providing strong evidence of the independent variables being related to volunteer satisfaction.

Table 2: Final Model Estimation for Volunteer Satisfaction (a)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th></th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>0.543</td>
<td>0.470</td>
<td>1.156</td>
<td>.249</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composite Proc. Justice</td>
<td>0.715</td>
<td>0.081</td>
<td>0.497</td>
<td>8.812</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composite Social Interaction</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>0.099</td>
<td>0.147</td>
<td>2.607</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) Dependent Variable: Satisfaction with Scripture Union mission
Adjusted $R^2=.28$
$F$-significance $= .000$
$N=245$

continued...
DISCUSSION

This study aimed to identify motivational and socio-psychological factors that influence volunteer satisfaction with a non-profit organisation in the context of short term (1-2 weeks) Christian missions. Multiple regression was used to test four independent variables; two motivational and two socio-psychological, and one variable from each area was shown not to be significant. Stepwise multiple regression was used to identify a model of volunteer satisfaction that included procedural justice and social interaction as factors affecting volunteer satisfaction. The reputation and cause of the non-profit organisation were not included in the final model. The findings indicate that the socio-psychological factor of procedural justice and the motivational factor of social interaction are factors affecting satisfaction of the volunteers in this study.

Procedural Justice

Procedural justice had a positive effect on volunteer satisfaction indicating that when volunteers perceived the decision-making procedures as fair and equitable then they were more satisfied with the mission. Specifically, practitioners may incorporate procedural justice aspects confirmed in the study such as equal opportunity, accurate information, ability to express views and feelings, no personal bias, perceived influence, ability to object to decisions as well as ethical and moral standards. The findings are in line with other researchers who have found procedural justice to increase satisfaction in courtroom proceedings (Thibaut and Walker 1975), attitudes towards the organisation (Tyler et al. 1985) task performance (Earley 1984) and participation in organisational activities (Alexander and Ruderman 1987). Volunteer behaviour can be added to the many activities that are influenced by perceptions of procedural justice. The findings also provide further validation of Colquitt's (2001) seven items measuring procedural justice.

Social Interaction

The social interaction factor consisted of three items relating to volunteers preference to meet others, build relationships and enjoy the company of other volunteers and was found to be positively related to volunteer satisfaction. The finding support research by Prestby et al. (1990) and others (Rich, 1980; Silway and McPherson 1986; Yates 1973) who found volunteers were motivated by socialising activities. The findings suggest that the 'social' function is important in the overall satisfaction of volunteers but may not be an initial motivator for volunteers joining an organisation. This would suggest that motives change over the volunteer cycle of joining, participating and exiting an organisation.

Implications for policy and practice

The findings from the study have implications for the non-profit sector. The results from the study indicate that non-profit managers would be wise to consider the effect of socialising and friendships among volunteers in their organisation. Where this is considered important, as it is in this study of young volunteers, managers should facilitate socialising as part of their recruitment and development practice. This could be undertaken by developing structures and activities that encourage contact and networks among volunteers within the organisation. If the non-profit manager is able to successfully facilitate social interaction then it is more likely the volunteer will develop closer ties with the non-profit organisation and express greater satisfaction.

In addition the non-profit manager should ensure that decision-making and procedures undertaken within the organisation be carried out in an open, fair and judicial manner. The influence of procedural justice shows volunteers are more likely to express satisfaction with the non-profit activity if they perceive practices as being fair and equitable.

Marketing material for volunteer recruitment that emphasises aspects of procedural justice such as everyone having an equal opportunity to contribute to decision making and the operation of the non-profit activity is recommended. Procedural justice themes in marketing material could help to attract volunteers to join the non-profit organisation. In addition having the values promoted to existing volunteers will help facilitate procedural justice and encourage positive volunteer behaviour.

The reputation of the non-profit organisation and cause of the organisation were not found to be associated with volunteer satisfaction in this study. The non-significant relationship could be linked to a general disconnection between the non-profit organisation and its volunteers (Rose, 2006), because it relies on one identifying with the organisation in the first place. The findings also suggest that these factors are less important to volunteers and do not need to be used for promotional activities.

Limitations and future research

The research undertaken in this study of a non-profit organisation was based on Christians who volunteered for a short term mission. The findings are limited to the context of the study which was of young people who were participating as part of their faith as opposed to volunteers who may be acting in another context. The results can be generalised to other Christian mission volunteers however the influence of Christian values and beliefs on the results of the study was not controlled for by including non-practising Christians. If other groups of volunteers do not hold the same values and beliefs then the results may not be generalisable to those groups. Future research could extend the study to other volunteer organisations and include non-practicing Christians.

continued...
A second limitation of the study was that it examined four factors (i.e. NPO cause, social interaction, NPO reputation and procedural justice) in relation to volunteer satisfaction with the non-profit activity however the results were only able to explain 28 per cent of the variance in volunteer satisfaction. Future research could investigate other influential factors such as an individual’s perceived value achieved in undertaking an activity.

A potential area of investigation that could explain some of the variance in volunteer satisfaction relates to the volunteer’s commitment to the organisation. Recently, commitment to the organisation has been reported to influence the level of perceived importance of volunteer work (Boezeman & Ellemers, 2007) which in turn could influence volunteer satisfaction. Greater commitment to an organisation would mean the volunteer would work harder to achieve success for the organisation. Achieving this success would be rewarding and lead to greater satisfaction.

**SUMMARY**

This study was concerned with identifying factors that influence volunteer satisfaction with a non-profit organisation. From the literature review the cause of the non-profit organisation, social interaction within the organisation, reputation of the non-profit organisation and procedural justice were hypothesised as potential factors affecting volunteer satisfaction. Based on a regression model and analysis using stepwise regression a final model indicated the motivational factor of social interaction and the socio-psychological factor of procedural justice were associated with satisfaction.

It was recommended that non-profit managers could consider social interaction and procedural justice in relation to the structure of the non-profit activity and the development of marketing material to encourage and recruit volunteers. Limitations of the study were based on the sample being drawn from Christian short term missions. Future research was outlined suggesting consideration for other potential factors affecting volunteer satisfaction and research into the cause of non-profit organisation. Overall the study provided practical guidance for non-profit activities, considering the satisfaction of volunteers as justification for potential change and improvement.

**REFERENCES**


continued...
Applying Contemporary Social Marketing to Science Communication and Outreach: Meeting the Challenges of a Knowledge Economy*

Dr. Christine Domegan,
Marketing Department,
School of Business and Economics,
National University of Ireland, Galway.
IRELAND
Tel: 353-91-492730
Email: christine.domegan@nuigalway.ie

Dr. Kevin Davison,
School of Education,
National University of Ireland, Galway.
IRELAND
Tel: 353-91-492693
Email: kevin.davison@nuigalway.ie

Conference Stream: Academic Competitive Paper

Extended Abstract

Science communication and outreach activities engage diverse audiences to increase public awareness of, support for, and participation in science, and to influence school subject, degree, and career choices. They allow children; teachers and parents to experience science in a fun, hands-on, exciting way, to stimulate their interest, and to participate in science as career options and research avenues. Thus, science communication and outreach initiatives capture the essence of Social Marketing – the central role of voluntary behavioural change for the betterment of the individual and society. At the micro level, primary and secondary school children, their teachers, and their parents constitute different target audiences with different social and economic needs. At the macro level, relationships between community groups and regional bodies facilitate the exchange process with national agents at the top end of the value co-creation chain shaping the context for such exchanges to occur. Therefore, by necessity, these particular social relations demand an analysis that is best facilitated by a Social Marketing approach.

Contemporary Social Marketing, in the 21st century, delineates its domain around voluntary behavioural change (Kotler and Lee, 2008; Andreasen, 2002; Hastings, MacFadyen and Anderson, 2000 and Hastings, 2007; Smith 2000 and Smith 2007). Levy and Zaltman (1975) identify three dimensions in society that are affected by the voluntary behavioural change sought in Social Marketing campaigns: micro level, group level and macro level as displayed in Table I.

Table I: Types of social change, by time and level of society

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change</th>
<th>Micro level (individual)</th>
<th>Group level (group/organisation)</th>
<th>Macro level (society)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Short term</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example:</td>
<td>Behaviour change</td>
<td>Changes in norms/Administrative change</td>
<td>Policy change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Attendance at stop-smoking clinic</td>
<td>Removal of tobacco advertising from outside a school</td>
<td>Banning of all forms of tobacco marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long term</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>Organisational change</td>
<td>‘Socio-cultural evolution’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Example:</td>
<td>Lifestyle change</td>
<td>Deter retailers from selling cigarettes to minors</td>
<td>Eradication of all tobacco-related disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Smoking cessation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The application of Social Marketing at all three of these levels results in a conceptual maturing towards the ‘market with’ and ‘relational’ approach (Hastings, 2003; Hastings and Saren, 2003; Lusch and Vargo, 2006; Gronroos, 2007; Wilkie and Moore, 2003). This ‘market with’ approach of contemporary Social Marketing embraces upstream stakeholders, partnerships, multiple exchanges and the co-creation of value at all levels including that of the whole system – a macro society level constituting those who control the social context influencing the other two units (Brenkert, 2002). Typically, it incorporates a new characteristic for Social Marketing – the direct contracting by government of services from private providers. In many cases, this contemporary form of Social Marketing represents a move away from products towards services. While Bagozzi, as far back as 1975, referred to this co-creation of value as a ‘complex marketing exchange’ where more than...
three parties are involved in a network of relationships without the simple quid pro quo notion characteristic of most economic exchange, we are only now witnessing it to its full extent in practice with the emerging wave of modern Social Marketing (MacKay 2008; Ramlow, 2008).

The purpose of this paper is to examine how Social Marketing might help promote science communication and outreach in a knowledge economy. Thus, data was collected for this research by employing two methodological approaches. In the first phase, an exploratory research design was used – an interdisciplinary and inter-institutional research team was assembled to attempt to better understand the barriers to science outreach. A research symposium on science outreach and communication was held in 2007 in the Republic of Ireland, and in Northern Ireland. The exchanges and conversations between the keynote speakers and the participants were observed and recorded by the researchers and research assistants who were participant observers at the symposium. The data from the symposium informed the purposive sampling approach to select critical stakeholders to participate in in-depth interviews. The questions of the interviews arose from the common themes that emerged from the participant observation.

The second phase of the research involved a quantitative approach. Discussions with research symposium participants, and the pretest, attempted to identify a comprehensive sample of science outreach providers ranging from government policy makers to science teachers, and from aquaria to art galleries. This was complimented by synthesising a number of existing professional categories drawn from the public sector education, communication, local authorities, and industry. The aim was to reach any person or group that had a mandate to promote science to the general public. Key outreach stakeholders and organisations attending the symposium contributed to the construction of an on-line survey arising from the existing literature on science communication and Social Marketing. After two pre-tests, invitations to participate in the on-line survey, consisting of 38 questions - both multiple choice and open ended, were sent to 165 outreach providers in both the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland. One hundred and ten surveys were returned, indicating a response rate of 67 per cent. The high response rate is reflective of the common interest in the need for such a comprehensive mapping exercise that begins to document the breadth, depth and scope of science outreach and communication activities on the island of Ireland.

The findings show Science outreach in Ireland is dominated by educational providers, with third level institutions accounting for 54 per cent of all science communication and outreach work. Industry, in particular, multinationals contribute 12 per cent of activities. The majority of science communication and outreach providers were established since 1998, with 22 per cent having no full-time staff; 36 per cent have one or two part-time staff member with 10 per cent have five volunteers. Outreach aims can be described as mainly traditional - promoting/stimulating awareness of science. 47 per cent report their aim is generalised work and 30 per cent focus upon broad sectoral issues. In their words, they are mainly education orientated and broadly defined, dealing with the general public/community to inspire future generations. Income for the vast majority of science communication providers ranges from 100k to E3.8 million. While all are dependent upon multiple income sources, the government, through Science Foundation of Ireland and DSE, Discover Science and Engineering are the key funders. This funding characteristic has direct implications for the areas of focus with Irish science communication heavily weighted in favour of four areas;

(1) Biological/physical, computing sciences;
(2) Education science;
(3) Health/BioTech science and
(4) Topical/social/environmental issues.

The implications of these profiling results confirm the Deficit model as the dominant logic behind science communication and outreach in Ireland. This is further supported by survey findings where 24 per cent reported their 1st aim was to increase the number of science students and 22 per cent reported that their main aim was to increase positive science attitudes. Thus, the focus of science communication in Ireland is on awareness and not behavioural change.

The delivery mechanism utilised by science communication providers include, in rank order, science week/festival; lectures/open days; public talks; printed media; teacher curriculum; and one day workshops. The dominant target audiences were primary five to six year olds & teachers; Secondary/TY/Teachers and General public/parents/disadvantaged. The implications are that this approach again relies on the deficit model and, while the target audience is, for the most part, schools, there is an absence of a coordinated or integrated pedagogical strategy. The focus, again, is on awareness, not behavioural change. Strikingly, there is significant absence of some key stakeholders - media, cultural groups, policy makers.

Further insight is revealed in the reported use of summative evaluation. Only 34 per cent consciously measure change in knowledge and less measure change in beliefs – only 19 per cent. Formative evaluation is undertaken more often, with 58 per cent regularly measuring awareness of programme and 53 per cent assessing audience satisfaction. Again, the traditional science communication strategy of raising awareness used from the 1960s to the 1990s is the primary approach utilised in much of the current Irish science outreach work.
Other survey findings consolidate this view. Science communication and outreach stakeholders are more concerned with the traditional Social Marketing approach of ‘sell and tell’ and less with the contemporary focus of behavioural change. 66 per cent of survey respondents state ‘influencing policy makers’ is not applicable to them. This lack of upstream engagement, central to contemporary Social Marketing, is further compounded as expressed by one respondent understanding among science communication and outreach policy makers of the issues and the approaches related to different forms of science communication remains low – this results in fragmented efforts, and in some cases programmes which are much less effective than they might be.

Staying with the upstream theme and Social Marketing’s relational approach, participants recognised that working closely with the media is important. It is understood that the media have their own interests and aims, and science and science communication cannot simply be ‘imposed’ on them. Therefore, the media must be seen as an interested partner in included in the broadening of coordination efforts. While 52 per cent of survey respondents reported a strong relationship with the media, more telling are the 48 per cent of respondents who reported no strong media relationship, or that the media was not applicable to them.

The need for upstream engagement resonates with another survey finding concerned with communication. 58 per cent of survey respondents report using dialogue, two way communication, and feedback. Yet of greater interest are the 42 per cent who say they do not use dialogue, but rather a one-way communication approach or even no communication, as captured by one respondent the main difficulty is trying to get my research colleagues involved in communicating their science to the public. This is also evident when respondents were asked about the barriers to their work. One-way communication was raised as an operational difficulty at the level of programme or intervention evaluation. ‘More specific areas of evaluation to be covered - models of good practice; measuring and communicating the efficiency of programmes’ were repeated comments from in-depth interviews, supporting the claim that the area of communication had too little attention paid to it. Progress depends on greater dialogue between practitioners and their various stakeholders from a wide number of fields. Communication between practitioners and communication with target audiences and stakeholders is vital, and a means of fostering that communication is urgently needed. Within communication, evaluation must be considered throughout the programme design and implementation periods as the ‘process’ of evaluation is frequently as important as the evaluation results themselves, provided it is cycled back into decision making.

In conclusion, the findings signal the challenges for Social Marketing regarding science communication is the engagement of upstream policymakers and stakeholders, along side the interaction of downstream audiences. For deep engagement to happen with science and technology in Ireland, North and South, it is essential to be strategic about the focus, coordination of activities, and budgetary allocation. This study shows there is a need for a stronger, more integrated policy framework that includes the diversity of science outreach in Ireland. In the words of one respondent I believe there is a need for a more systematic approach at a national level to the area of outreach and public engagement. This framework needs to go beyond the traditional deficit model traditionally associated with science communication and account for societal learning, as found in Social Marketing.

The key challenge facing Irish science communication and outreach stakeholders, practitioners and policy makers alike, is a greater integration of the myriad of stakeholders – a total market approach. Perhaps a solution can be found in a central body/authority, akin to the National Social Marketing Centre in the UK, to provide leadership and to support and coordinate a contemporary Social Marketing strategy.

References
Andreasen, A. R. Herzberg, B. Social Marketing applied to economic reforms. Social Marketing Quarterly, 2005; 11: 2: 3-17.
Andreasen, A. R. Herzberg, B. Social Marketing applied to economic reforms. Social Marketing Quarterly, 2005; 11: 2: 3-17.
Macromarketing, 2003; 23 (June): 6-15.
Young Driver Education: The Potential for Social Marketing.

Abstract

Around the world the rate of death and injury amongst young novice drivers is disproportionately higher than for other groups of licensed drivers despite major social advertising campaigns and various upstream social marketing interventions. This paper reports on a qualitative study that adopted a social marketing approach to examining the current driver education process in New South Wales, Australia, and its link to the formation of young driver attitudes towards safe driving.

The study found major deficiencies in the current driver education process, notably its lack of emphasis on developing safe driving behaviour and lack of support for supervising drivers. The study also identified the impact that the symbolism of obtaining a driver’s license has for young adults and its possible link to their attitude towards the restrictions often placed on them under graduated licensing schemes (GLS). The paper concludes by highlighting the potential for planned and integrated social marketing interventions as part of the driver education process.

Introduction

Around the world the rate of death and injury amongst young drivers (17 to 25 year olds) is disproportionately higher than for other licensed drivers, and is particularly high in the months immediately after licensure (Mayhew et al, 2003; McCartt et al, 2003). For example, in 2006 in New South Wales, Australia, 25 per cent of all drivers and motorcycle riders involved in fatal crashes were young people aged 17-25, but this group accounted for only 15 per cent of all license holders (RTA, 2007). Similarly in the neighbouring Australian state of Victoria, during the same period, 23 per cent of all fatalities involved young 17-25 year old drivers despite the fact that they accounted for only 14 per cent of all Victorian licence holders (TAC, 2007). In the United States, 15-20 year old drivers accounted for only 6.6 per cent of the nation’s licensed drivers but were involved in 14.8 per cent of all fatal crashes in 2000 (NCA, 2004). In fact 38 per cent of all deaths among 16-19 year olds in 2004 were related to motor vehicle crashes (National Centre for Injury Prevention and Control, 2004). A similar picture emerges in the UK where 17-20 year old male drivers are over six times more likely than 40-59 year-old males to be injured while driving and almost ten times more likely to be killed or seriously injured (ABI, 2005). Despite various interventions such as major social advertising campaigns, changes to legislation and traffic laws, and the introduction of graduated licensing schemes (GLS) these rates of death and injury amongst young drivers have remained constant, or in the case of the UK, have increased steadily since 2000 (ABI, 2005).

The driving skill and knowledge of newly licensed drivers has been suggested as an important factor in explaining injury and death amongst young drivers. Campaigns to increase their skill and knowledge levels have been introduced in countries such as the United States, Canada, Australia, the United Kingdom and Sweden. There is, however, a significant body of literature suggesting skills and knowledge programmes alone are not effective in lowering the current rate of road accidents amongst young drivers (e.g., Ulleberg and Rundmo, 2003; Lonero, 1999; Lonero and Clinton, 1998). In summary, this body of research demonstrates that the connection between knowledge, skills and behaviour is generally poor and that crashes and injuries result from what road users choose to do, more than what they are able (or unable) to do. Further, a driver’s choice of action at any given moment is determined by a combination of internal motivations and external influences. Hence, drivers, specifically young drivers, can and do take risks that are not related to knowledge or skills but have much more to do with situation specific motivations and thrill seeking. Subsequently, programmes that are aimed at changing underlying beliefs, values and attitudes are more likely to have a positive influence on current road accident rates involving young drivers.

A critical period in the formation of a young driver’s underlying attitude towards safe driving occurs during the driver education period leading up to the young person receiving their licence (Ivett, 2001). This paper presents the findings of an exploratory study that examined the young driver education process from a social marketing perspective. A central tenet of social marketing is its focus on understanding the ‘consumer’ (Hastings, 2007; Donovan and Henley, 2003; Kotler, Roberto and Lee, 2002). Specifically, the study adopted a social marketing approach that examined the driver education process from the perspective of the young driver and their supervising driver – the ‘consumers’ in the driver education process. This approach can be contrasted with previous studies and reviews of the driver education process such as government sponsored continued...
reviews in which the views of ‘experts’ have been valued above those of the ‘consumer’. For example, in New South Wales in 2007 the Joint Standing Committee on Road Safety initiated an inquiry into ‘Young Driver Safety and Education Programmes’. This inquiry did not receive or actively seek input from young drivers or their supervising drivers, preferring to seek submissions from such organisations as motoring groups and government departments (Staysafe, 2008). This paper reports on a study which examines the New South Wales driver education process from the perspective of the young learner driver and their supervisor, normally their parent(s), to identify their perceptions of the process and its ability to equip young drivers to be ‘safe drivers’.

The following section contains a review of the literature related to the driver education process. This study’s findings are then presented and discussed before conclusions are drawn on the potential role of social marketing in young driver education.

**The Young Novice Driver Education and Testing Process**

There were more than 249,000 learner drivers in NSW in 2007 (RTA, 2007a). In applying for a permit to learn to drive these individuals are actively committing to developing the skills and knowledge required to legally drive a car unsupervised. Learner drivers are aware that their competency in these two components of the driving process will be tested when applying for a licence. However, research shows (e.g., Deery, 1999; Ulleberg and Rundmo, 2002) that a third element in the driving process, behaviour, will also have a significant impact on how effectively they will control their vehicle on the road. Behaviour is not tested in any current driver licensing assessment. The focus remains on knowledge of the road rules and ability to manoeuvre and control a vehicle.

**Developing Driving Skill and Knowledge**

Fitts and Posner (1967) have suggested that the development of a new and complex skill, such as driving, occurs in three distinct stages that merge gradually from one to the next without a clear transition point. Stage One is the early or cognitive phase in which the learner understands the task, the sequence of manoeuvres and absorbs information from the instructor. In Stage Two, the intermediate or associative phase, the learner driver is trying their own patterns of behaviour and gradually eliminating errors. By Stage Three, the final or autonomous phase, driving becomes increasingly independent and requires less skill processing. This enables the driver to engage in dual tasks such as talking on a mobile phone or listening to music. Figure 1 illustrates the differences in these three stages.

![Figure 1: The Phases of New Skill Development](image)

During each of these three stages a young driver is absorbing information about road rules, gaining experience and gradually increasing in confidence to hone the skills that will be assessed during the driving test that is required for licensure. Deery (1999) makes an important and useful distinction between the types of skill used while driving. He claims the basic skill of vehicle handling and knowledge of traffic regulations is developed relatively quickly, perhaps after only fifteen hours of driving experience. This is a view supported in the literature by Hall and West (1996). The more complex perceptual and cognitive skills required to safely travel in a driving environment are developed at a significantly slower rate. Crash statistics would indicate that these relatively low levels of higher order perceptual and cognitive skill and experience can be lethal when combined with novice drivers’ poor risk assessment skills and attitude.

Carcary (2001) suggests the driving test will occur towards the end of Stage Two before transition into Stage Three. In his study of a group of young drivers during the three month period immediately following licensure, he noted that they were most vulnerable to accident involvement. He also reported that they had lower self-perceived skills and felt less safe while driving. In contrast, Deery (1999) states the propensity of young drivers to overestimate their skill and underestimate the level of risk explains this group’s particularly high accident rates. Katila et al (2004) support the connection between accidents and confidence particularly that which is skills based, but suggest it is overly simplistic to say increased accidents are the inevitable result of young drivers’ overconfidence. While agreeing that over-confidence contributes to increased crash rates, Senserrick and Swinbourne (2001) suggest that driver training that enhances risk awareness and safe driver attitudes and effects positive behavioural change is the key to reducing accident rates among young novice drivers.

---

continued...
Developing Driver Behaviour

Several researchers (e.g., Blander et al, 1993; Deery and Love, 1996; Deery and Fildes, 1999) have distinguished between driving skill (or performance) and driving style (or behaviour). An example of driving skill is the time taken to respond to traffic hazards that have been encountered. By contrast, driving behaviour relates more strongly to driving choices and acquired habits such as speeding, adopting risky behaviours such as drink-driving or aggressive actions such as tailgating. Driving skill is expected to improve with practice over time as young drivers have more opportunity to refine and develop their techniques, as is the case with any complex motor skill. This approach to driver education has led to the introduction of graduated licensing systems (GLS) around the world. In Australia, for example, components of GLS were introduced in the 1960’s while the common three-stage system of learner, provisional and full licence was introduced in the 1990’s. Although GLS requirements in different jurisdictions may differ in terms of restrictions, sanctions and length of time spent at specified stages, the basic tenet of the programme remains the same - to allow skill development in a more forgiving environment (Mayhew et al, 2003) and to gain driving knowledge, skills, attitudes and experience under conditions of minimal risk (Hedlund 2007).

The current learning process that is prevalent in many countries, including Australia, emphasises road rules and driving skill but does not teach or formally emphasise positive driving behaviour. This may be a significant omission in current driver training. Clarke et al’s studies (2005; 2006) found that a large percentage of accidents are due to drivers’ voluntary risk behaviour and not skill or knowledge deficiency.

Within the literature there appears to be a lack of research and understanding of how behavioural elements can be effectively integrated into driver training. This is despite calls in the literature (e.g., Mayhew and Simpson, 2002) for empirically based education and training programmes that include a driver behaviour component. Carcary et al’s (2001) study of learner and novice drivers concluded with a call for further investigation of how behavioural predispositions are formed. Carcary et al’s (2001) research reported that behavioural intentions and attitudes are formed well before a young driver comes to the task of learning to drive.

Methodology

The aim of this study was to adopt a social marketing approach to examining the young driver education process in NSW, specifically the behavioural elements of the process from the perspective of the ‘consumers’, that is, the young driver and their supervising driver. Australian parents, in an overwhelming number of cases, take on the role and responsibility of supervising driver, largely for reasons of cost and availability. Hence the supervising drivers involved in this study were, almost exclusively, parents. The study attempted to identify what behavioural aspects of driving, if any, were being taught, how they being taught, what role parents and others took in this process and how the young driver and their supervising driver viewed and understood the driver education process. As this was an exploratory study, a qualitative research approach was adopted in order to attempt to address these questions (Bryman, 2004).

Data was collected through a variety of formats over a twelve month period from a wide cross-section of young drivers (17 to 25 years) and their supervising drivers. In the early stages of data collection, nine focus groups were conducted, including three with young people currently undergoing or recently completing driver training and three with their relevant supervising driver. Focus groups were conducted with these two groups separately to allow each individual to express their thoughts and feelings without concern that their corresponding young driver or supervisor would be present in the same focus group. Participants were recruited into these groups through the placement of newspaper advertisements calling for volunteers to take part in this study. This method resulted in a cross-section of young drivers and supervisors being recruited at various stages of the driver education process. In addition to this data collection method, data was also gathered from a separate group of participants using an electronic ‘diary’ approach (Breakwell, 2006).

Fourteen young novice drivers and their corresponding supervisor were each asked to write a monthly ‘diary’ which reflected on each on-road driver training episode and detailed what aspects of the driver education process were discussed or ‘taught’. Participants were also asked to record details of any additional off-road driver education discussions that may occur. These diaries were kept for a six month period to allow the researchers to analyse in detail the stages and discourse involved in the driver education process over time.

Focus group transcripts and participant diaries were subjected to a thematic content analysis (Patton, 1990) using the constant comparative method of data analysis (Glaser and Strauss, 1967). This method of data analysis involves the inductive coding of data with the simultaneous comparison of all events, occurrences and social interactions identified from within the data for similarities, differences and general patterns. In its most elementary form inductive coding requires fracturing the data into coded units then systematically grouping these data units into categories that show similarities and relationships. For the purpose of this paper the notion of conceptual ordering (Strauss and Corbin, 1998, p. 19) has been adopted. Conceptual ordering refers to the organisation of data into discrete categories according to their properties and/or dimensions, and then using description to explicate those categories. The following section discusses the major categories or themes that emerged from the data analysis.

continued...
Findings and Discussion

From an analysis of the data three major themes emerge relevant to understanding if and how the behavioural aspects of driving are currently incorporated into the driver education process. The first of these relates to when a young person begins forming their attitude to ‘safe’ driving. The second emergent theme relates to pervading attitudes towards the aim of the driver education process and the act of driving in general. The third emergent theme discussed in this paper involves post-licensure support of young novice drivers. However, before discussing each of these three themes in detail it is relevant to note the lack of understanding that emerged throughout the focus group and diary records regarding the issue of developing a safe attitude towards driving, that is, recognising and minimising risky behaviours. All participants at some point during the data collection were asked to comment and/or name the main risk behaviours associated with the high accident rate amongst young drivers. These factors are well publicised in the mass media and in NSW are the basis of the restrictions placed on novice drivers under the GLS, namely: speeding, driving under the influence of alcohol or other drugs, driving at night, number of passengers in the vehicle, use of mobile phones and so on. In a majority of cases, participants could identify the dangers associated with speeding and driving under the influence of alcohol but did not readily identify other behavioural factors particular to young drivers. Typical of the level of knowledge regarding behavioural factors was the following comment from a parent: ‘the big risk factors of speed and drink driving have been hammered for a long time so I’m not sure what more [could be done]’. More alarmingly, some young drivers indicated that driving under the influence of recreational drugs such as marijuana was perceived as ‘safer’ than driving under the influence of alcohol. As one young learner driver commented, People drive under the influence of cannabis and they don’t perceive it as a risk...because they think they can get away with it. This finding alone suggests that the current driver education process, in NSW at least, is not explicitly or implicitly highlighting the role behaviour plays in the death and injury rate amongst newly licensed young drivers.

When do you start learning a ‘safe driving attitude’?

Caracary et al (2001) are amongst a group of researchers that highlight the fact that young drivers are exposed to many years of generally poor driving behaviour through observing their parents, primarily, but also siblings and others well before they start any formal driver education process. Supervising drivers do not appear to recognise the influence of this factor in developing a young driver’s attitude. When this issue was raised in the focus group sessions, typical of many responses was the comment: The only reason that we get away with the bad things that we do is that our years of experience compensate for some silly things that we did whereas they might be doing it without the experience and that’s why they get into trouble. From this and other similar responses it would appear supervising drivers (see below) are not conscious of the role observation plays in the driver education process. In the minds of study participants, driver education starts once the young driver applies for an official learner driver permit and takes the wheel of a motor vehicle. Similarly, supervising drivers fail to recognise that the learner driver is observing and noting their actions at the completion of the ‘formal lesson’ and when they resume the wheel. Young learner drivers commented that the teaching style parents largely adopt was one of ‘do as I say not as I do’. Learner drivers were conscious of this discrepancy yet many supervising drivers were not. In some cases this discrepancy led to tension between the learner driver and their supervising driver.

Related to the issue of when a young driver learns a safe driving attitude is the question of confidence amongst parents to take on the role of supervising driver in the driver education process. Some supervising drivers questioned their ability as an instructor, indicating that they lacked confidence in their own skills in setting an example when behind the wheel, communicating effectively, and teaching the required skills. This finding draws into question the support available to parents who due to necessity are the only option many young adults have when seeking out a supervising driver. Supervising drivers and parents play such a significant role in the driver education process and there appears a need to develop more effective support mechanisms to enable them to fulfil this role.

What is the underlying goal of the driver education process?

The findings from this study indicate that for both learner and supervising drivers the driver education process has a single goal, that is, to prepare the learner driver to pass the required license examination as quickly and effectively as possible. As one learner driver expressed it: A lot of people learn how to pass the test not so much how to drive...and when you are 17 you just want to get your P’s. Critical aspects of driving behaviour including novice drivers’ attitude to risky behaviours do not appear to be taught nor discussed to any significant level during the driver education process. This would appear to be a major shortcoming of the current driver education programme in NSW.

The data collected in this study suggests that for young adults the act of gaining a driver’s licence is of great symbolic significance. By contrast many supervising drivers and parents are not conscious of the impact of this symbolism on the driver education process, young drivers’ general attitude, and their behaviour on the road. Frequently during this study, young learner drivers would make comments suggesting that obtaining a driver’s license was a ‘coming of age’ event as it provided them with ‘freedom’ and the ability to engage in a new lifestyle in which the very act of driving a car becomes a social event involving their peers. For example, one learner driver commented: It’s a cool kind of experience for a young person in a car...and my parents probably think it’s a waste of petrol to drive around for no reason, but my friends are like ‘what are we going
to do, let’s go for a drive. Conversely, when supervising drivers were asked to describe what driving meant to them, it was clearly little more than a means of transport which was described variously as a necessity, a practicality of life or a commodity. This dissonance between what driving means for these two groups may go some way in explaining differences in driving attitudes between young drivers and other road users as well as the influence of peers, when compared to parents, in changing attitudes towards risky driving behaviours.

What happens now? Post-licensure support.

The majority of learner drivers and supervising drivers appear to see the driver education process ending at the point of license. All efforts are focussed on this one event and driving education post-licensure is not a major consideration. When asked to discuss what actions supervising drivers and parents may take post-licensure to increase the driving skills and behaviour of young novice drivers a typical parental response was: when you find they did something wrong what tactics will you use to tell an 18 or 20 year old what to do? I agree more with the trust approach and show concern every morning and drop hints where you can. As this statement indicates, parents appear to show deep concern for their child’s safety on the road post-licensure but as discussed later in this paper this is often expressed in the form of negative ‘don’t’ statements rather than any in-depth discussion of driving risks and behaviour.

The only legislative action to further develop young driver skills post-licensure appears to be the GLS and the restrictions placed on the novice driver such as passenger numbers and speed limitations. These restrictions are generally described in a non-supportive fashion by most young learner drivers in this study as the following comment suggests: I feel three years on Provisional License plates is detrimental to the maturity of young drivers because I think they feel that are not given full responsibility...the community is saying that at 21 you are old enough to go to war and get killed but not old enough to take full responsibility of driving a car without restrictions. This attitude along with the conflict between the excitement of being a solo driver and the newly licensed driver’s lack of experience and skills may indicate why many of the restrictions in the GLS are ignored, intentionally or unintentionally, by young novice drivers. Young drivers involved in focus groups described their driving as ‘shocking’, scary and unsafe, frequently admitting their skills, and those of their peers, at the point of licensure were poor: ...me and my friends weren’t competent drivers on Ps. Not confident in traffic, roundabouts, missing stop signs, anticipating cars pulling out in front of you...I could have been a better driver on my P’s. Yet this lack of competence is part of an often dangerous cocktail. Included in this mixture is fear at the prospect of solo driving: I think [it’s] kind of scary because there is no one there to say you are going too fast or you are in the middle of the road doing the wrong thing. You are kind of by yourself, so there is no one there who can help you out if you need it. These factors are also combined with the elation which has come from newly acquired independence, and a defiance to take control: If you are on your P’s [parents] can harp on as much a they like but you are still the person in the car and the only person driving.

The findings from this study indicate that parents may have a role to play in post-licensure support. However, it appears that the nature of that support needs to be examined further. As reported earlier in this paper, when it comes to post-licensure activity most parents restrict their role to reminding their children of the dangers of driving with repeated negative statements such as don’t speed, don’t drink and drive. Young drivers in this study clearly indicated that they turn off at the first indication of such statements, as one young learner driver stated: You can say it but I’m not going to listen. Once you have your licence you have this cockiness – I’ll go and learn things for myself. You’re not going to listen [to your parents] any more because they’re not sitting next to you any more. Parents seem to want to communicate with their children on driving behaviour and risk taking yet feel frustrated at their comments not being heeded by their children as the following comment from one parent suggests: My child thinks he is an expert. When we had the downpour of rain I said the road is wet and he said ‘I know that, I’ve passed my test’ and my 25 years of driving experience didn’t matter for [anything]. Parents recognise the ineffectiveness of the negative reminders they often give their children and are seeking support and guidance to achieve their goal of keeping their children safe post-licensure.

Conclusion

The rate of death and injury amongst young 17-25 year drivers remains at high levels around the world. These levels continue despite major social advertising campaigns and what could be described as ‘upstream social marketing’ initiatives such as placing speed and other restrictions on newly licensed young novice drivers. This study attempted to take a social marketing approach to understanding the issue of young driver education and behaviour. To achieve this, the study adopted a ‘consumer perspective’, in this case the perceptions of the young learner driver and their supervising drivers, normally their parents. The study took the driver education process as an intervention point and explored the issue of attitude formation towards risk taking and driving behaviour in general during this process.

The findings from this study suggest that the driver education process in NSW, which is similar to others around the world, is deficient in a number of critical areas. First, the learning process and examination focuses on only two elements of driving, namely knowledge of road rules and skill in handling a vehicle. It neither teaches nor assesses elements of driving related to driving behaviour despite the role that behaviour has been shown to have in many accidents involving young drivers. Upstream social marketing initiatives that address this issue by refining licence examination together with social marketing campaigns to change continued...
the attitudes of young learner drivers, their supervising drivers, parents and other road users towards the importance of observation in the driver education process seem justified. Second, many parents do not feel adequately equipped to fulfil the required role of supervising driver, nor do they understand the symbolic meaning and implications that surround a young person gaining their driver’s licence. Social marketing with its emphasis on meeting the ‘needs’ of the supervising driver may lead to improvements in the driving behaviour of young novice drivers. Third, any social marketing or other intervention programme needs to consider the role of parents and significant others post-licensure. Most parents in this study appear to be seeking support in determining how they can play an active role post-licensure in communicating the dangers associated with risky driving behaviours. In addition, any social marketing intervention aimed at developing safe driving behaviour needs to be placed in the context of an environment where freedom, independence and confidence are strong motivating forces in what is to many novice drivers a ‘social milestone’ and not merely a practicality of life as one parent suggested.

This study has a number of limitations. The study took place in a regional area of Australia with participants who volunteered to take part. Thus the results may not be reflective of the much wider population. To address this issue a larger quantitative study based on the findings presented here would be beneficial. However, despite these limitations, the consistency in the pattern of participant responses over the course of this study and through different data collection methods suggests there are significant issues with the current driver education process in NSW. Social marketing, both downstream and upstream, with its emphasis on changing behaviour appears to be well placed to address many of these issues. To date, social advertising campaigns together with restrictive measures on novice drivers do not appear to be having any substantial impact on the behaviour of young novice drivers. This study suggests areas and ways in which planned, integrated social marketing campaigns may be effective in saving the lives of young adults around the world.

List of References


Clarke D. Ward P. Bartle C. Truman W. Young driver accidents in the UK – the influence of age, experience, and time of day. Accident Analysis and Prevention 2006; 38: 871-878


Hall J. and West R. The role of formal instruction and informal practice in learning to drive, Ergonomics 1996; 39: 693-706

Hall J. and West R. The role of formal instruction and informal practice in learning to drive, Ergonomics 1996; 39: 693-706


continued...
Investigating the Concept of Social Marketing
Sponsorships: Key Concepts, Stakeholders, Terminology, and Objectives

Judith Madill* and Norm O’Reilly**

*Judith Madill, PhD – Contact Author
Professor, and Holder of the Desmarais Professorship in Marketing
Telfer School of Management
University of Ottawa
55 Laurier Avenue East
Ottawa, Ontario, Canada
K1N 6N5
Phone: 613-562-5800 x4740
Email: madill@telfer.uottawa.ca

**Norm O’Reilly, PhD
Director & Associate Professor
School of Sports Administration
Faculty of Management
Laurentian University
Ramsey Lake Road
Sudbury, Ontario, Canada
P3E 2C6
Phone: 705-675-1151 x1011
Fax: 705-675-4836
Email: noreilly@laurentian.ca

Introduction and Background
A sponsorship occurs when a company or another type of investor creates a link with an outside organisation, person or event, hoping to influence the audience by the connection. Characteristically, the ‘sponsor’ provides cash and/or in-kind products/services to a ‘sponsee’ in return for opportunities to create links with an event, cause, or organisation in the eyes of consumers and potential consumers. A sponsee can be an organisation, team, program, or event that requires resources in order to accomplish its objectives. This link in the minds of consumers between a sponsor and sponsee results in image transfer whereby the sponsor and sponsee are associated with each other and benefit from that association. A growing number of sponsees are in the not-for-profit or governmental sectors and include organisations that are trying to develop and implement public awareness, educational or social marketing programs.

In spite of the increasing academic and professional attention to social marketing sponsorships (e.g., Georgetown Social Marketing Listserv, 2008) it is widely recognised as a significantly under-researched area. Sponsorship theory is in the very early stages of development; key concepts have been defined, however, very little has been formulated into a theory of how sponsorships are formulated, evaluated, and either maintained or dissolved. Further, the majority of the literature has focused upon sponsorships in the sports sector; i.e. the sponsee is a sports property, event or athlete. Given the importance of sponsorships in the field of social...
marketing, it is critical to begin to understand the concepts of sponsee, sponsor, as well as the development and formation of sponsorships in the social marketing sphere.

The research reported in this paper takes a grounded theory approach - undertaking a case study of a medium size social marketing sponsorship in order to begin to formulate understanding of concepts (partner/sponsor) as well as how such sponsorships are formed and what objectives are brought into the sponsorship. Specifically, the objectives of this paper are:

1. To review the sponsorship literature - specifically focusing on what is meant by sponsorship when it is used in social marketing;
2. To report the results of empirical case research on the evaluation of a sponsorship developed to support a social marketing program in order to increase our understanding of sponsorship in the social marketing sphere;
3. To develop understanding concerning how social marketing sponsorships compare to commercial sponsorships in terms of (a) the identification of key stakeholders and their roles; (b) the objectives of the stakeholders involved; and (c) an assessment of how sponsorships are formed, developed, and implemented.

**Methodology**
The specific focus of the case research is to add to our understanding of (a) the stakeholders involved in the sponsorship, the language used to describe them and their roles; (b) the objectives of the stakeholders; and (c) how the sponsorship developed, was formulated and implemented. The case study chosen was the Canadian Mental Health Association Calgary Region (CMHA-CR) who undertook a social marketing campaign in the Province of Alberta Canada directed at (a) reducing the stigma of mental health issues; and (b) encouraging Albertans to seek help for mental health problems. As Canada’s fourth most populated province and its fastest growing and most vibrant economy, Alberta has enjoyed considerable migration into the province. Workplace, family and financial stresses with their accompanying mental health challenges have accompanied the vibrant economic growth in the province. A provincial component of its national body, the CMHA-CR is a well established (25 years old) organisation that offers core programmes and specialised support for individuals affected by mental illness. The campaign of interest ran from March 2007 to March 2008, with a total budget exceeding the CDN$500,000. The research team (a) conducted 12 in depth personal interviews lasting approximately 20 to 45 minutes each with key representatives of all the sponsorship stakeholders; and (b) reviewed all contracts and written materials around the sponsorship and campaign. The interviews were taped, transcribed and analysed to provide data for the current paper.

**Research Results**
The Origination, Development, and Implementation of the Sponsorship

The sponsee (CMHA-CR) was the originator of the sponsorship. The idea for the social marketing campaign and methods of raising funds in order to implement it was developed in a sub committee of the Board of Directors (Interview with Executive Director of CMHA-CR, March 1, 2007). The Executive Director and the Communications Manager of CMHA-CR then approached the first large Canadian company (TransCanada Corp.) with a request for $500,000 funding for the program. This first company could not provide sponsorship funding in the amount of $500,000 so they suggested approaching the second large private sector company – a large Canadian financial institution. In the end, TransCanada provided $250 thousand and the CFI gave $100 thousand to fund the social marketing program. Because CMHA-CR still did not have the targeted $500,000 in order to implement the planned social marketing program, they sought additional funding by applying for and receiving a combination of grants as well as sponsorship/partnership funding from a number of other private as well as public sector organisations. In summary, the stakeholders included the two largest private sector sponsors/partners; TransCanada Corp and the large Canadian CFI, as well as several other private sector companies who self-identified as sponsors and provided ‘in-kind’ services to support the campaign. These sponsors included; MacLaren McCann – an agency that provided the creative work at a reduced rate, Canadian Television Network (CTV) who put together a television media package at reduced rates and Pattison Outdoor who provided an outdoor billboard buy also at reduced rates. Nine public sector sponsors/partners were also involved; the Calgary Health Region, the Edmonton based, Capital Health Region as well as the other seven regional Alberta branches of the CMHA. Finally, a grantor was also part of the funding, the Alberta Gaming Corporation.

A major portion of the interviews conducted with each of the stakeholders involved asking about the objectives each had for becoming involved in the project. Twenty-one objectives were uncovered and summarised and organised into four major types:

- Eight objectives specific to the social marketing campaign;
- Four related directly to positioning CMHA-CR as a leader and building CMHA-CR relationships;
- Two related to associating with CMHA-CR and the campaign and
- Six varying objectives ranging from building capacity around social marketing to building awareness of other partner/sponsor organisations and demonstrating that the organisation supports the community.

continued...
Discussion and Conclusions

The research demonstrated that the sponsee was the originator for this sponsorship - very similar to commercial sponsorships where it has been shown that in most cases the sponsee’s search for resources is what drives the origination of the sponsorship. The first potential sponsor was selected because a previous relationship with the CMHA-CR had been established through both the Board of Directors and the organisation itself. This is suggestive of the importance of links and networks in the approach to potential sponsors. On the commercial side, especially among larger organisations and larger sized sponsorships, intermediaries known as agents often broker the relationships between sponsors and sponsees. While no evidence was found for this role in this case, perhaps it is appropriate to view the Board of Directors as assuming some of this brokering role in social marketing sponsorships.

The first sponsor recommended a second commercial partner – supporting the literature which suggests that social marketing sponsors/partners bring their networks, contacts, and credibility to the sponsorship/partnership which they make available to the sponsee or not for profit partner. Results suggest that public sector organisations with missions closely aligned to that of the sponsee organisation have definite preference for the term partner, as opposed to sponsor. The research also suggests that private sector companies may self-identify in a number of different roles including sponsor, partner and/or donor. Under some circumstances they may be seeking to achieve sponsorship objectives – image transfer, awareness, etc., while in others they may see themselves as lending their image to the cause, but not as sponsors seeking sponsorship objectives.

One of the major differences in objectives observed in this social marketing sponsorship case is that the sponsors also mention (independently) many of the social marketing objectives as being ones they have for being involved in the sponsorship. In commercial sponsorships, sponsor objectives rarely coincide with sponsee commercial objectives.

Overall, the research shows that sponsorships supporting social marketing programs may be different in a number of key ways:

- The number, type and role of stakeholders – this case showed the involvement of combination of governmental and commercial sponsors as well as philanthropists who may be contributing funds (not out of sponsorship funding) and seek a combination of marketing and social objectives;
- The objectives of social marketing sponsorships share both similarities and differences from those reported in the literature for both sponsors and sponsees for commercial sponsorships;
- The development of the sponsorship typically may not involve commercial intermediaries/agents – but be driven by the sponsee who approaches potential sponsors and utilises networks formed previously and by Boards of Directors.

Guidelines for the development of social marketing programmes for adolescent and young adults’ sun protection

Keryn Johnson MPH
Sandra Jones PhD
Don Iverson PhD

Introduction

Within health promotion circles, social marketing is often equated only with mass communication approaches (Lefebvre 2001). This, and the perceived emphasis on individual behaviour change, has led to an ideological divide between social marketing and its marketing background, and health promotion and its holistic health background. Also, while one of social marketing’s strengths is its reliance on research and evaluation to develop and refine individual campaigns, there is often a neglect of what has gone before in terms of other health promotion approaches. There is thus a need to integrate the advantages of a social marketing approach more wholly within its public health context, and at the same time utilise the accumulated knowledge base that has developed over years of public health initiatives.

This study used the Delphi consensus process and grading system, as outlined by Roddy et al. (2005), to formulate ‘best practice’ guidelines for the social marketing of sun protection programmes for adolescents and young adults, incorporating the expertise and experience of experts in social marketing and sun protection.

Method

Eleven experts identified from the fields of social marketing and sun protection were asked to provide up to 10 key points, based on their knowledge and practical opinion, which they felt were most important in developing social marketing interventions for the primary prevention of skin cancer among adolescents and continued...
young adults. After five consensus rounds participants were then asked to indicate how strongly they rated the finalised 15 recommendations on a visual analogue scale (VAS) based on all aspects relating to their knowledge and practical opinion, as well as the research evidence. The mean VAS and standard deviation was calculated for each recommendation, and presented via a table with groupings according to a traditional strength of recommendation (SOR) (Scottish Intercollegiate Guideline Network 2001), mean VAS, and 95 per cent confidence interval.

**Results**

Table 1 shows the finalised recommendations with Strength of Recommendation and Visual Analogue Scores.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Category of evidence (1-4)</th>
<th>Strength of recommendation</th>
<th>Strength of recommendation (VAS) – Mean (CI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 1: Sun protection programmes for this demographic should take a holistic approach – with long term commitment. This necessitates multi component, multi-setting approaches inclusive of the wider community.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>7.84 (6.40-9.28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 2: Sun protection programmes should be implemented at various stages throughout adolescence, especially at developmental transitions such as the move from primary (middle) school to high school, or the move from high school to university, as these are times of decreasing parental influence and changing peer and media influences, which can result in increased risk behaviour.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>7.22 (5.94-8.52)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 3: Relationships with stakeholders and potential allies need to be developed to potentiate message dissemination – this can include parents, teachers, sports coaches, media/celebrity figures etc. Think imaginatively in terms of potential partnerships – possible relationships could come from the cosmetics/sunscreen or fashion industries; however care needs to be taken not to compromise message and strategy direction.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>7.36 (6.44-8.29)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 4: Programmes should pursue policy change and regulation where possible. This includes public policy eg. No sales tax on sun protective clothing or solarium regulation; and organisational policy eg. The scheduling of school sport during low UV periods</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>7.84 (6.93-8.76)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 5: Formative research is essential early in programme development in order to gain a deeper understanding of the self-interests of the target market, and the motivators and barriers to sun protective behaviour. This allows strategies and messages to be developed from the target audience’s perspective; similarly pre-testing of resource material is also critical to confirm its acceptability to the target audience.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>9.16 (8.34-9.99)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 6: Segmentation of the target market is necessary in order to tailor messages and strategies. Age segmentation is essential, but programme developers should also consider segmentation based on gender, attitudes and behaviour, perceived benefits and barriers, and/or risk.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>8.09 (7.47-8.71)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 7: Sun protection programmes for this demographic need to have a deep understanding of the competition to sun protective behaviours that comes from the social norms and attitudes surrounding tanned skin, and consider strategies and messages to counter this competition.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>8.72 (8.19-9.26)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

continued...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guideline</th>
<th>Expert opinion</th>
<th>Evidence</th>
<th>Score (95% CI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8. To achieve behavioural change the ‘new behaviour’ being marketed needs to be EASY, FUN and/or FASHIONABLE e.g. easy application of sun cream, hats considered fashionable. This necessitates focused, ongoing attention to the products (sunscreen, hats, and clothing) necessary for sun protection.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>6.96 (6.02-7.91)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Programmes should emphasise more direct outcomes such as skin damage (wrinkles, aging) and sunburn, rather than the indirect outcomes of skin cancer for this demographic; however reference should still be made to skin cancer outcomes as fear is still a strong motivator for behaviour change.</td>
<td>A systematic review including Mahler et al. 1997; Novick 1997; Weinstock et al. 2002; Mahler et al. 2005; Olsen et al. 2006; Mahler et al. 2007; Jackson 1997; Buller et al. 2006.</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>8.44 (7.62-9.25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Sun protection programmes for this target group need to promote their perceived self-efficacy for sun protection, by showing how sun protection can fit into current lifestyle and fashion choices, and offering specific strategies to incorporate sun protection into their daily lives.</td>
<td>Extrapolated evidence from 2 studies Jackson and Aitken (2006); Reynolds et al. (2006)</td>
<td>C/D</td>
<td>8.75 (8.23-9.28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The changing of social norms regarding the desirability of a tanned appearance is essential for achieving whole-of-life sun protection behaviour. Such messages/strategies need to be directed both within and outside the adolescent/young adult target groups. Within the target group possible strategies include the targeting of group norms, where changing the behaviour of a few individuals ultimately might influence the behaviour of many. Groups might be defined based on sports teams, clubs, or simply groups of friends.</td>
<td>Extrapolated evidence from one study Jackson and Aitken (2006); expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>8.03 (7.11-8.94)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Sun protection programmes to this target group need to look at environmental strategies such as the provision of shade and provision of sunscreen at settings that pose a risk to this group. However, these must be provided in a manner that optimises their usage – that is, the provision of shade will not optimise sun protection without attention to the social amenity within shaded space.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>7.71 (6.83-8.59)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. As a large proportion of sunburn occurs because people ‘forget’ to apply or re-apply sunscreen – or to take a hat or umbrella – or forget how long they have been in the sun, much of the communication strategy should be ‘reminder’ communication utilising avenues such as Friday pm radio and weekend media.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>6.34 (5.25-7.42)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Utilise a broad range of communication channels incorporating paid and unpaid components, in order to strengthen message dissemination. While television is still the most powerful motivator, people in this demographic are also frequent users of ‘new media’.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>8.25 (7.05-9.44)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Programmes should target their audience at various settings that pose a sun exposure risk for this demographic. As much sunburn is incidental this should include non-beach/pool situations.</td>
<td>Expert opinion</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>7.68 (6.62-8.74)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

continued...
Discussion and Conclusion

These guidelines represent a framework for social marketers targeting the sun protection behaviours of adolescents and young adults, and should be utilised as such. As for all social marketing, specific strategies and messages are then developed based on formative research and rigorous pre-testing of materials, in order to tailor interventions to specific contexts and audiences. The guidelines are, for the most part, broadly focused, with many guidelines applicable to other sun protection target audiences – such as the importance of formative research, segmentation, pursuit of policy change and regulation, and the building of relationships with stakeholders and potential allies. Others are more specific to the adolescent and young adult demographic – such as the importance of appearance-based messages, the targeting of transition periods, and the consideration of ‘new media’. Utilised as a whole, they incorporate the major elements of social marketing theory within the established knowledge base of sun protection experience.

References


